CLAIMING THE RIGHT TO THE CITY: A FEMINIST PERSPECTIVE ON EXPERIENCES OF URBAN SPACES FOR TRANSGENDER SEX WORKERS

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
OF
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY

RUMEYSA ORHAN

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE
IN
THE DEPARTMENT OF GENDER AND WOMEN'S STUDIES

DECEMBER 2024

Approval of the thesis:

CLAIMING THE RIGHT TO THE CITY: A FEMINIST PERSPECTIVE ON EXPERIENCES OF URBAN SPACES FOR TRANSGENDER SEX WORKERS

submitted by **RUMEYSA ORHAN** in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of **Master of Science in Gender and Women's Studies, the Graduate School of Social Sciences of Middle East Technical University** by,

Prof. Dr. Sadettin KİRAZCI
Dean
Graduate School of Social Sciences

Prof. Dr. Fatma Umut BEŞPINAR
Head of Department
Department of Sociology

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Fulden İBRAHİMHAKKIOĞLU
Supervisor
Department of Philosophy

Examining Committee Members:

Prof. Dr. Fatma Umut BEŞPINAR (Head of the Examining Committee)
Middle East Technical University
Department of Sociology

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Fulden İBRAHİMHAKKIOĞLU (Supervisor)
Middle East Technical University
Department of Philosophy

Prof. Dr. Özlem DUVA KAYA
Dokuz Eylül University
Department of Philosophy

I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last Name: Rumeysa ORHAN
Signature:

ABSTRACT

CLAIMING THE RIGHT TO THE CITY: A FEMINIST PERSPECTIVE ON EXPERIENCES OF URBAN SPACES FOR TRANSGENDER SEX WORKERS

ORHAN, Rumeysa
M.S. The Department of Gender and Women's Studies
Supervisor: Assoc. Prof. Dr. Fulden İBRAHİMHAKKIOĞLU

December 2024,149 pages

The concept and slogan "right to the city," as formulated by Lefebvre, advocates for a cohesive and empowering movement that aims to attain equitable allocation of resources and democratic rights within urban areas. Lefebvre elucidates the concept of the right to the city by emphasizing the entitlement to enter, engage in, and possess urban areas. Examining the notion of the right to the city through a feminist perspective, I concede and bolster feminist criticisms by contending that the prevailing patriarchal framework has not been sufficiently challenged. My research adopts a more inclusive approach by considering gendered practices of the right to the city in everyday life. In this context, tactics developed in all areas such as daily life, social environment and work life are analyzed. Employing a feminist approach, I conducted thorough interviews with 12 transgender women engaged in sex work and accompanied 7 individuals using the method of walking. Two primary themes were used to organize and discuss the data gathered from the interviews using thematic analysis. In my thesis, I examine the reflections of transgender sex workers' resistance

in asserting their right to the city and the strategies formulated in spatial practice. I contend that spatial practices resistant to change contribute to the redefinition and appropriation of spaces. The strategies evident in all facets of transgender sex workers' lives, from their daily routines to their social interactions, are reflected in the intimate relationships they cultivate within their communities, the acceptance they receive from their neighborhoods, the security measures they adopt by engaging with clients via online platforms in their professional lives, and the sense of belonging they experience in their environments through their movements within those spaces. In this context, my thesis underscores that these encounters and tactics evolve into struggles concerning the right to the city and can facilitate empowerment through the assertion of a claim.

Keywords: transgender sex workers, access to rights, urban space, the right to the city

ÖZ

KENT HAKKINI TALEP ETMEK: TRANSGENDER SEKS İŞÇİLERİNİN KENTSEL MEKAN DENEYİMLERİNE FEMİNİST BİR YAKLAŞIM

ORHAN, Rumeysa
Yüksek Lisans, Toplumsal Cinsiyet ve Kadın Çalışmaları Bölümü
Tez Yöneticisi: Doç. Dr. Fulden İBRAHİMHAKKIOĞLU

Aralık 2024, 149 sayfa

Lefebvre tarafından formüle edilen kent hakkı kavramı ve sloganı, kentsel alanlarda kaynakların ve demokratik hakların adil dağılımını sağlamayı amaçlayan güçlenmeye katkı sunan bir hareketi savunmaktadır. Lefebvre, kent hakkı kavramını kentsel alanlara girme ve kentsel alana sahip olma hakkını vurgulayarak açıklamaktadır. Araştırmam, kent hakkının gündelik yaşamda cinsiyetlendirilmiş pratikleri dikkate alarak daha kapsayıcı bir yaklaşım benimsemektedir. Bu bağlamda, gündelik yaşam, sosyal çevre, iş hayatı gibi her alanda geliştirilen taktikler irdelenmiştir. Feminist bir yaklaşım kullanarak, seks işçiliği yapan 12 trans kadınla kapsamlı görüşmeler gerçekleştirdim ve 7 kişiye yürüme yöntemiyle eşlik ettim. Görüşmelerden elde edilen verileri tematik analiz kullanarak düzenlemek ve tartışmak için iki ana tema belirledim. Tezimde trans seks işçilerinin kent hakkı iddiasındaki direnişlerinin ve geliştirilen taktiklerin mekansal pratikteki yansımalarını araştırıyorum. Direnişe söz konu olan mekansal pratiklerin mekanların yeniden tanımlanmasına ve sahiplenmesine yardımcı olduğunu savunuyorum. Trans kadın seks işçilerinin gündelik yaşamından sosyal çevrelerine hayatlarının her alanında görünen taktikler

sosyal çevrelerinde kurdukları samimi ilişkiler ve mahalleli tarafından kabul görme, iş hayatlarında online platformlardan müşteriyle görüşerek güvenlik ihtiyacına yönelik taktikler ve gündelik yaşamda mekânda hissedilen aidiyet ve yürüyüşle mekanla kurulan ilişki olarak kendini göstermektedir. Bu bağlamda, tezimde, bu karşılaşmaların ve taktiklerin kent hakkı bağlamında mücadeleye dönüştüğünü ve bir iddia taşıyarak ve güçlenmeye katkıda bulunabileceğini vurguluyorum.

Anahtar Kelimeler: trans seks işçileri, haklara erişim, kentsel mekan, kent hakkı

To my mother, father. With love..

To everyone who tries to exist as themselves in the geographies of "immorality"

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First, I would like to sincerely thank my family and friends for always showing me their love and support. I'd like to thank my mother, Serap Orhan, for always being there for me and demonstrating my strength through the best example of solidarity, and my father, Halit Orhan, for his unwavering support in all aspects of my life.

I am grateful to my dear Destina and my dear friend Tolga for being by my side throughout the difficult processes and making this journey easier with their support. I would like to thank my thesis advisor, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Fulden İbrahimhakkıoğlu, for her patience and guidance throughout this study. I am grateful for everything she has contributed to my academic career.

I would also like to express my gratitude to the Red Umbrella Sexual Health and Human Rights Association, which contributed significantly to my research by providing knowledge and experience on the subject of my thesis. Seeing your commitment to human rights and social justice inspired me and gave meaning to this research.

Finally, I'd like to thank the trans women who exist or attempt to exist in moral geographies and willingly agreed to be interviewed. They contributed significant meaning and value to this research by sharing their experiences and stories. This study could not have been completed without your help. I sincerely thank everyone.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT iv

ÖZ vi

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ix

TABLE OF CONTENTS x

CHAPTERS

1.INTRODUCTION 1

1.2. Transgender Experiences in Sex Work 6

1.3. Historical perspectives of "cleansing project" in Turkey 8

1.3.1. The Brothel Demolition and Esat-Eryaman Case 14

1.4. The Purpose and Significance of the Study 19

2.THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK 23

2.1. Urban Space and Marginalized Communities 23

2.2. The Right to the City: Definitions and Debates 26

2.2.1. Feminist Critique and Rethinking of the Right to the City 31

2.3. Exclusion and Transgender Experiences in Heteronormatively Gendered Space 36

2.4. Trans Lives in Turkey 40

3.METHOD 46

3.1. An alliance between critical feminist research and the emerging field of transgender theory 48

3.2. Walking Interview as a Biographical Method (WIBM) 54

3.3. Thematic Analysis 55

3.4. Ethics in Research on Sex Work Studies 56

3.5. Research Design and Procedure 57

3.6. Participants and Stories 61

4. CLAIMS TO THE RIGHT TO THE CITY 65

4.1. Access to urban services 68
4.2. Visibility and Recognition in Urban Space 75
4.3. Safety in Working Environment 82
5. NAVIGATING AND SHAPING THE URBAN SPACE AND EVERYDAY LIFE 91
5.1. Everyday Spaces and Daily Routines 94
5.2. Access to community and Social Interactions 99
5.3. Trans Women Sex Workers and the Concept of "Belonging" 107
6. CONCLUSION 111
6.1. Limitations of the Study and Recommendation for Future Studies 120
A.TURKISH SUMMARY/TÜRKÇE ÖZET 131
B.THESIS PERMSSION/TEZ İZİN FORMU 149

CHAPTER 1

1.INTRODUCTION

Urban space is inherently intertwined with politics. It is a societal product regulated by multiple policies. Consequently, it is frequently perceived in various manners by diverse communities. Furthermore, the environment of space can be inhospitable and discriminatory, contingent upon an individual's social status. Disadvantaged individuals who are excluded from accessing space can also participate in acts of protest and opposition against the unjust allocation of opportunities within this space. They can formulate diverse tactics and strategies to assert their demands.

Lefebvre clarifies the concept of the right to the city by emphasizing the privilege to enter, live in, and own urban areas. Using a feminist perspective, I analyze the concept of the right to the city and support the feminist critiques that claim the existing patriarchal system has not been sufficiently challenged. Under these conditions, my research aims to demonstrate that the concept of the right to the city is inadequately theorized and that we must reconsider gender and sexuality norms from this standpoint. While recognizing the unjust and unequal application of the right to the city based on cisheteronormative[1] norms, my thesis aims to illustrate how this right can empower transgender sex workers and influence various aspects of their everyday existence. It aims to transform these effects into a claim and struggle in the context of the right to the city. My research adopts a more inclusive approach to the right to the

[1] Cisheteronormativity refers to the system of beliefs, societal expectations, and cultural practices that regulate individuals whose gender identity aligns with the sex assigned to them at birth, as well as those who identify as heterosexual.

city by considering gendered practices in everyday life. In addition, the right to the city is considered as a right where everyone can use urban space safely, have safe and equal access to services, participate in decision-making processes and overcome the public-private divide. In addition, this study, which considers a strong urban mobility centered on belonging and emancipation as a part of the right to the city, explores trans women's struggle for the right to the city in all areas of life. In this context, the tactics developed in every field such as daily life, social environment and work life are analyzed. In my thesis, I investigate the reflections of the resistance of trans sex workers claiming the right to the city and the tactics developed in spatial practice. I argue that the spatial practices that are subject to resistance help redefining and reclaiming spaces.

Over the course of six years that I have resided in Ankara, I have had the opportunity to experience a multitude of facets of its culture, diverse neighborhoods, and natural surroundings as a trained urban planner. For an extended period, I have had a strong desire to investigate the urban environment of Ankara, specifically focusing on the concept of exclusion. I came across a research project on the correlation between disability and justice in urban environments, which was also carried out in Ankara (Egbatan, 2021). This study explores the concept of egalitarian use of urban space by using the Ulus Historic Centre urban transformation project in Ankara Altındağ district as an example. It specifically examines the perspective of a sex worker towards this newly developed place. The sex worker expressed her views on the urban transformation region, stating that it is now being considered a family-friendly environment and that they are not welcome there. This statement caught my attention because this person was not only excluded from this space, but she also believed that she deserved such exclusion.

Subsequently, I began contemplating the underlying causes for this feeling of non-belonging. I was discussing the exaltation of the institution of the family, the tendency to overlook individual desires and perspectives due to societal norms, and the significant reverence placed on the normative physical body, which leads to the marginalization of certain individuals. In addition, moral entities were establishing moral spatial divisions and exploiting certain areas by labeling them "unclean." The existing existence of the cisheteropatriarchal gaze's appropriation of the body persists.

However, sex is still regarded as an essential requirement of hegemonic masculinity and continues to evolve in response to its many needs. Nevertheless, these bodies, perceived as immoral, unclean, and malevolent, are forcefully expelled from some locations and confined to a specific zone. The bodies that have been pushed and displaced, however, believe that they are entitled to it and inhabit a space that is acknowledged within the framework of governmentality.

In the cisheteropatriarchal system, both sexual minorities and trans women who engage in sex work are considered illegal and immoral, facing condemnation from both religious and patriarchal norms. Nevertheless, transgender women who have resided in Ankara for an extended period or are current residents of Ankara encounter the environment in diverse manners and cultivate distinct behaviors and perspectives. The right to the city is experienced differently by different socioeconomic groups, depending on elements such as legislation, culture, religion, and other forces that shape the city and its metropolitan neighborhoods. The perceptions of sex workers regarding their entitlement to urban spaces change with time, and they have the capacity to feel this entitlement in a positive way.

Within this framework, I am pursuing solutions to the following two primary research inquiries.

Research Question 1: How do trans sex workers' claims for the right to the city emerge in their spatial practices and forms of resistance?

Research Question 2: How do trans women sex workers navigate and shape urban environments through their strategies and practices? Do these interactions expand or constrain their access to the right to the city?

My claim is that the idea of the right to the city allows individuals to exercise their rights by making use of urban places and can greatly promote community empowerment in a distinctive manner. Sex workers can enhance their well-being and autonomy by exercising their entitlement to urban places, which enables them to have increased mobility and opportunities to secure suitable housing accommodations. How

does a sex worker in Ankara, Turkey navigate the challenges of structural abuse and surveillance while maintaining her everyday livelihood? Which strategies does she develop and employ in her life, and what methods does she use against them? How much access do trans women sex workers have to the restricted rights provided by the urban realm influenced by heteropatriarchal practices and rules that mostly benefit privileged groups? Furthermore, my objective is to uncover the hidden claims and demands for the right to live in metropolitan areas that are ingrained in seemingly ordinary and regular lives. From this viewpoint, I aim to emphasize the tactics inherited from de Certeau's (1984) and Lefebvre's (1971) critiques of everyday life. To summarize, every transgender woman engaged in sex work with whom I interviewed confidently claims her right to occupy urban areas and does not argue that this right is restricted only to private property and city usage.

Furthermore, the "right to the city" is also shaped by individuals' sense of belonging, spatial reminiscences, and memories linked to a specific place. Transgender women, who have historically faced oppressive policies of violence and intimidation, endeavor to live discreetly. They utilize tactics of silence and invisibility to navigate the widespread violence, domination, and subjugation that specifically target their physical beings. However, they continue to seek and establish connections within their environment. Tactics have the power to significantly impact daily life by undergoing various modifications. Transgender women have the right to access urban settings, yet there are some places they choose to avoid because they expect to face non-acceptance. These regions have periodically experienced exclusion, frequently via acts of violence, oppression, and fear. An essential component of understanding the spatial dimensions of sexuality and getting insight into the experiences of transgender women in heterosexual surroundings involves studying the daily routines of transgender women involved in sex industry. It is crucial to analyze not just everyday living, but also social activities, political outlook, and the rights that spatial experiences would entail.

The introduction chapter provides an overview of the place and background of transgender individuals in sex labor, covered in the section titled "Transgender Experiences in Sex Labor." Additionally, the section titled "Trans Lives in Turkey"

discusses the lives of transgender individuals within the political and social structure of Turkey. The section titled "Historical perspectives of the ‘cleansing project’ in Turkey" explores the narrative surrounding sex work and the displacement processes that are inherent in transgender life. My thesis will primarily focus on the province of Ankara, which serves as the main research site. The discussion will revolve around the processes and background of displacement.

The second chapter, “Theoretical Framework,” focuses on theoretical discussions pertaining to the right to the city. This chapter begins by examining theories related to the creation of physical space, the concept of cisheteronormative space, and the phenomenon of segregation. Next, I examine the significance of the right to the city and the right to difference and elucidate their relevance within the framework of this thesis. Next, I analyze feminist criticisms of urban space and the concept of the right to the city. Following an analysis of how heteronormative structures influence the creation of urban space, as well as the emerging notion of the right to the city, I proceed to outline the systematic marginalization of transgender individuals from urban areas, resulting in their confinement to the outskirts of the city. This section focuses on the tactics and strategies employed by transgender sex workers who face segregation, to gain access to their rights in urban areas.

The third chapter is “Method.” In this chapter, my primary focus is on the methodology and the intricate aspects of the fieldwork process. To begin, I will address the fundamental principles of transgender studies and feminist perspectives. Next, I outline the specific qualitative research methods employed and detail the approach taken to analyze the obtained results. I engage with my interviewees by discussing the ethical aspects of studying sex work and my own standpoint. Subsequently, I delve into the process of conducting fieldwork and the subsequent analysis of the data collected.

The fourth chapter is “Claims to the Right to the City” Thematic analysis was employed to organize and discuss the data collected from the interviews, using two main themes. The research examines the navigating and shaping of urban space in daily life and the strategies employed by trans sex workers to assert their right to the city. It emphasizes the requirements for access, security, recognition, visibility,

participation in demonstrations, and engagement with civil society organizations. The subheading addresses visibility in public spaces and circumstances related to sex work establishments. The theme of navigating and shaping of urban space in daily life emphasizes the frequency of engaging with specific areas, the categories of public and private spaces designated for recreation, the social interactions occurring within these spaces, alternative venues for community culture, and commonly frequented locations for safety purposes. The research examines the demographic and economic attributes of the variables.

1.2. Transgender Experiences in Sex Work

While sex work remained an "invisible" issue in recent years, it has become more frequently encountered in academic discussions and public opinion (Matthews, 2008). Sex work encompasses the transaction of sexual services, performances, or products in exchange for material compensation, which can involve both direct physical contact and indirect sexual stimulation. The sex industry encompasses individuals, administrators, proprietors, agencies, clubs, trade associations, and marketing activities associated with both lawful and unlawful sexual commerce (Weitzer, 2009).

In contemporary society, women engaged in sex work are frequently regarded as 'bad girls', as they defy societal expectations of femininity and are subject to growing criminalization. This is primarily attributed to the state's inadequate response, policing strategies, and decisions made by policy makers (O'Neill et al., 2017). The experience of sex workers closely parallels that of prostitutes in previous centuries, characterized by social stigma, exclusion, and diminished personal security as key factors. Nevertheless, as the commercial sex industry, specifically the adult entertainment sector, expands, the intricacy of purchasing and selling sex emerges due to the institution fulfilling a practical role as a "necessary evil" (O'Neill et al., 2017).

Sex workers who are criminalized within heteropatriarchal order and who are structurally and systematically subjected to violence, oppression and exclusion may face many social, economic, spatial and physical problems. While some of these problems will be explained below, we will start from the sex work venues that we frequently come across in Turkey. Street sex work and communicating with customers

through online platforms have various positive and negative aspects. Güler (2021) explores the varying viewpoints regarding the legality of sex work. There are two contrasting viewpoints on sex work. The first perspective argues that engaging in sex work diminishes a person's ability to make independent choices and is inherently characterized by violence, exploitation, and coercion (Güler, 2022; Weitzer, 2009). Conversely, sex work is perceived as a type of free labor in which individuals willingly participate in the sex industry to enhance their opportunities in life, demonstrating their personal autonomy (Bernstein, 2007).

Studies on transgender sex workers frequently center around legal and health concerns, including infringements on human rights, psychological well-being, susceptibility to HIV, and rates of substance abuse. The discussion revolves around personal safety and freedom of movement in sex work zones, with feminists highlighting the unofficial curfews and lack of safety for women in urban centers, particularly in red light districts, where they frequently face harassment, proposition, and assault (Matthews, 2008). Sex work, a subject of research that examines concerns such as safety, aggression, assault, and oppression, is also confronted with injustice, insecurity, and violence stemming from the environments in which it takes place. From this perspective, it is crucial to examine the encounters within urban environments, specifically those related to sex work, and to analyze the strategies employed to deal with them. An understanding of the spaces influenced by socio-spatial experiences, political context, and social perception provides insight into the structural arrangements that shape the daily lives and work routines of sex workers.

The study of trans women's experiences in sex work is an intricate and diverse field, as indicated by numerous research studies. Within the diverse range of academic disciplines, the notable areas of focus include gender identity and expression, financial autonomy, engaging in sex work for survival, prejudice, aggression, and the legal and political framework. Furthermore, health and safety have been extensively studied for numerous years, and trans liberation movements are characterized by activism and advocacy efforts. Bolivar (2021) underscores the multifaceted and disputed interpretations of currency among trans Latinas involved in sex work, placing particular emphasis on the significance of money in fostering nurturing connections

and sustaining transgender identities (Bolivar, 2021).

1.3. Historical perspectives of “cleansing project” in Turkey

In Turkey's cities and urban politics, it is evident that there is a project called the "cleansing project" which aims to protect societies from morally corrupt individuals. This project operates within the framework of a specific regime, ideology, and focuses on improvement and regulation. The cleansing projects consistently lead to the displacement of marginalized groups to the outskirts of the city, where they are relegated to areas that are unseen and unaffected. Occasionally, marginalized groups experience displacement or expulsion because of different types of physical and psychological violence. Most of these projects can be elucidated in terms of the creation and duplication of urban space, as social advancements and circumstances cannot be regarded in isolation from space. In this chapter, I examine the historical evolution of sex work in Turkey and the various sanitation initiatives that have been implemented in the sector over time. I would like to discuss the historical and political factors that contribute to the displacement of marginalized groups, particularly transgender groups, following regime changes and urban development initiatives in Turkey. I will analyze the aspects of urban development and interventions, including their legal and political dimensions.

The conservative neoliberal policies, these establishments have been shut down or destroyed under the pretext of urban transformation projects, with the belief being held that they distort social morality. Hubbard & Sanders (2003) stress that the placement of red-light streets is heavily impacted by the punitive measures taken by influential social groupings (Hubbard & Sanders, 2003). The notion of gentrification has been used to describe policy changes and their consequences (Aalbers & Deinema, 2012). Policy reforms supporting the decentralization and decentralization of redlight districts have made the process of gentrification obvious in many European cities. According to Hubbard and Whowell (2008), legislation and policy makers, respectively, are crucial in determining the geographic locations of sex work. The decentralized nature of sex work away from urban centers is facilitated by gentrification trends (Ellensohn, 2021). In Turkey, urban space is shaped with a similar perspective and various

regulations are made to regulate the spaces of sex work. In various periods, including the Ottoman Empire and the first periods of the Republic, this furor continues to fluctuate.

Regulation of sex work's applicable legislation which extended to modern times in a way of structurally were based on before the Turkish Republic in the Ottoman Empire times (Kilislioğlu, 2020). Until the late nineteenth century, Muslim women could not participate to sex work in a legal way, solely, non-Muslim women could work as a sex worker (Engin, 2018). State-run brothels "genelevler" is a unique contribution to sex work in this way. In the urban context, various spaces became visible as part of the entertainment sector; for instance, gazinos, hans, hamams, hotels, and guesthouses (Sariyannis, 2008). After the spread of syphilis and HIV infection sex workers, homosexuals etc. held responsible for the diseases. In 1908 Syphilis Hospital established in Izmir and became compulsory for prostitutes. Following that, in the Ottoman Empire regulate the legislation on "The Regulation on the Prevention of the Spread of Venereal Disease" (Toprak, 1987). After the regulation brothels controlled by state strictly, restricted their working space and conditions; and also, legislated compulsory medical examinations and fees (Oğuz, 2017). The consequences of those regulations are showing the extent of sex work and brothels visibility in a legal way (Oğuz, 2017). In this context, transgender individuals became visible as 'effeminate men' in major sectors, including the entertainment industry, as sex workers and assistants to prominent officials in the late Ottoman Empire in the early twentieth century (Ördek, 2015). Generally, sex work was a significant aspect of both the late period of the Ottoman Empire and the early years of the Republic in terms of social and economic life. In the Ottoman Empire, sex work has been perceived as "inevitable, yet immoral" (Sariyannis, 2008, p. 62).

Since during the Republican regime sex work was seen as a trouble regarding the public health, in 1930 Public Health law were subjected to a regulation. In 1933, with *"Genel Kadınlar ve Genelevlerin Tabi Olacakları Hükümler ve Fuhuş Yüzünden Bulaşan Zührevi Hastalıklarla Mücadele Tüzüğü"* (the Act about Provisions on Prostitutes and Brothels and Fighting against Venereal Diseases Transmitted through

Prostitution[2]) legalized sex workers, brothel's conditions, spatial conditions, health checkups, licensing of brothels regulated. The legislation on sex work, which is still in use today, is based on this statute (Kilislioğlu, 2020).

The 1950s saw a sharp rise in internal migration and urbanization, particularly in large cities, which contributed to a major increase in the prevalence of sex work (Güler, 2022). To clean up the sex work districts, hotels were raided and licensed brothels were forced to close in the 1950s (Toprak, 1987). Trans women sex workers began congregating on Abanoz Street in Istanbul in the late 1960s because of the opening of nightclubs there that would go on to become extremely well-known in the 1970s (Zengin, 2014). Before it closed in 1978, Abanoz Street was well-known for its nightclubs and workhouses in the 1970s and developed into a bustling hub for sex and entertainment (Güler, 2022)

In the 1970s, while many transgender individuals gained visibility as singers or actors in the cinema industry, much of the rest had to have sex. After the 1980 coup d'état, transgender individuals were severely affected by the severe restrictions that came with the dictatorship, and Bülent Ersoy's case for changing her identity was rejected and the process continued (Taşcıoğlu, 2011). During the same period, all transgender women were banned from the stage, and they were subjected to intense violence and oppression and were expelled from Istanbul (Ördek, 2015). In the 1990s, transgender women who worked in the sex industry faced severe violence and discrimination (Üçgen, 2012). Transgender women were subjected to torture in police stations (Ördek, 2015). Since the 1990s, transgender women have battled against the ongoing and pervasive violence they experience by joining groups like Lambdaistanbul and Kaos GL. In Eryaman, Ankara, where transgender women sex workers live and work together, state-sponsored organized gangs and the police conducted a "cleansing operation" in 2006 that was akin to the one that occurred in Beyoğlu in 1996 (Ördek, 2015).

[2] Genel Kadınlar ve Genelevlerin Tabi Olacakları Hükümler ve Fuhuş Yüzünden Bulaşan Zührevi Hastalıklarla Mücadele Tüzüğü. Retrieved from https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/2.4.5984.pdf

Trans women began to disperse after moving to Cihangir in 1985, and in 1987 the neighborhood was officially recognized as a place for (illegal) sex trade. With the streets becoming more and more well-known, sex work eventually moved from being done through doors to being done on wheels, beginning with the glass wheel (Gursu & Cingöz, 2013). Police raids and arrests began in the early 1990s, which caused several trans women to leave the region. Others congregated on Ülker Street, where they lived and worked for a few more years until being forcibly removed from their homes in the mid-1990s (Gursu & Cingöz, 2013).

After the historical context of the sex work and its conditions in big cities in Turkey, legislative transformation can examine to have a deep understanding of oppression and systematic violence against sex workers. Sex work is known as the oldest occupation throughout human history. In this context, several countries make distinct legislation to control sex work in their region. These legal regulations roughly categorized in three rubrics: regulatory, abolitionist and decriminalization laws. In Turkey, regulatory laws can be seen since late Ottoman Empire. There are various legislation acts and orders which regulate sex work in constitution, such as, Act on Provisions about Common Women and Common Houses and Fighting against Venereal Diseases Transmitted through Prostitution, Law on Misdemeanors Orders and the amendment to the Law on the Powers and Duties of the Police.

“Act on Provisions about Common Women and Common Houses and Fighting against Venereal Diseases Transmitted through Prostitution” appears as a very important regulation for the regulation of brothels, supervision of sex workers and their inclusion in the health system. The law, which determines the ways in which sexuality and women are perceived in Turkey, includes articles on licensing the areas where sex is to be performed, the selection and positioning of venues, and the naming and advertising of brothels. The first thing I would like to draw attention to here is the law's definition of “general woman.” The definition of “general woman” in the statute includes expressions such as “reasons that drive women to sex work,” “women and girls who have not completed the age of 21,” “those who are registered as general women,” “women who engage in sex work alone,” “women who make sex work a means of art

and livelihood.[3]" As can be understood with these expressions, in addition to the gender distinction and classification, trans women cannot work in brothels without changing their identity.

The law regulating sex work contains evidence of moral norms and a heteronormative perspective. According to the Article 48 of the Act on Provisions about Common Women and Common Houses and Fighting against Venereal Diseases Transmitted through Prostitution,[4] common houses, except for facilities where common women are examined and treated, are prohibited from being located in close proximity to official offices and institutions, places of worship and education, sports fields, places of general assembly, entertainment and festivals, as well as areas specified in Article 178 of the Public Hygiene Law.[5] Brothels, however hidden from plain sight, are present in the periphery of society and in concealed locations (Zengin, 2014). Article 82 explicitly prohibits anyone from working without a license and without being associated with a brothel. Furthermore, Articles 80 and 81 demonstrate that bodies are subject to regulation and control under a patriarchal framework (Zengin, 2014).

According to a study conducted in 2011, there are over 100,000 street sex workers in Turkey (Engin, 2018). It is known that there was a very dense queue in brothels, but due to the closing of brothels, cis-woman sex workers also started to work on the streets. In this context, there are claims and promises that the city has been "cleaned from filth" by starting to demolish brothels with the investments made in cities with the conservative neoliberal policies that developed after the 2000s and the urban transformation fury. According to a 2021 study, 16 out of 36 cities had active brothels after 2000, and brothels in 20 cities were either completely closed or demolished. Among the reasons for demolition, a variety of local, moral, political, economic and health reasons were presented, and the most prominent reason was that the location of

[3] Madde 21- Genel Kadınlar ve Genelevlerin Tabi Olacakları Hükümler ve Fuhuş Yüzünden Bulaşan Zührevi Hastalıklarla Mücadele Tüzüğü. Retrieved from https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/2.4.5984.pdf

[4] "Madde 48 – Genel evler; genel kadınların muayene ve tedavi edildiği müesseseler müstesna olmak üzere, resmi daire ve müesseseler, ibadet ve eğitim yerleri, spor sahaları, genel toplanma, eğlence ve bayram yerleri yakınında ve bu yerlerden görülebilecek bir mesafede ve Umumi Hıfzıssıhha Kanununun 178 inci maddesinde yazılı yerler dahilinde veya yakınında olamaz."
Retrieved from https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/2.4.5984.pdf in 28 February 2024

[5] Retrieved from https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/mevzuatmetin/1.3.1593.pdf

the brothel was between residential areas (İnce, 2021).

Similar instances can be observed in other major cities, including Ankara, Istanbul, and Adana. Sex workers who lost their jobs due to the closure or demolition of brothels resorted to alternative methods of soliciting clients, such as engaging with them on the street known as "çark" in lubunca, or by hitching. Due to the constraints of the law, transgender sex workers give sexual services in riskier circumstances and cannot benefit from governmental aids and health care. To earn enough money to make a living and to express their gender identities, they have almost no other choice but to participate in illicit sex labor outside the brothel system. Trans sex workers in Turkey face criminalization because they must work outside of the legal brothel system. Government policies that prohibit street employment expose trans women to increased economic and social deprivation (Engin, 2018).

For the past 20 years, Turkey has implemented similar zero tolerance policies, exclusionary measures, and moral discourses against brothels. Although they are establishments with legal recognition, brothels are in opposition to societal norms about morality and religion as well as government policy. Discourses that are particularly well-known claim that the city's aesthetics and image are tainted, and that operations to remove and demolish property have been carried out to prevent the dignity of society from being tainted (İnce, 2021). Violence in Turkey is ongoing but occasionally takes on serious proportions, which has led to the eviction and displacement of transgender people as well as their exposure to violent acts. Particularly in heteropatriarchal settings, spatial exclusion takes the form of violence and is reflected in gender, sexuality, and ethical beliefs. Öz (2013) provided an example of the severity of exclusion in Turkey, citing the stage ban and exile to cities outside of Istanbul that transgender women experienced due to the authoritarian and militarist laws put in place following the 1980 coup. Another instance is that in 1996, when Istanbul was getting ready for the Habitat 2 human settlements conference, Ülker Street inhabitants were being violently attacked by a group known as neighborhood residents. Ultimately, in the Eryaman area, there were lynchings and displacements of transvestites and other women in 2006 (Öz, 2013). To examine these processes in

greater detail, I will describe the Ankara displacement processes below.

In this section, we have covered the historical progression of sex work in Turkey, encompassing its evolution, the legal framework governing it, such as the stringent regulations on brothels, and the plight of transgender and cisgender women who are compelled to engage in street-based sex work. Next, I turn to the historical progression of Ankara's primary customs, the ramifications of conservative neoliberal policies, and the status of transgender employees.

1.3.1. The Brothel Demolition and Esat-Eryaman Case

Ankara had a brothel and registered sex workers until 2010, but the local authorities decided to demolish the brothel. Ankara Bentderesi Brothel, which the state had established in the 1960s, was decided to be demolished by Ankara Metropolitan Municipality within the scope of urban transformation works of "Ulus Historical City Project" (Habertürk, 2010). The demolitions that started in 2010 consisted of 39 4-story houses where approximately 400 women worked (Belediyesi, 2011). For the women working in the houses where 7000 people enter daily, the loss of their livelihoods has caused severe anger.

In 2014, the demolitions were completed, but they caused severe public debate, and it is a fact that the rights of sex workers working in the brothel were also usurped. According to the statement made by the Chamber of City Planners, "When intervening in undesirable areas and uses in the city such as brothels, a social consensus should be formed with the participation of all authorized institutions and non-governmental organizations, and for this, sociologists and psychologists should be consulted. An urban security strategy should be developed" (Bianet, 2010). However, local authorities continued their operations without taking any measures. As a result, most of the brothel workers applied to brothels in other cities, and the rest continued sex work in Ankara by hitchhiking or through websites. Especially women living with their families who had established a routine in Ankara and continued sex work in Ankara without registration.

In addition to the brothel, Ankara is a vast space for sex workers due to its pavilion culture, nightlife, and telebar culture. According to Pembe Hayat, the city's residents are familiar with the presence of women and men working in the entertainment and nightlife sector. Due to this situation and the fact that it is a metropolitan city, it hosts a significant sex worker population.[6] The position of trans sex workers in nightlife and sex work conditions differs and changes from place to place. Trans women sex workers cannot work in brothels before they get their pink identity cards and complete their gender adjustment process. For this reason, transgender sex workers usually do sex work by hitchhiking or waiting for vehicles on certain streets, called "going out on the street," or they do sex work in their homes by advertising on websites or Twitter. However, sex work, which is forbidden in both types, has a very negative impact on the lives of trans women.

With their programmatic mapping study, Gökengin et al. (2021) aimed to comprehend the current situation to identify the locations in Turkey where the key population of sex workers congregates, estimate their numbers, and create effective HIV program implementation techniques. Particularly for Ankara and Istanbul, two sizable cities, data were gathered and examined. According to the data, there are 9945 female sex workers in Ankara and an estimated 30,447 in Istanbul. Men who have sex with men (MSM) make up 11 656 in Istanbul and 5018 in Ankara, while transgender sex workers are estimated to number 15 780 in Istanbul and 1770 in Ankara. About 83% of FSWs in Ankara are in just two districts: Çankaya (62%) and Altındağ (21%). TGSWs generally operate through street venues in both Istanbul and Ankara, though Çankaya is home to over 85% of the TGSW population in Ankara (Gokengin et al., 2021). Nevertheless, as social media and online connections have grown, so has the frequency of online consumer communication because of the pandemic's effects. Conversely, Gökengin et al. noted in their 2021 research that TGSWs were quite noticeable in certain areas and suggested that this might be because the community experiences a lot of prejudice and stigma while trying to find work (Gokengin et al., 2021).

Ankara is one of the widely preferred sex workplaces, especially in the Çankaya

[6] Ibid, 8

region. The area, which is divided into regions, consists of regions chosen by trans and non-trans women to do sex work. Mostly, Çankaya, Küçükesat, Seyranbağları, and Ayrancı neighborhoods are known as the regions of trans women. In these neighborhoods, trans women work much more intensively, and there is a dense population.[7] On the streets known to belong to trans women, it is known that some cis women have been doing sex work on these streets after the brothel was demolished. Pink Life and Red Umbrella also made a similar point and stated that the spaces of trans and cis sex workers differ from each other and Ulus Square, known as the center of old

Ankara, the pavilion area and its surroundings are known as the area of cis women sex workers.[8]

Trans women do not want to work in the same area because of competition and the idea that they are stealing each other's customers. Different streets are known, and certain people live in these areas. On the other hand, these areas are determined by the authority of each street, neighborhood, and wheel space. For this reason, there is no arbitrary change of location among trans women, and there are groupings called Seyran girls and Kolej girls.[9] Seyran girls refer to sex workers living and working in Ankara Esat district, while Kolej girls refer to sex workers working in Kolej district. Differentiations in the working space also affect social spaces. Kolej girls do not socialize in the same spaces where Seyran girls socialize.

The regions, which are also related to the reasons for the differentiation of social spaces, also affect the economic situation according to the difference in the client profile. While the session fees of girls doing sex work in the college are lower, the session fees in regions such as Ayrancı and GOP are higher and directly affect the

[7] Authorized person C, Pink Life LGBTI+ Solidarity Association's General Coordinator, personal interview, 26 January 2024

[8] Authorized person A& Authorized person B, Red Umbrella Sexual Health and Human Rights Association's Legal Advisor & Sexual and Reproductive Health Programme Officer, personal interview, 19 February 2024

[9] Ibid

socio-economic status. Another benefit of this socio-economic differentiation is that people living in Cinnah, Hoşdere, and Esat have the right to choose customers because they have better financial income and can live in a more prosperous environment. There may be differences between the regions depending on their economic status and the size of their neighborhoods.

Eryaman appears as a neighborhood where trans sex workers started to settle from the late 1990s until 2006. Many trans women started to move to Eryaman in response to the increasing pressure of law enforcement forces and the increasing violence and attacks of organized crime groups against sex workers working on the streets and avenues in the center of Ankara. In addition, they also migrated from other cities through trans women they know working in Eryaman. The systematic oppression and violence they faced were temporarily not felt in Eryaman but soon turned into a place of violence (Ördek, 2017).

Starting in 2004, the construction of Eryaman 3rd and 4th stage mass housing areas included the construction of a shopping center and a swimming pool. At that time, Eryaman was reported to be inhabited by lower-income groups and students. On the other hand, it has turned into a rent-seeking area and appears as one of the urban development areas by building high-rise luxury housing estates and shopping centers. In this luxurious environment, trans sex workers, who were seen as the criminals and immoral people of the city, were subjected to violence and pressure and were wanted to be expelled from Eryaman. A group known as an organized crime organization was subjected to severe physical violence against trans sex workers. According to the allegations, this gang was allegedly related to the mayor of the period and a prominent construction company. The group formed as a paramilitary force, also known as the A team, is another group that simultaneously applied pressure and violence against trans sex workers.[10]

Since 2006, physical attacks against trans women sex workers have reached a severe dimension, such as damaging their vehicles, looting their houses, and even plugging

[10] Atty. Senem Doğanoğlu, Esat-Eryaman Case's lawyer, personal interview, 16 January 2024

their houses. Sex workers were subjected to armed attacks and beaten with rotary knives and iron sticks. There was no trans sex worker living in Eryaman who was not a victim of the attacks, and eventually, they left the region (Ördek, 2017). In addition to the women who were shot with severe wounds, Dilek İnce, one of the complainants of the Esat-Eryaman case, was shot and killed in her car in Etlik in 2008 and the perpetrator remained unknown.[11]

Lawyers and followers stated that there were systematic and organized attacks on trans women living in Eryaman because of their sexual orientation and that the files should be merged, and the scope of the crime should be evaluated in this way. However, the prosecutor's office wanted to retake statements from all complainants. In this process, it was not possible to reach many of the Eryaman victims as most of the trans women had moved to other cities. As a result of the complaint, the defendants were sentenced only for the offense of "damaging property." The attacks on trans women who moved from Eryaman to Esat continued by the same gang. This time, the arrested defendants remained in pre-trial detention for a while, and the 11th High Criminal Court considered the incidents as organized crime. The court described these attacks as a gang that came together to prevent trans women from their living spaces based on ideas triggered by social prejudices[12] and concluded that the attacks were committed out of anger and hatred (Öz, 2013).

In the Eryaman-Esat case, which has repeatedly faced the statute of limitations, the defendants were sentenced to between 34 and 45 months in the case concluded in 2008. The court ruled that the attackers were a gang but did not sentence them on the charge of looting. In 2011, the Court of Cassation overturned the verdict. The court hearing the case changed, and in 2018, the case went to the Supreme Court again. In 2020, the sentence given by the local court to the attackers was overturned by the Court of Cassation. This time, the case filed with the allegation of looting was transferred to the heavy penalty (Bianet, 2022). In the last process, the case was appealed and is pending. The defendants were sentenced to 82 years in total, but these sentences were reduced

[11] Authorized person C, Pink Life LGBTI+ Solidarity Association's General Coordinator, personal interview, 26 January 2024
[12] Atty. Senem Doğanoğlu, Esat-Eryaman Case's lawyer, personal interview, 16 January 2024

due to the statute of limitations.[13]

Trans women who wanted to claim their rights during the trial process followed all the trials with the support of many associations and organizations. On the other hand, they tried to be visible and make their voices heard by demonstrating on the streets of the city. Stating that until 2013 trans visibility was relatively high, Doğanoğlu stated that the case revealed the need for trans self-organization. On the other hand, the "We want to live" themed protest in shrouds, which took place on Thursdays on Yüksel Street, made a great impression. Every Thursday, women lying on Yüksel Street wearing shrouds, lit candles, and wanted to seek the rights of their friends who were killed for hate crimes and their friends who were exiled. In addition, trans women gathered in Kurtuluş Park with banners such as "We are transvestites, not exhibitionists," "Our transvestite identity cannot be prevented," they should be able to love each other," "Mehmet loves Peace," "Sex work is not destiny."[14] Pink Life filled the whole hall and tried to keep the case on the agenda. When the case was returned in 2020, Pink Life returned it to the agenda. This case also enabled the organization of lawyers. Lubunya's lawyers became visible, and everyone in the courthouse became aware of the case. It also contributed significantly to the visibility of trans people organized in daily life. They became more organized while there was ordinary visibility.

1.4. The Purpose and Significance of the Study

The primary objective of my thesis is to analyze the specific circumstances and criteria by which the right to the city is allocated to transgender sex workers in Ankara. Additionally, I aim to examine the strategies and techniques employed by marginalized individuals to oppose oppression and marginalization. My thesis asserts that by examining the tactics and methods employed, we may uncover the demands for the right to the city. Additionally, it highlights how transgender sex workers are actively asserting their rights as individuals who navigate urban spaces. Moreover, I will

[13] Ibid, 12

[14] https://kaosgl.org/haber/karartilan-caddeler-gelemeyen-adalet-esat-eryaman-davasi, Accessed 2 February 2024

discuss the progress made in addressing the difficulties faced by transgender sex workers in establishing secure environments. This includes their efforts to establish a presence, overcome hostility, and secure a place within an unequal spatial hierarchy.

Through a specific focus on the narratives of transgender women, their interactions with urban environments, their lived experiences, and their daily routines, I aim to analyze these experiences within the framework of the distribution and advocacy for the right to the city. Simultaneously, I will analyze the strategies and approaches employed by transgender women engaged in sex work. I will highlight the existence of systematic measures aimed at specific social groups and individuals and demonstrate how the characteristics of this targeted group may be identified based on prevailing sexual and ethical standards.

In line with the gaps in the literature, Deyslass notes that the empowering features of working in the sex industry are not well-represented (Desyllas, 2013). According to Vanwesenbeeck (2017), this discrepancy results from certain researchers' challenges in comprehending positive, rational reasons for selecting sex work. Vanwesenbeeck (2017) highlights that there is a possibility of "desirability bias" resulting from this (Vanwesenbeeck, 2017). Sexual workers may choose to emphasize their victim status and lack of motivation for working, or they may choose to conceal their experiences related to further stigmatizing behaviors like drug use or risky sexual conduct. Additionally, Karlson (2022) advises that additional research be done to fill the gap in this subject by taking into consideration factors of empowerment and victimization under various regulatory regimes (Karlsson, 2022).

Literature frequently addresses themes of violence, substance abuse, HIV/AIDS, victimization, stigmatization, public health, the regulation of sex work, and discrimination. Urban studies, conversely, examine the geography of sex work, spatial discrimination, and the role of sex work within urban environments. Nevertheless, many studies fail to consider sex work through the lens of the right to the city, which provides a more holistic and theoretical framework. The right to the city provides a robust analytical framework for comprehending the experiences of sex workers in

urban environments, encompassing both empowerment and coexistence perspectives. The existence of sex workers in public areas and their entitlement to utilize these spaces are significant concerning gender and urban rights. Nonetheless, there exists a considerable deficiency in research and elucidation regarding sex workers' rights to urban space, as they face social exclusion and legal penalties stemming from stigmatization.

According to Marcuse (2009), the request for the Right to the City originates from those who are directly oppressed, while the desire for it comes from those who feel alienated. Analyzing the demands of these alienated groups for the right to urban space is a complicated and vital matter. Through his study on homeless individuals in Los Angeles, he highlights the fact that those who sleep on park benches in the city center are unable to access the "right to the city." (Marcuse, 2009). Also, what he emphasizes is the need to know the rights of those who do not currently have the right to the city, who is most deeply affected, who will support them, what their justifications will be. Given this inquiry, we can inquire about the experiences of individuals involved in sex work with regards to their entitlement to urban spaces. What are the specific constraints on their rights in relation to the right to the city? What are their assertions regarding the entitlement to the urban space, notwithstanding the constraints?

The second reason is the openness and fluidity of the concept of the right to the city and its contemporary revivals. I wonder about how the concept is changing in the society and the perception about those rights. According to Attoh (2011), openness can be considered advantageous. However, it is difficult to reconcile this openness with the argument that differences in the definition and manifestation of rights still hold significance (Attoh, 2011). The ongoing inquiry into the right to the city persists, exploring the specific beneficiaries and nature of this right within the context of openness and flexibility. In addition, Soja (2010) emphasizes the shifting thematic titles within the process (E. W. Soja, 2010). Extreme manifestations of ideas can arise within social and political structures.

As far as I have explained above, the idea of the right to the city has been addressed in

quite different aspects and has an open-ended meaning. In my inquiry into sex workers' right to the city, I draw from Buckingams, Fenster, and Bebeejauun's works to examine the relationship between gender and the right to the city. Of course, there are variety aspects of right to the city, namely, economic and social rights, housing rights, civil and political rights, environmental rights, cultural rights and ownership rights (Domaradzka, 2018; Shelley, 2010). When I consider the various aspects of the right to the city, I must combine these elements, particularly in the lived experiences of marginalized group sex workers. Therefore, I examine daily spatial activities, political rights (participation of organization, decision making and community belonging), cultural rights (neighborhood associations, alternative cultural spaces) and spatial using.

CHAPTER 2

2.THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1. Urban Space and Marginalized Communities

Space is a complex issue to define and describe to gender variant groups because it depends on experiences and distinct concept and power. Experiencing urban space may differentiate individually and every dweller can change their space also, space can change individuals in the same way. One participant highlighted that an individual residing in Keçiören or Sincan, areas characterized by a more conservative and insular social structure, may exhibit behavioral and social changes upon arriving at Tunalı Hilmi Street. According to my participant's point of view, Tunalı Hilmi Street is more elite and developed. Because of that space's cultural atmosphere, when people are on that street, they chance their attitudes and behaviors. In this chapter, I will discuss the intersection of morality, gender, sexuality, and space, with an emphasis on the urban geographies of individuals with a specific gender identity and how sex operates. First, I will look at the production of space and heteronormative patterns in the urban space according to the moral concerns.

Lefebvre (1991) provides a comprehensive explanation of the concept of space in his book *The Production of Space*. The initial element is referred to be "perceived space" or "spatial practices" and highlights the ways in which space can be created and utilized by different societal groupings. The second concept is space representations, sometimes known as "designed space," which focuses on the spatial arrangements that policy makers and decision makers create on documents. Ultimately, the terms "representational space" or "lived space" refer to how individuals see and make sense

of the physical environment they inhabit (Lefebvre, 1991). The environment acquires a social and symbolic significance, which is shaped by the users' experiences. Aydıntuğ (2022) categorized these three spatial dimensions as "physical, mental/abstract, and social aspects" correspondingly (Zerey Aydıntuğ, 2022). An essential focus in defining Lefebvre's idea of space and the concept of the right to the city has been to determine the effective aspects involved in the production and transformation of space, as well as their extent. Aydıntuğ (2022) argues that the right to the city encompasses both the ability of individuals to participate in decision-making processes and contribute to them, as well as their entitlement to possess urban environments that are intentionally constructed, both at the individual and societal levels (Zerey Aydıntuğ, 2022).

The production of space can be defined as a socially constructed framework that encompasses a hierarchy, as discussed by Soja (1971) and Lefebvre in their work on the production of space. Soja (1971) argues that spatial organization inside ice is created by hierarchical ordering, similar to how social status is generated through social ordering (E. W. Soja, 2010). Harvey, Lefebvre, and Soja advocate for a dialectical relationship between society and space, asserting that space is not merely a passive geometric entity, but it rather actively contributes to the shaping of society. In this particular context, Lefebvre placed significant emphasis on the notion that society has the ability to replicate or recreate physical space, and conversely, physical space has the ability to replicate or recreate society (Lefebvre, 1991). Lefebvre thoroughly investigated and analyzed the intricate interaction that exists between society and space. When examining the various groups within society, the development of urban areas is influenced by the spatial behaviors of these groups and demonstrates a consistent and ongoing process (Beebeejaun, 2017). Grosz (2018) argues that the city functions as a unifying and coordinating influence for diverse entities, creating complex relationships between individuals and urban surroundings (Grosz, 2018). The relationship between individuals and urban environments has a profound influence on the social, sexual, and communicative dimensions of the human body. Nevertheless, it is crucial to acknowledge that this association is not consistently planned or purposeful (Grosz, 2018). Put simply, different social groups, including marginalized ones, have an impact on and are influenced by various spaces through their spatial practices.

These spaces can either change in response to changes in social structure or contribute to shaping the social structure. Social groupings have the ability to establish their own unique sense of location and question the perceptions and interpretations of others (Cresswell, 1996).

The performativity of space and its ongoing process of transformation and reconstruction play a central role in the creation and operation of everyday space, influencing how power is exerted and interpreted (Browne, 2007). Browne (2007) highlights the significance of power interpretations in shaping everyday life, specifically how small-scale processes and commonly accepted beliefs contribute to the creation and understanding of dominant heterosexual environments (Browne, 2007). The repetition of heterosexual behavior perpetuates the false belief that space is inherently and naturally heterosexual, hence obscuring the sexual power dynamics that conform to heteronormative norms (Bell, 1995; Hubbard & Sanders, 2003).

The awareness that space created by heteronormative norms is inherently shaped and generated is reinforced by the systematic regulation and control mechanisms established by the prevailing sexual power dynamics. The city, with its various institutions of monitoring, is made up of numerous locations that cannot be effectively controlled through systematic discipline (Hunt, 2002). Heterosocial experiences are regulated by the intimate collaboration of official institutions and private moralizing institutions (Hunt, 2002). Systematic discipline and control mechanisms are evident in every aspect of life, including daily practices within the social structure. Urban space in this context is organized and maintained in everyday life through techniques, technology, and conversations that support a heteronormative perspective. The daily activities that are carried out create heterosexual and conventional environments. According to Bell et al. (2020), the city is characterized as being male due to its foundation being rooted in masculine conquests, which are intertwined with money, influence, power, and corruption. Hence, it is pertinent to analyze the connection that marginalized communities, who encounter the urban environment in gender-specific areas and are unable to conform to heteronormative norms, establish with physical space from this standpoint.

The gendered urban area undergoes transformation due to the influence of different groups, while simultaneously excluding those groups that fall outside the boundaries of what is considered "moral" and "normal." The allocation of the right to the city varies and can be unequal based on factors such as social class, economic status, social standing, and marginalized groups in a space that is still structured based on heteronormative norms. The notion of the right to the city has been proposed to tackle the disparities that arise from the processes involved in the creation of urban areas. In the upcoming chapter, I will provide a more comprehensive analysis of how the concept of the right to the city is perceived, by whom, and the criteria used to allocate it in gendered urban areas. In addition, I will incorporate comprehensive analyses of the historical and contemporary conceptual debates surrounding the notion of the right to the city, as well as its significance, within the context of my thesis.

2.2. The Right to the City: Definitions and Debates

The concept of the right to the city was introduced by Henri Lefebvre in 1968. Lefebvre's concept is grounded in the notions of appropriation and participation. He articulated the phrase using his own words, stating that "the right to the city is both an urgent outcry and a compelling demand" (Lefebvre et al., 1996, p. 158). According to Lefebvre, humans have a rightful claim to the oeuvre. Furthermore, this entitlement is linked to essential requirements that every urban area should be planned to fulfil: "the necessity for inventive pursuits, for the creation (not just of tangible products and consumable goods), the necessity for knowledge, symbolism, imagination, and recreation" (Lefebvre et al., 1996, p. 147). Put simply, the right to the city encompasses fundamental rights such as freedom, individualization in society, and the ability to live and have shelter. In accordance with Lefebvre's statement "the right to the city encompasses the right to access, participate in, and take ownership of urban spaces (which is clearly different from the right to own property)" (Lefebvre et al., 1996, p. 174).

For certain theorists and researchers, the concept of the right to the city encompasses various perspectives. Harvey (2003) emphasizes that the right to the city is a collective right rather than an individual right. Also, he thinks it offers “a right to change

ourselves by changing the city" (Harvey, 2003, p. 23). For Marcuse (2009) a right can understand a claim for a better legal system where the demands can be fully and entirely satisfied, as well as a claim to justice within the current legal system. There is also a higher moral plane behind this claim. He emphasizes the goal of the right to the city as a claim to a totality, to something complete and entirely distinct from the current city and society (Marcuse, 2009). According to Purcell (2002), the right to the city emphasizes the necessity of reorganizing the power dynamics that underpin the creation of urban space, essentially moving control from the state and capital to the people who live in cities (Purcell, 2002). The right to the city is significant because of its capaciousness, according to Mitchell and Heynen (2009). They underline that people have the right to urban life, or the right to be a part of the city by being present and active, as well as the right to participate in the creation of the city (Mitchell & Heynen, 2009). Additionally, Soja (2010) defines the right to the city as a concept of social and spatial justice that comes from the morality (E. Soja, 2010).

Harvey (2003) describes that the right to the city includes the right to define and construct what should exist to fulfil human requirements for a decent existence in urban contexts, as well as the right to use what currently exists in urban places (Harvey, 2003). As King (2019) stated that Lefebvre's perspective is based on a nuanced comprehension of the evolution of urban life throughout history, its close yet conflicted ties to business and industry, and the contrast between places as artifacts or works of art (oeuvre) and as products (King, 2019). He contends that the right to the city manifests itself as a higher type of right, including the right to liberty, the right to socialization within an individualistic framework, and the right to settle and settle (Mitchell, 2003). According to Mitchell (2003), this would ultimately liberate use-value, the fundamental foundation of urban life, from exchange-value's sway. The right to the city includes the right to reside as well as the right to use public areas (Mitchell, 2003).

Lefebvre's notion of the right to the city is at once complex and fluid due to the fluidity and openness there are some of the other explanation and also updated to the definition and context of the right to the city (Attoh, 2011; Purcell, 2002). Attoh (2011) says the

right to the city can be understood as necessarily linked to the rights to housing, rights against police brutality, rights to design, and rights to a public good like aesthetics (Attoh, 2011). Conversely, it highlights the idea that openness can be advantageous. However, it is difficult to reconcile this openness with the argument that variations in the definition and manifestation of rights are still significant (Attoh, 2011). Within the openness and fluidity in the concept, the questioning about the right to the city like for whom, what kind of right is continuing.

In recent years, the idea of the right to the city has increasingly come to be seen as mobilizing as a socio-political concept in academic writings, meetings and conferences since the 2000s. This slogan makes possible an empowering unity for the pursuit of spatial justice and democratic rights in urbanized space (E. W. Soja, 2010). The other update coming from that concept is with regard to the slogan “the right to the city” has been taken up by a variety of social movement and activist round the world, who use it as a demand for social justice and democracy in the urban space (De Souza, 2010; E. W. Soja, 2010). This concept might embody a distinctive demand, including the participation of producing and transforming space, access to public space and ownership house.

When Marcuse (2009) explains the cry for the right to the city in the economical perspective stems from, the marginalized, the poorest and most insecure members of the working class; however, not from the capitalists and the intelligentsia (Marcuse, 2009). The demand for the right to the city originates from marginalized individuals who feel alienated, insecure, and powerless. These individuals are both the underwriters and beneficiaries of the dominant cultural and ideological attitudes and ideas, as well as the directly oppressed groups. The term "directly oppressed" refers to individuals who experience oppression based on factors such as race, ethnicity, gender, and lifestyle. These individuals are sometimes referred to as the "excluded," but this exclusion is mostly cultural rather than economic. Examining the situation from this perspective, the request for the Right to the City originates from those who are directly subjugated, while the desire for it arises from those who feel disconnected or estranged (Marcuse, 2009).

From this perspective, the analysis of the marginalized groups' request for the right to access urban space is a multifaceted and crucial matter. Marcuse underscores the notion that there exists a contradiction among rights that necessitates confrontation and resolution, rather than just being ignored or dismissed. He asserts that certain individuals, namely real estate owners, speculators, the political elite, and media owners, already possess the entitlement to the city (Marcuse, 2009). The focal point of his emphasis lies in understanding the rights of those who are currently deprived of the right to the city. He specifically highlights the importance of identifying those who are most profoundly impacted by this deprivation, determining the appropriate means of support for them, and comprehending the reasoning for their claims. However, it is evident that there is a little deviation in the discussion from the city's perspective to the issues of gender and marginalized groups, except for Marcuse (2009). In his study on homeless individuals, Marcuse highlights the concept of gendered urban space and its association with the directly oppressed group, emphasizing their cultural plea for the right to the city (Marcuse, 2009).

Lefebvre's concept of the 'right to the city' explores the idea that individuals and social groups should always assert their right to live their lives in urban areas. It emphasizes the importance of not being excluded from these spaces or limited to the outskirts and private areas of the city (Lefebvre et al., 1996). Lefebvre argues that urban residents lack power under the existing neoliberal political framework and emphasizes the need to establish the right to the city at this juncture (Ronneberger, 2008). The concept of the "right to the city" is a political term that highlights the need for a comprehensive approach to addressing the demands for socio-spatial change (Marcuse, 2010). This socio-spatial transformation is perceived as a deliberate political creation with the objective of arranging the residents of underprivileged areas within the metropolis (Zerey Aydıntuğ, 2022). This demand targets individuals or groups who deliberately exclude and isolate certain individuals, as well as other policy frameworks that affect their ability to participate in policy development and representation (Zerey Aydıntuğ, 2022). Therefore, the notion of the right to the city promotes the capacity of individuals to participate in and shape decision-making processes, while emphasizing their entitlement to own deliberately planned urban spaces, both individually and collectively.

Another concept worth noting is Dikeç's (2002) claim that the fundamental principle underlying the right to the city is the right to diversity. According to Dikeç (2002), the right to the city includes not only the right to enter urban areas, but also the right to participate in democratic decision-making and challenge the state's role in shaping political identities and resolving conflicts. The concept is notable not for the rapid spread of official panics, but for its ability to generate voices and political subjectivity within the metropolitan area and its surroundings (Dikeç, 2002).

The right to diversity refers to the right to oppose and, as stated by Lefebvre, “the right not to be forcibly classified into categories determined by necessarily homogenizing forces" (Lefebvre, 1976, p. 35). Aydıntuğ (2022) highlights the crucial significance of incorporating the right to diversity in the pursuit of the right to the urban environment (Zerey Aydıntuğ, 2022). The concept that the right to difference can be attained by resisting based on differences through acts can be elucidated as ideas that highlight both the right to difference and the political dimension of the right to the city and should be considered in conjunction (Lefebvre, 1991).

Massey (1994) underscores the significance of gender consciousness across various dimensions of urban space by analyzing the intricate relationships among space, place, and gender. This illustrates the city's configuration within a gendered framework and how the positioning of marginalized groups, particularly women, in these environments is established. Aydıntuğ (2022) correlates the notion of the right to the city with the right to difference, contending that the city extends beyond public spaces and that a gender-sensitive perspective must encompass the domestic realm as well. Consequently, the right to the city provides a more comprehensive perspective on the influence of gender on spatial experiences.

Beebeejaun (2017) underscores the significance of comprehending the impact of gender on individuals' daily experiences and the influence of various spatial utilizations on these experiences. This viewpoint aligns with Lefebvre's perspective on the city's alienating impact. Lefebvre examined the notion of the right to the city by exploring the alienation faced by individuals lacking the ability to engage in the

development of urban environments. The right to the city entails transformative political potential concerning the interplay of gender, space, and urban engagement. An in-depth analysis of this viewpoint is required for the creation and utilization of facilities for transgender sex workers. The concept of the right to the city has been extensively examined by urban development theorists, particularly those with Marxist and neoliberal perspectives, who have focused on its socio-spatial and economic context. Nevertheless, the aspect of gender and sexual distinctions has not been acknowledged. Below are feminist objections in this context.

2.2.1. Feminist Critique and Rethinking of the Right to the City

When we look at the literature concerning with the right to the city and its gender perspective, we might realize that there is some critique within feminist studies. Especially Fenster (2005) and Beebeejaun (2017) focused on the right to the city and women and queer experiences within the space. The concept of the right to the city proposed by Lefebvre has faced criticism from numerous feminist geographers and researchers. The primary basis for these critiques is that the notion of the right to the city fails to offer a distinct comprehension of the gendered and sexualized aspects of spatialities (Beebeejaun, 2017; Fenster, 2005; Kipfer et al., 2013; Simonsen, 2005). Blum & Nast (1996) state that Lefebvre's theory, despite attempting to separate gendered bodies from conventional family responsibilities, nonetheless relies on the idea that women are the main caretakers and males are associated with activities outside the home (Blum & Nast, 1996). Hence, it is crucial to adopt a comprehensive and expansive viewpoint when understanding the right to the city within a heteropatriarchal context.

While the city does allow some freedom and mobility, marginalized groups do not view it as a fully freeing location due to its limited ability to provide emancipation and anonymity (Beebeejaun, 2017). However, it is commonly seen as a symbol of allure and a dynamic embodiment of vitality. Contemplating the ways in which gendered, and sexuality-oriented behaviors and performances shape the construction and perception of urban spaces prompts inquiries into the relationship between displays of

gender and sexuality and these spaces (Zerey Aydıntuğ, 2022). Conversely, Lefebvre views human life holistically, a perspective that is criticized for disregarding the potential for gender and sexuality to be regarded as "a constructive aspect of individuals' identities" (Beebeejaun, 2017, p. 325). As a result, it has faced criticism for disregarding diverse perspectives of gendered practices and for approaching everyday life from a heteronormative standpoint (Kipfer et al., 2013). Furthermore, it has faced criticism for limiting conversations about the 'right to the city' to the public domain while neglecting the significance of the private domain in women's lives (Fenster, 2005; Zerey Aydıntuğ, 2022).

The authoritarian patriarchal and heterosexist administration seeks to impose restrictions on the behavior of LGBTI+ individuals, preventing them from acting as everyday agents of resistance. The feminist perspective criticizes Lefebvre's concept of the right to the city for its failure to adequately address the patriarchal systems of oppression (Fenster, 2005). From this viewpoint on the right to the city, it is contended that despite progress in addressing gender and sexuality-based inequities and injustices, discrimination against LGBTI+ individuals and women continues to exist in daily urban existence (Beebeejaun, 2017).

In response to this, Fenster (2005) Lefebvre's right to the city specifically indicates the public as a creative by-product of the daily lives of individuals who live there, including the use of public spaces, or public spaces that form "the oeuvre."(Fenster, 2005) However, other feminist critics believe that the "public" oeuvre is a white, middle-class, heterosexual male area and assert that in some societies, urban women are not allowed to roam the streets and parks by themselves. Within this context, she emphasizes that this demonstrates that to completely comprehend the foundations of the limitations on the right to use, we must examine the right to use from both a private and a public perspective. Therefore, the conversation about using public places and having a voice in decisions must start at the household level (Fenster, 2005). In a similar way, Buckingham (2010) defines the right to the city as the right to the city is a communal entitlement that applies to all individuals who reside in, enter, and utilize urban areas (Shelley, 2010). Furthermore, they elucidate the correlation between

gender and space by stating that the societal constructs of gender and location have a direct impact on the daily encounters of women in urban areas. She listed five broad criteria that are linked in this situation. These are, safety in urban environments, public infrastructure and transportation, proximity between housing, services and employment, breaking the dichotomy of public and private domains and participation in decision making, governance and planning. In addition to them, Beebeejaun (2017) contends that common spatial behaviors offer important clues about the inherent gender bias in claims to urban space and the assertion of rights. She stresses that the many temporalities of space are exposed as contentious areas for rights and identity (Beebeejaun, 2017). A complex network of places, identities, and rights to the city can either arise naturally or be contested.

The feminist viewpoint also critiques Lefebvre's concept for its insufficient consideration of patriarchal systems of oppression. The right to the city is a communal entitlement for all individuals who reside in, enter, and utilize the urban environment, and the correlation between gender and physical surroundings significantly influences the daily encounters of women in urban areas. Typical patterns of behavior in physical space provide valuable evidence of the underlying gender bias in the way people claim and assert their rights in urban areas.

Examining the right to the city through a feminist lens reveals that Michel Foucault's notions of power and resistance offer a significant theoretical framework for comprehending this concept. The right to the city is typically characterized as 'access to urban services, involvement in decision-making processes, and the liberty to alter space.' (Lefebvre, 1996; Harvey, 2003; Mitchell, 2003). This definition necessitates re-evaluation in conjunction with Foucault's concepts of discipline and surveillance. It is essential to examine how disciplined 'docile bodies' are cultivated in urban environments through the lens of the panopticon model (Allen, 1999; Bartky, 2020).

The panopticon, a prison design featuring continuous surveillance from a central watchtower, exemplifies the mechanisms of control and discipline over individuals. Foucault asserts that this mechanism extends beyond prisons; power permeates the minutiae of social existence, regulating individuals and compelling self-discipline. The

regulation of one's conduct and the implementation of self- surveillance extend to routine daily activities, particularly concerning the behaviors of marginalized communities, which are subjected to oversight. Trans individuals' preference to forgo high-heeled shoes to avoid disturbing their apartment neighbors and their inclination to dress modestly to evade attention while traversing their neighborhood exemplifies self-surveillance. The assertion of rights and freedoms by marginalized groups often occurs through behaviors that align with societal acceptance, shaped by the power dynamics established by heteropatriarchal norms. In this context, power networks constrict in instances of domination and limit movement within specific social spaces. Urban environments also serve as a battleground for these power dynamics (Foucault, 1980).

Through a feminist critique, it is recognized that Foucault inadequately distinguishes between male and female experiences in his examination of bodies (Bartky, 2020); however, his analysis of the infiltration of disciplinary power into the minutiae of daily life significantly aligns with the feminist principle that 'the personal is political.' (Allen, 1999). Upon reevaluating the right to the city within this framework, it becomes evident that the right to access and engage with urban services constitutes not merely liberty, but also a mechanism for the regulation and governance of space by authority. This situation establishes control mechanisms over individuals, while simultaneously laying the foundation for resistance.

The right to the city can be interpreted as a manifestation of power dynamics and a form of resistance to these dynamics. The right to the city encompasses not only spatial liberty and accessibility but also a dynamic process wherein this liberty is perpetually constrained and redefined by power dynamics. The right to the city is not exempt from power; instead, it serves as a mechanism of resistance intricately connected to it.

The right to the city is a process whereby individuals and communities articulate their identities, assert their demands, and redefine their liberties by opposing spatial constraints and control systems. This conflict entails re-evaluating the entitlement to access urban services, engage in decision-making processes, and exercise control over space. As authorities attempt to restrict or define these rights, individuals and communities actively engage in the transformation of urban life by opposing these

constraints. From this viewpoint, the right to the city cannot be regarded as a realm of freedom detached from power. Conversely, it is a dynamic process that is perpetually reconfigured, wherein power dynamics and oppositions to these dynamics converge.

The utilization and alteration of space are integral to this tension. The right to the city encompasses not merely the allocation of physical spaces, but also a discourse regarding the manner, the agents, and the objectives through which these spaces will be configured. Consequently, the right to the city offers an essential framework for comprehending the freedom aspirations of individuals and the constraints imposed on these aspirations by power.

Given these contributions, I contend that my study broadens the understanding of the concept of the right to the city and explores how gender and sexuality norms are incorporated into urban space from a heteropatriarchal viewpoint. Specifically, I contend that the encounter with urban environments for transgender sex workers is influenced not just by power dynamics and social class, but also by the ways in which heteronormative norms shape spatial behaviors. In the next section, I examine the unequal distribution of the right to the city and the distinct experiences of transgender individuals in urban areas. Transgender individuals, who belong to marginalized groups, experience the right to the city and unequal spatial distribution differently due to the social structure and spatial order influenced by heteronormative norms.

Utilizing Foucault's concept of resistance as an inherent counterpart to power, I examine the inequitable allocation of the right to the city and how transgender individuals, as a marginalized group, contest the spatial dominance exerted by heteronormative structures. Urban environments, organized by surveillance and disciplinary mechanisms, foster exclusion and systemic violence. Nonetheless, these spaces simultaneously transform into venues for resistance, wherein individuals and communities contest spatial hierarchies and affirm their right to exist and flourish.

In the following section, I will be presenting the experiences of transgender individuals, who face systematic violence and exclusion, along with the tactics and strategies that have been developed.

2.3. Exclusion and Transgender Experiences in Heteronormatively Gendered Space

Transgender people's practices are impacted by heterosexual urban environments in a variety of ways, including how they live their everyday lives and pursue their careers. Power control in urban space isolates, restricts, and pushes marginalized groups—homosexual, lesbian, transgender, hippie, etc.—into certain places, as Hubbard and other researchers have highlighted. This chapter aims to shed light on the experiences transgender people have in urban areas and to comprehend their expectations from the city by attempting to comprehend their inclusion, exclusion, methods, and tactics. From this standpoint, the intention is to elucidate the experiences by delineating three fundamental concepts. These are instances of social exclusion, gender oppression, and gender discrimination. Social exclusion, Sibley (1995) frames spatial exclusion in terms of how it alienates the "other" members of society, including women, children, the old, and those with disabilities. Within this system, disparities in gender, sexual orientation, and queer people can all be included. Sibley highlights the spatial exclusion that occurs in everyday routines and asserts that the goal of powerful groups to control and purify space is at the core of this othering (Sibley, 1995).

The marginalization of "other" groups—which are associated with social exclusion—in metropolitan areas can be summed up as geographical exclusion. Because of their sexual orientation, transgender people in this setting are social outcasts and are not included in the moral realm because they are prostitutes. The heterosexual norms and regulations shape the gender-shaped experience of space (Doan, 2010). According to Marques (2019), gendered spaces and times are shaped by social control and accepted discriminatory practices. These spaces and times are designated as "safe," "unsafe," and/or "liminal," where people can exercise their freedom or simply avoid them by being cautious (Marques, 2019). Many transgender people recreate gender representations that emphasize masculine or feminine expressions while hiding their transgender story from others because they believe that "unsafe" places and situations pose threats to their sense of safety.

Transgender people more often adopt masks and compliance during these times and

places in an attempt to recreate their gender representations (Marques, 2019). Doan (2010) stated, drawing on her own experience, that coercive and regulatory practices—the structural components of gender tyranny—are seen in public areas including streets, transportation networks, and elevators. It is believed that crowding in public places draws people closer together than normal and increases gendered susceptibility. Gender tyranny refers to the enforcement of regulatory measures that oppress individuals whose behaviors, presentations, and expressions do not conform to socially accepted gender norms (Doan, 2010).

Social marginalization, coercive tactics, and gender tyranny accompany transsexual experiences. The aforementioned elements that impact daily life also indicate that transgender people face violence and are excluded from several sectors, including industry, services, and the like, which they work in both Turkey and globally (Hubbard & Sanders, 2003; Zengin, 2024). Because of these exclusions, transgender people opt to engage in sex work and face moral rejection in addition to gender norms. By attempting to regulate it through pressure and space processes, the state attempts to suppress or eradicate sex work (Ashworth, 1988; Ellensohn, 2021; Hubbard, 2019).

The term "genderbashing" is defined as instances of gender-based violence that take place in public locations such as streets (Namaste, 2000). She contends that acts of aggression towards sexual minorities and transgender individuals are intrinsically connected to the regulation of gender expression in both public and private domains. Many instances of violence against individuals are driven by the perceived deviation from societal norms regarding sex and gender (Namaste, 2000). However, as stated by Johnston & Longhurst (2009), while not always explicitly sexual, hidden acts of violence and abuse that occur in private are consistently connected to gender and power. According to Johnston and Longhurst (2010), gender and sexuality are considered integral to understanding domestic abuse and violence. From this standpoint, the presence of spaces plays a crucial role in facilitating and allowing for acts of violence against transgender sex workers (Zengin, 2024).

The police have adopted an unconventional stance by utilizing the sex/gender-

transitioned lives and sexual practices of transgender individuals as a justification to implement larger initiatives aimed at transforming and organizing urban areas into spaces that appeal to neoliberal capital, while also adhering to prevailing, cisheteronormative sexual and gender norms and associated moral standards (Zengin, 2024). It is highlighted that laws against sex work are linked to police violence against transgender individuals, and police personnel have significant discretion in determining what qualifies as "solicitation" (Namaste, 2000). Amidst the presence of violence, oppression, and marginalization, transgender individuals create alternative solutions in certain spaces and moments.

Transgender geographies are safe places, including streets, neighborhoods, hotels, centers, and clubs, rather than separate geographic areas. Transgender people are able to live and grow because of these safe environments, where they cultivate strong and creative networks and inventive methods (Zengin, 2024). They employ both social and physical coping mechanisms to deal with the abuse and violence they encounter. Because they are constantly under observation and supervision by law authorities, sex workers try to keep their "working" and "non-working" lives apart by adopting the method of continual mobility. In response to complicated and contradictory moral geographies and socio-spatial regimes, the administration of sex work by diverse organizations has traditionally been both extremely spatially variable and spatially targeted (Hubbard & Sanders, 2003).

Research aimed at urban change and the processes of displacement, which are among the spatial factors and among the most pressing challenges facing sex workers, have been encountered in different forms both globally and in Turkey. Sex workers and transgender people adopted specific tactics and strategies that resulted in their occasional geographical restriction, displacement, and spectator status during the gentrification of the area. The concept of tactics, as developed by De Certeau, has been instrumental in understanding the spatial behaviors of transgender sex workers (Certeau, 1984). De Certeau argues that the narrative of strategies begins at a basic level, specifically with the action of walking. De Certeau (1984) and Lefebvre (1991) contend that everyday life and environments can function as a medium for resistance,

empowering marginalized groups to assert their power and rebel against oppressive entities (Certeau, 1984; Foucault et al., 1988). An important aspect to consider is the analysis of how transgender sex workers' demand and plea for the right to the city, which I endorse in my thesis, serves as a form of opposition or not in their daily routines.

According to De Certeau (1984), the techniques employed by "ordinary individuals" to counter metropolitan strategies arise within urban space. Tactics encompass the strategies, practices, and procedures employed by ordinary folks to build new arrangements, places, and forms of resistance inside established systems. These tactics may involve the development of alternative practices and the utilization of unlawful movement activities. Common individuals do not consistently modify their strategies in a uniform manner, resulting in their visibility being intermittent and sporadic. Within the realm of governmentality and power, in every domain shaped by strategic considerations, he appears to adhere to the established rules and enforce the regulations. Occasionally, it employs subtle tactics to determine what is suitable and adaptable to its own existence (Certeau, 1984). In my research, these tactics can be classified as temporal and spatial. Transgender sex workers primarily engage in their profession from home during the day and typically engage in social activities during the night. Another illustration of a different strategy is when sex workers who operate on the streets gather in clusters and lines to exchange information about law enforcement presence.

Thus, I outline the restricted urban rights of transgender sex workers in terms of their ability to navigate gendered spaces. In the subsequent analysis section, I delve into the specific self-strategies and tactics employed to counteract these limitations. In my view, the restriction of the right to the city is not the only issue at hand. The way individuals interact with urban spaces through various methods and plans also involves asserting and exercising urban rights. From a holistic standpoint, I argue that this approach will improve understanding of the importance of transgender sex workers' presence in society and the fair distribution of urban rights. Moreover, the strategies formulated in everyday life will shed light on the examination of the assertion and

promotion of the right to the city.

2.4. Trans Lives in Turkey

Studies on transgender individuals in Turkey uncover a multifaceted and difficult environment. Engin (2015) emphasizes the widespread prejudice and aggression experienced by transgender individuals, particularly in relation to employment, housing, and healthcare (Engin, 2015). In her study, Selin Berghan (2007) investigates how social, political, and economic factors influence the development of transsexual identity (Berghan, 2007).

Significant research has been conducted on the daily experiences of the trans community in Istanbul and the impact of violence on political and personal identities (Zengin, 2014; Zengin, 2024). In Turkey, sex and gender norms are notably inflexible, and their impact on transgender individuals constitutes a primary source of conflict and discrimination. Zengin (2024) examined the challenges trans individuals face regarding oppressive social regulations and their strategies for navigating these conflicts in everyday life. He particularly emphasizes the functioning of power technologies and legislation in this process. Zengin underscores that significant deficiencies exist in safeguarding the rights of transgender individuals due to omissions and ambiguities in Turkey's legal framework.

Despite the technical illegality of sex work in Turkey, it is partially permitted through various avenues, including street prostitution, online platforms, and brothels (Zengin, 2024). Following the election of the conservative Justice and Development Party (AKP) in 2001, policy makers and government officials have undergone a shift in their perspectives regarding the regulation of sex work and brothels. Consequently, there has been a significant increase in the level of state regulation pertaining to sex work. Due to the prohibition of extramarital sex in Islam, contemporary legislators perceive sex work as morally reprehensible and improper conduct. Hence, policymakers frequently depict sex workers as subverting conventional family values and societal norms (Engin, 2018). From this standpoint, additional laws that directly pertain to street sex workers and impact their occupation are Articles 227 and 80 of the 2005

Turkish Penal Code regarding sex work.[15] These actions are assessed within the category of "Crimes against General Morality" and encompass activities such as promoting the involvement of children and individuals in sex work (Kilislioğlu, 2020; Taşcıoğlu, 2021). Conversely, Law No. 5326 on Misdemeanors, as stated in its initial article, is a legislation designed to safeguard public order, public morality, public health, the environment, and economic stability. According to Article 32, individuals may be fined for engaging in actions that go against public order. Article 32 states that individuals who disobey the orders given by the competent authorities, as mandated by the law for judicial proceedings or to safeguard public security, public order, or public health, will be subject to an administrative fine of one hundred Turkish Liras.[16] The determination of this penalty will be made by the governing body that issued the directive.

The Misdemeanors Law is not the only new legislative statute utilized in the treatment of trans women. An additional kind of governance that aims to regulate trans women's public appearance is revealed by the growing number of court cases and the judicial branch's consequent expansion (Taşcıoğlu, 2021).

Although transgender sex workers are not legally protected in Turkey, they may still face legal surprises, fines, and harassment due to various legislation. Different fines might be assessed and imposed under the Highway Traffic Law No. 2918 of 1983 and the Law on Police Positions and Duties. It can be obtained from the eye page of persons in pedestrian zones who are used disrespectfully by the police, as per the laws in the chapter 4 and article 68 of the 2918 Highway Traffic Law, under the part titled "Rules to be Followed by Pedestrians."[17] Pedestrians are not allowed to obstruct or endanger the cables on pedestrian paths, transitions, or the carriageway. They must also refrain

[15] The section on sex work begins with Article 227. The section after Article 80 covers trafficking in human. Retrieved from https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/mevzuatmetin/1.5.5237.pdf in 5 January 2024
[16] Law on Misdemeanours was accessed from https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/1.5.5326.pdf on 5 January 2024. "Madde 32 - (1) Yetkili makamlar tarafından adlî işlemler nedeniyle ya da kamu güvenliği, kamu düzeni veya genel sağlığın korunması amacıyla, hukuka uygun olarak verilen emre aykırı hareket eden kişiye yüz Türk Lirası idarî para cezası verilir. Bu cezaya emri veren makam tarafından karar verilir."
[17] Retrieved from https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/mevzuatmetin/1.5.2918.pdf accessed 2 February 2024

from using these areas disrespectfully (Kilislioğlu, 2020; Taşcıoğlu, 2021).

As per the Law on Police Duties and Powers, penalties can be imposed by police and police officers. The amendment that was made allows the police to punish someone "in order to prevent the commission of a crime or misdemeanor" and "to prevent an existing or potential danger to the life, integrity of the body or property of persons or to society." The power to detain and arrest individuals based on "suspicion" has been granted under Article 11, however it is no longer necessary to obtain a judge's order or the subjects' consent in order for police to search people, cars, and personal property.[18] In this particular setting, there exists a chance that the custom of police forces regarding the presence of prostitutes and people waiting for clients on the street could be interpreted as a non-criminal activity (CETAD, 2007; Kilislioğlu, 2020; Taşcıoğlu, 2011). The legislation governing the Duties and Powers of the Police has been revised to enhance police authority in regulating and intervening in public areas, especially concerning marginalized populations such as transgender women and sex workers. Despite being frequently regarded as non-criminal entities, interventions by law enforcement may exert pressure on these groups, heightening the likelihood of criminal sanctions.

Most studies have focused on the political and social dimensions of violence, exclusion, legal processes, and everyday practices. While there is a growing body of research on transgender life and sex work, these studies have not explored the demands of trans women sex workers for the right to the city and the specific contexts in which this right is distributed among different groups. Existing studies often depict trans women sex workers in a "survival sex" situation and as victims, without adopting a sex-positive approach. However, when examining the geographies of sex, it would be beneficial to consider alternative perspectives on the spatial practices of trans women sex workers. This involves questioning the rights that urban spaces afford to the body

[18] "Madde 11 C) (Değişik: 3/8/2002-4771/10 md.) Genel ahlâk ve edebe aykırı mahiyette her türlü sesli ve görüntülü eserleri, kaydedildiği materyale bakılmaksızın üreten ve satanları,
Herhangi bir müracaat veya şikayet olmasa bile engeller, davranışlarının devamını durdurarak yasaklar, sanıklar hakkında tanzim olunacak evrakı derhal şikayete bağlı suçlar hakkındaki evrakı da şikayet ve müracaat vukubulduğu takdirde adliyeye tevdi eder." Retrieved from https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/mevzuatmetin/1.3.2559.pdf

and the restrictions they impose on bodily movement, as well as the rights that bodies expect and demand from these spaces.

I contend that the lives referred to as "invisible lives," which are intentionally overlooked in all research and systematically made inconspicuous by the system, have a legitimate right to the city. I contend that the spaces in which they are unseen, vulnerable to violence, and typically marginalized can provide an opportunity for them to assert their presence in the fight for urban rights. In other words, the power of these spaces can be harnessed to defend their rights, even if it involves displacement. I also assert that the feeling of belonging in the relationship formed with physical space and its associated activities possesses an inherent quality that promotes inclusivity rather than exclusivity.

Research conducted on transgender individuals in Turkey has uncovered a multifaceted and difficult environment characterized by prejudice, aggression, and negative family attitudes, which serve as the primary barriers to their well-being. The complex issues of violence, exclusion, legal processes, and daily practices within this challenging environment have been examined. Spatial analyses can reveal an additional dimension of the systematic violence and exclusion experienced. The oppressive authority, through social and political decisions, perceives transgender communities as a group that requires purification due to their gender identities and involvement in sex work, thereby influencing the urban space.

Trans women in Ankara, especially during the Eryaman-Esat cases, are asserting their right to the city, a concept grounded in Henri Lefebvre's idea of access to urban resources and the capacity to influence and redefine spaces. Their struggle originates from opposing socio-spatial exclusions enforced by neoliberal urban policies and patriarchal standards. The exclusion of transgender women from Eryaman and other urban areas signifies the denial of their right to fully engage in urban life. Their unified resistance, partnerships with human rights and women's organizations, and reclamation of spaces in Ankara signify a call for urban justice.

Seeing the importance of organized struggle, trans people became more politicized and

tried to make their voices heard through street protests. They also tried to mobilize other associations working in the field of human rights and women's organizations and went to their doors. Therefore, an area of contact and alliance was formed. From this point of view, the experience of trans women with the Eryaman-Esat cases is an experience of political demand based on space, violence and resistance by acting together. The expulsion of property-owning trans women from Eryaman did not bring spatial security of property. Neoliberal urban policies and rent-oriented urban development are based on gender, sexuality, ethnicity, ethnicity, religious affiliation and socio-economic class, which define and change the right to capital accumulation and housing. Therefore, trans women's material assets did not bring any security as their position in the hierarchy of social morality did not bring any security as they did not have "moral" behaviors and did not comply with the norms.

As stated by lawyer Doğanoğlu, the discourse of Göksu Mukhtar that "Eryaman has been cleansed of transvestites" is the way Eryaman events are perceived by society.[19] On the other hand, this process not only spatially excluded the A team and gang violence, sexualities, and gender identities but also led to the development of capital transformation and accumulation strategies established through space (Zengin, 2014). Displacement has turned into a process involving the unity of the A team, gangs, and other social actors. Social actors, from the mukhtars stated earlier and local administrations to law enforcement officers, have severe consequences of exclusion and breaking the resistance.

The right to the city is not fairly distributed as experienced by transgender individuals living in Ankara, as in many other cities, and is regulated primarily for economic and political reasons involved in the production process of space. Ankara, the capital of Turkey and the second largest and most populous city, is a place where the effects of neoliberal policies such as gentrification and cleansing projects are strongly felt. The 2011 demolition of the brothel and the Esat-Eryaman incidents exemplify significant acts of resistance against this forced relocation. Aside from those who relocated to

[19] Atty. Senem Doğanoğlu, Esat-Eryaman Case's lawyer, personal interview, 16 January 2024

other cities following the Esat-Eryaman incidents, Ankara has significant urban insights regarding the examination of the impact of trans women who migrated to the Çankaya region as a cohesive community, as well as the evidence of unity, solidarity, and resilience present here. It is not distributed fairly to LGBTI individuals, minority groups, disabled and immigrants, and women. The right to the city, which cannot be shared relatively, is shared unequally to bodies and various social groups in terms of sexuality and gender identity. In addition to neoliberal policies, the city is shaped by heteronormative and patriarchal rules, ethnic identity and gender, excluding various groups from the right to the city and various spaces.

CHAPTER 3

3.METHOD

This study examines the challenges faced by trans sex workers in Ankara in their quest for urban rights, emphasizing their spatial practices and methods of resistance. It critiques the right to the city from a feminist viewpoint, contending that it inadequately considers patriarchal power dynamics. I contend that the right to the city, particularly concerning sex work and gender-based power dynamics, must be analyzed through the lens of individuals' homes and daily lives—private spaces that underscore security, visibility, and a sense of belonging. The research methodology underscores the significance of examining the right to the city through an inclusive perspective, concentrating on gendered practices and experiences within urban environments. It employs qualitative methodologies such as interviews and participatory observations to emphasize voices and perspectives. In addition, the right to the city is considered as a right where everyone can use urban space safely, have safe and equal access to services, participate in decision-making processes and overcome the public-private divide. In addition, this study, which considers a strong urban mobility centered on belonging and emancipation as a part of the right to the city, explores trans women's struggle for the right to the city in all areas of life.

The objective is to demonstrate that the right to the city encompasses the struggles and resistances faced by those who are marginalized and rendered invisible. The study also emphasizes the beneficial elements of the right to the city, including the narrative of 'this is already my city' and the feeling of belonging to the urban environment. The research highlights that the marginalized community, facing violence due to gender identity and occupations, devises methods to assimilate into the city through their daily life strategies.

From a feminist perspective, to understand the experiences of trans women sex workers within the power relations and heteronormative construct, my methodological approach is based on one-to-one in-depth interviews with the walking method and thematic analysis. Within this context, the act of walking facilitated the expression of previously unshared perspectives, enhanced by spatial memory and post-interview recollections, thereby fostering a more authentic and genuine interview experience. The walk and research provide an opportunity to observe and listen to the tactics and struggle mechanisms developed against power relations, as well as gaining an understanding of the limited areas of the right to the city. Consequently, when working with marginalized groups like trans women, the walking method has become increasingly important in comprehending and envisioning their relationship with space.

The walking method facilitated the emergence of previously unarticulated or unacknowledged spatial experiences. During their walk, participants can rejuvenate their spatial memories by recalling past experiences, thereby facilitating a more authentic, natural, and genuine interview process. It facilitated the identification of the specific areas in the city where issues such as violence, insecurity, and social exclusion are most acutely experienced by trans women sex workers, as well as the strategies they employ to navigate these challenges.

In my study, I conducted one-on-one interviews with 12 transgender sex workers in order to understand transgender sex workers' struggle for the right to the city and their spatial practices. For one-on-one in-depth interviews, the method of walking was used and interviews were conducted in a place of their choice with the participants who did not prefer to walk. Only 7 of the participants agreed to take a walk in an urban space. The other 5 participants stated that they were afraid of public visibility in urban areas; more specifically, they did not want to participate in these marches due to the anxiety caused by the possibility that their relatives or acquaintances might see them on the street.

This situation reveals the extent of the feeling of insecurity and social pressures trans sex workers face in urban spaces. The pressure created by the family and social

environment limits their opportunities to express themselves in the public sphere. For this reason, the rest of the interviews were conducted in private spaces where the participants felt safer. One of these places was the Red Umbrella Association, which is a space where trans individuals feel safe and find support. In other cases, in line with the requests of the participants, the interviews were organized in their own homes, providing a safer, more intimate environment.

This approach supported a more open and sincere dialogue during the interviews and enabled the participants to share their experiences in a more detailed and sincere manner. The choice of safe places increased the quality of the study and contributed to a more comprehensive understanding of the experiences of trans sex workers in the context of the right to the city.

Comprehensive interviews were performed in secure environments, such as the Red Umbrella Association, to collect participants' experiences and sentiments. The secure environment facilitated more comprehensive and emotive discussions regarding discrimination, violence, and resistance strategies. The participants' individual experiences and requests for urban rights were also examined. The qualitative analysis demonstrated a direct correlation between the level of trust and the intensity of the narratives. In secure environments, participants articulated their strategies for combating discrimination, experiences of isolation, and the significance of solidarity. This offered an expanded viewpoint on the demands of trans sex workers for urban rights and reinforced the connection between personal safety and these urban rights demands.

3.1. An alliance between critical feminist research and the emerging field of transgender theory

In this chapter, I will make a comparison between critical feminist research and transgender theory, discussing why the concept of transfeminism has an important place in understanding intersectional identities and why a grounding in power relations is essential for feminist research. According to Jagose (2009), Harding (1991), and

Ramazanoğlu and Holland (2002), feminist research aspires to alter and emancipate women's experiences and opinions. According to Ramazanoğlu and Holland (2002), essential concepts of feminist research are reflexivity, accessibility, and ethics. Several feminist perspectives reveal layers of sexist, racist, homophobic, and imperialist views (Hesse-Biber, 2011). My methodological approach focuses on transfeminist research concepts. Transfeminism, a branch of feminism that focuses on the experiences and rights of transgender people, can be characterized as feminist perspectives on transgender issues (Bettcher, 2017; Serano, 2013). It has strong ties to queer theory, intersectionality, postmodern/poststructuralist feminism, and sex-positive feminism, among other feminist sub-movements. These strands of feminism signify a shift away from viewing sexism as a simplistic, unilateral form of oppression in which men are the oppressors and women are the victims (Serano, 2013). In the words of Koyama (2002), "Transfeminism challenges all women, including trans women, to examine how we all internalize heterosexist and patriarchal mandates of genders and what global implications our actions entail" (Koyama, 2003).

Within these distinctive perspectives, transgenderism presents unique challenges to both feminist and queer theories. It would be problematic for a feminist theoretical approach to transgenderism to maintain an essentialist understanding of gender (Nagoshi & Brzuzy, 2010). As Heyes (2003) noted, an essentialist perspective like this would treat one's body as a stand-in for identity, treating male-to-female (MTF) transgender people as having given up their male privilege but treating female-to-male (FTM) transgender people as traitors to their oppressed identities. Problematization would also extend to the social and psychological implications of being able to alter one's physique concerning gender. Heyes observed that a large number of MTF transgender individuals are claiming their right to change medical criteria and rejecting specific medical operations as ways to express their own political and feminist consciousness. (Heyes, 2003). As a critique of queer theory, transgender theory is more than an either/or conceptualization that acknowledges the fluidity of gender identity but still maintains the gender binary. As per Roen's analysis (2001), transgenderism encompasses not only a notion of "both/neither" that is distinct from the male/female binary, but also a movement away from the bodily shift between gender categories (Roen, 2013).

Understanding intersectional oppressed identities can help us understand the transgender theory's concept of fluid, embodied, socially, and self-constructed social identity. This strategy for intersectional oppressed identities would consider the various embodied experiences and social oppressions that come with having multiple social identities and the lived experience narratives that people use to comprehend and negotiate these identities (Nagoshi & Brzuzy, 2010). In response to Elliot's (2009) emphasis on the links between feminist and queer concepts of gender, bodies, and sexuality, I can ask what trans studies means for transgender thought today (Elliot, 2009).

Johnson (2015) suggested a new standard for conducting sociological research. Johnson contends that while examining sociological aspects of transgender individuals, an approach to methodology that questions certain status quo practices that encourage the marginalization of specific minority communities is required (Johnson, 2015). They recognized three critical components of the transgenderism methodology: perspective, reflexivity, and avoiding analytical traps that perpetuate sexism—feminist research principles, defined by Harding (2007), four things. Johnson (2015) adapted Harding's (2007) four conditions for doing research from a feminist perspective as a transgender perspective. According to Harding (2007), these are linking institutional power to gendered knowledge claims, using previous feminist work, offering suggestions for future feminist work as a starting point, and serving as a tool for activists working for oppressed groups (Harding, 1991). From a transfeminist standpoint, research should question cissexist knowledge claims, challenge transgender power structures, and be pertinent to the goal of transgender equality. It should also engage with prior transgender academic work.

Researcher reflexivity—the recognition of unequal power relations within the research process, the questioning of objectivity, and the examination of the researcher's motivation—is linked to the emergence of a transfeminist perspective (Johnson, 2015). To enhance reflexivity, Johnson (2015) added that transfeminist scholars should be reflective not only about their authority and power structures but also about why they choose to investigate the experiences and lives of transgender individuals. Lastly, to avoid analytical cissexist errors, refusing to apply hegemonic gender ideologies or points of view to research the gender experiences of minorities is not a novel approach.

"Cissexist double standards" emphasize the distinctiveness of transgender experiences while maintaining the conventional nature of cisgender experiences. These standards regulate and control transgender identities and experiences, as individuals frequently attribute subjective interpretations and evaluations to different gendered and sexual bodies and behaviors (Serano, 2013). Therefore, standards extend from the utilization of urban space to daily activities, once again enabling trans women to be perceived as ciswomen. Furthermore, trans women assert that the closer they resemble ciswomen, the fewer challenges and instances of prejudice they encounter. From this perspective, the actions associated with sexual bodies can be influenced by the perception in everyday activities. An advantage of collaborating with trans women sex workers as ciswomen is that it offers a different perspective, allowing for an examination of subjective interpretations and evaluations from an external standpoint, despite the limitation of excluding cissexist experiences. Due to the perception of separation caused by cissexism, trans women may initially reject the sincere and open narrative that emphasizes their shared humanity with others. Nevertheless, transgender women strive to express themselves candidly during interviews, given the researcher's (the association's) credibility as a reliable source.

On the other hand, Billard et al. (2022) emphasize that advocates for reimagining transgender studies beyond traditional disciplinary boundaries, embracing trans-disciplinary perspectives, addressing epistemic injustices, and exploring the intersections between transgender studies and other fields. By promoting a more inclusive and applied approach to transgender studies, the field can better navigate the complexities of gender identity and contribute to social justice and equity. Additionally, they proposed a post-discipline of transgender studies that is multi-theoretical and multi-methodological, allowing for the intellectual pluralism and analytical flexibility necessary for trans studies to become critical in addressing global issues (Billard et al., 2022).

Following Johnson's (2015) recommendations for transgender researchers, I aim to elucidate both my research power dynamics and the rationale behind my decision to investigate the experiences and livelihoods of transgender individuals. As a cisgender woman, I believe it is crucial to incorporate personal experiences into the research methodology within the framework of feminist critical research. In my interviews with

transgender sex workers, I investigate experiences that I do not personally possess, yet I engage in this endeavor as an act of solidarity. My research aims to amplify the voices and rights of transgender individuals, rather than adopting the viewpoint of an anthropologist examining an unfamiliar culture. This research emphasizes honoring their experiences, cultivating a truth-based comprehension, and disseminating this understanding to facilitate social transformation.

Solidarity entails acknowledging disparities, interrogating inequities, identifying shared interests, and cultivating empathy. Despite varying experiences and viewpoints, it is feasible to reconcile these disparities and uphold an ethical position. Research ethics are essential in this methodology, preventing the instrumentalization or marginalization of transgender individuals. The objective is to prioritize their voices and perspectives without misrepresenting the truth or exploiting their experiences for scholarly purposes. The author, cognizant of power dynamics and situated as a researcher, learns and advocates in solidarity, acknowledging the significance of comprehending and honoring the distinct experiences of transgender individuals.

Considering this perspective, conducting research on transgender women who engage in sex work and writing a thesis has prompted significant contemplation. However, I made it clear that I also encounter the moral aspects of different locations in a physical manner. Furthermore, I highlighted that everyone has their own unique experiences and perceptions, which in turn can lead to the alteration of the surrounding environment. The experience of marginalization is much more intense especially in patriarchal, Islamist and oppressive societies like ours. In a society that stigmatizes and condemns sexuality, I aimed to investigate the perceptions of space and memories of trans women who work as sex workers through the interviews I conducted. My aim was to create a work of fiction that reflects the stories of two real people by revealing these experiences in a fair, inclusive and non-oppressive environment.

Within my research role, I have adopted a viewpoint that integrates transgender feminist principles to critically examine cissexist claims, challenge transgender power structures, and advocate for transgender equality. This approach aims to enhance the comprehensiveness of social science research. Hence, I contend that feminism extends beyond the concept of sexism to acknowledge various types of oppression and

illuminate their interconnectedness. However, I believe that the examination of trans and intersex experiences in feminist theory can give rise to specific concerns (Bettcher, 2009). Transgender and intersex identities are not solely feminist concerns, but rather they represent "political stances" that expose unique types of subjugation and defiance. This highlights the fact that oppression based on sex and gender cannot be simplified to just sexism. By giving priority to the experiences of trans and intersex individuals, I contend that I can effectively tackle significant issues pertaining to the intricate types of discrimination encountered by women, intersex individuals, and transgender/transsexual individuals (Bettcher, 2009). As Johnson (2015) highlights, when applying the three essential elements of feminism to transgender research, it is important to scrutinize cissexist knowledge assertions, confront transgender power hierarchies, and strive for transgender equality.

The cissexist perspective applies society's gender roles and standards in a way that influences various studies and phenomena. Considering the criticism of queer theory, I maintain that transfeminism is a form of feminism that recognizes and advocates for the presence of diverse gender identities and sexual orientations, while also acknowledging the hierarchical power dynamics of patriarchy. Thus, my feminism encompasses all individuals, regardless of their biologically or socially constructed genders and bodies, who are impacted by patriarchal power dynamics, whether directly or indirectly. This can also be referred to as trans feminism, which is a subset of feminism. In the remainder of my thesis, I will use the term "feminism" to refer to the concept I am discussing. However, I will also incorporate the critique of transfeminism within this framework, which focuses on power dynamics and acknowledges the inclusion of binary gender norms as a prominent aspect.

Despite some crucial differences, there is potential for collaboration and mutual enrichment between the two fields. When deciding on the methodology and epistemology for my research, I considered which research frameworks transgender workers' life experiences refer to empowerment and help to evaluate power relations, duality, and normativity. As I previously stated, the context of transgender individuals' experiences prioritizes comprehension of lived experiences with the stand of cissexist heteronormativity and fixed gender categories. Sex workers' experiences, on the other hand, can be interpreted in terms of power dynamics, politics, and heteronormative

standards using feminist research methods.

The walking method and in-depth interview, discussed in the subsequent section, integrate the trust-building principles emphasized in feminist research with transgender theory's insights on social and spatial exclusion. Participants' narratives regarding urban challenges within their residences, or their strategies for managing discrimination in secure environments like the Red Umbrella Association and their homes, illustrate the convergence of these two theoretical domains on resistance, social identity, and spatial dynamics. This analysis illustrates how feminist methodology and transgender theory, in conjunction, reveal that the processes of freedom of expression and empowerment afforded by a safe space enhance a more inclusive and critical assessment of assertions regarding the right to the city.

3.2. Walking Interview as a Biographical Method (WIBM)

Within the scope of the relationship between urban space and sex workers' experiences, the semi-structured interviews will be conducted using the walking interview as a biographical method (WIBM). Since walking is a participatory research method that has long been used with marginalized populations, O'Neill and Roberts (2019) point out that this is a novel approach to eliciting knowledge. Walking research fosters a common understanding and point of view that enables cooperative knowledge generation by feminist epistemologies (Murphy, 2022; O'Neill & Roberts, 2019).

Academic study has long focused on walking as a social practice, examining three dimensions of this most fundamental of human activities: the walk as an event, the walker as a human person, and walking as an embodied act (Lorimer, 2016). When people walk together, they can experience varying intimacy and association with sights, sounds, tastes, and smells (Bates & Rhys-Taylor, 2017; Tilley, 2012). Walking also fosters more observation, prompts new questions about the environment, and promotes multimodal thinking. According to Collie (2013), myths, memories, and dreams help cities retain relevance and livability. Such recollections are virtually invariably path- and place-bound (Collie, 2013). Everything is always there and in motion, having thresholds, boundaries, and transitions to other locations along paths. A stroll not only collects and mediates places and their material properties, like the

weather, along its course, but it also includes events, things that happen, and social encounters with people, plants, and animals (Tilley, 2012). Another emphasis on the walking method is its proximity to mobility within the social sciences, which refers to a mobile subject to understand an ever-changing social world (O'Neill & Roberts, 2019).

Both the researcher and the subject share the same sights, sounds, and textures when walking and conducting an interview. In accordance with Wright Mills' sociological imagination theory (1959), taking a participant on a walkthrough of their social surroundings enables one to consider the individual within their situation. Furthermore, it can facilitate a thorough comprehension of the individual story concerning their historical and geographic background (O'Neill & Roberts, 2019).

Consequently, it offers a chance to upset the hierarchical structure of a face-to-face, organized interview, which can occasionally feel like an interrogation. Murphy (2022) states that this attempt to balance power hierarchies in research methodologies is a feminist epistemology, and we integrate the feminist perspective by participating in the discourse (Murphy, 2022). We also walk inside our conceptions of place and space: social ties that are 'theorized' 'through relations of class, race, gender, and other categories give rise to the organization and meaning of place and space (Massey, 1994). Walking is a daily practice in the lives of sex workers, particularly street sex workers, as well as connected organizations and communities. Walking, on the other hand, is used to advocate for an end to violence, harm, and criminalization of sex workers (O'Neill & Roberts, 2019). With this method, I want to look at the claim of the right to the city, the meaning of the space, and the sensuality of space. Also, it will be a great opportunity for me to observe the relationship between space and participants' behavior.

3.3. Thematic Analysis

In the following step analyzing process, thematic analysis is commonly used in qualitative data collection. Thematic analysis is a method that is used to identify, analyze, and interpret patterns of meaning ('themes)' within the qualitative data (Clarke

& Braun, 2017). Thematic analysis offers a tool and technique not constrained by theoretical commitments. Researchers take an active role and flexibility in the thematic analysis process (Clarke & Braun, 2017). Researchers use thematic analysis to compare data points that are assumed to be part of a given topic to determine the feature that connects those points. Following the categorization (labelling) of as many relevant themes as possible, these occurrences or examples within the theme were compared. The goal is to create a succession of coherent themes and the attributes that go with them, as evidenced by sub-themes, that may be used to convey a story (Tuckett, 2005).

Following the interviews, the transcription of the audio recordings was completed. The audio recordings of each interviewee were recorded and analyzed by creating themes with MAXQDA 24 qualitative analysis software. The themes were formed according to the sub-themes shaped around the main questions posed to the interviewees. Prominent themes are given as a separate subcategory.

3.4. Ethics in Research on Sex Work Studies

Research on sex workers should follow the procedures for developing a research or study topic, choosing a research method, gathering data, analyzing data, and publishing findings, according to a paper published by The Sex Workers Project of the Urban Justice Center titled "Research Guide: Conducting Ethical Research on the Sex Trades." His guidance places a strong emphasis on choosing a research methodology that is led by sex workers and uses participatory action research techniques to use the findings to improve the community. This advice also includes considering sample and statistical issues, getting ethical permission, offering a range of jobs to sex workers or groups run by them, and coming up with plans for protecting the anonymity of sex workers (Urban Justice Center, 2023, p7-8). In this research, only the researcher (me) will be holding the meeting because of the secure personal details of sex workers and to ensure the anonymity of sex workers. Also, identifying safe and comfortable interview locations will be determined transparently with the participants (Urban Justice Center, 2023, p9).

On the other hand, the research on sex work raises specific ethical questions.

Population and sample research on sex workers is challenging, according to Wahab and Sloan (2004), because of the shame, illegality, and other factors that make it practically hard to collect a random sample (Shaver, 2005; Wahab & Sloan, 2004). It is quite challenging to obtain a representative sample when utilizing standard sampling techniques like snowballing samples, which are prone to favor the more cooperative individuals (Shaver, 2005). Other obstacles on that subject include discrimination based on gender and class. Studies have primarily focused on middle-class, readily available heterosexual sex workers. The other issue is the representation of sex workers as criminals, deviants, or victims, and they are portrayed as a homogenous group. They also underline that social science research does not adequately represent the range of perspectives on the lived experiences of sex workers (Shaver, 2005; Wahab & Sloan, 2004). Shaver (2005) asserts that to combat this trend, tactics that boost the likelihood of exposing variety both inside and across industry sectors must be developed (Shaver, 2005). The final challenge is that they consider privacy and confidentiality to be of supreme importance because of their stigmatized or illegal lives. They may, therefore, tend to provide unreliable responses to ensure that their privacy is protected. It could invalidate the data (Shaver, 2005).

3.5. Research Design and Procedure

Within the scope of the research question and literature, my research has two steps. The first step relates to understanding the spaces of sex work in Ankara and its historical background. Ankara's spatial history of sex workers will be covered by the NGO which works and advocates as an activist with sex workers.[20] I plan to meet with them to explore Ankara's sex workspaces, its transformation after the Eryaman- Esat case (2006-202-). To better understand the displacement of sex workers, the organizations that advocate for sex workers will conduct interviews with their lawyers and coordinators.

For the study case, Ankara has several excellent examples of claiming a right to the

[20] Authorized person A& Authorized person B, Red Umbrella Sexual Health and Human Rights Association's Legal Advisor & Sexual and Reproductive Health Programme Officer, personal interview, 19 February 2024 and Authorized person C, Pink Life LGBTI+ Solidarity Association's General Coordinator, personal interview, 26 January 2024

city, particularly the lived experiences of sex workers. I opted to study in Ankara because it is Turkey's second-largest city and has a fascinating history of moral spaces of sex. One of the most critical displacement processes with the concept of gentrification of the city, also known as the Esat-Eryaman case in 2006, expressed itself forcefully in the life of sex workers. When a luxurious residence was being built in Eryaman, gangs forcibly relocated the sex workers who were living and working there. Once they relocated to Esat, sex workers were still the targets of intimidation and abuse. In this case, the hunt for justice has continued for the past eighteen years. Given these instances, sex workers are seeking their right to live in the city. In keeping with the concept, I believe it is an alternative viewpoint on housing, activism, culture, way of life, and safety. In my opinion, it is helpful to comprehend the methods by which sex workers demand their access to the city and assert that right.

Because the literature indicates a bias in the theoretical perspective on sex work research, I chose my research sample to be inclusive and diverse. As a result, I aim to contact multiple sex work locations (street, escort, brothel, etc.). I contend that while urban space can impact sex workers differently, they can also alter space through overlapping experiences and in ways that are comparable to each other. I planned to reach out to sex workers through my network and by contacting NGOs (Kırmızı Şemsiye) that work regularly and specifically in this field. After the approval of the ethics commission, I contacted the NGOs and first interviewed the relevant people. I contacted the sex workers and asked them if they would like to walk and talk. I added that they could choose the area or region they wanted to walk for only 15-20 minutes due to the winter season, and then I offered them to sit in a café of their choice. The opening questions I asked were consistent across all interviews, but the flow of each interview differed depending on the length and depth of the participants' responses. Depending on the participants' responses, I asked further questions or emphasized some points that I considered were significant for gathering in-depth information. The interviews lasted between 35 and 70 minutes, depending on the flow of the talk.

During the interviews, walking was done with many interviewees. The observations about the walk are shared in the related section and the walking method provided the opportunity to observe and share the relationship trans women sex workers establish

with the space, their spatial memories and the way they use the space. In addition to this, the interviewees felt more comfortable while walking, and more inclusive and broad answers were given by increasing sharing and sincerity.

On the other hand, I believe that the interviewees' approach to me may be initially a bit restrained because of my identity as a cis woman and my visibility within the binary gender system. I can say, though, that the walking technique I employed resulted in a more genuine and pleasant interview for the participants. Because of this, I believe that our stance and ethical standards are crucial when collaborating with people of various gender identities. For many trans women, for example, interviewing with a cis woman while out for a walk may spark their curiosity and interest, and even just going on a street they enjoy together may boost their level of trust in the researcher.

In other words, I believe that the walking method should be used more in subjects such as urban existence, spatial relationship, spatial memory. Although it is emphasized that the observations of the researcher who is present as an observer during the walk can be personal, I believe that it is a method that should be used more especially in spatial studies. According to my experience, we cannot understand what the space makes possible in the individual's thought only in a closed space. In fact, it is important to take a walk-in one-to-one interview, especially if this area is chosen by the interviewer, both to give information about the person's choice of that place and to remember the visibility of the researcher by passing through familiar and recognizable streets. As Certeau emphasizes, walking emphasizes the importance of interpreting individuals' encounters with space and time in understanding urban space. Therefore, I think that walking is very useful when it comes to grasping the space we want to understand.

However, I would like to draw attention to a few of the walking method's shortcomings that I included in my methodology. However, when the group being worked with is a marginalized group, there may be some limitations to marching as trans women sex workers. These can be said that trans women who do not want to be visible do not want to march with someone on the street, hesitate to march, and are worried that other people will see them. In such a case, significant results that will affect the outputs of the study can be obtained.

The main reason why I wanted to conduct my interviews with the walking method was to walk on a street of their choice to support the sincere and sharing relationship I wanted to establish with my interviewees. Therefore, it is very interesting what the individual will convey and perhaps limit while interviewing a stranger she meets for the first time in an area where she feels comfortable. On the other hand, having a trans identity and doing sex work, although they are exposed to spatial exclusion, whether they will choose to walk and in which area they will want to walk are also important outputs for me. By prioritizing mobility, particularly walking, one can gain a different and smoother understanding of urban space. The understanding of daily life can facilitate a more thorough analysis of people's spatial and temporal encounters in the urban environment (Beebeejaun, 2017). De Certeau highlights that places and spaces are incomplete representations that can temporarily take control of environments and infuse them with their own meaning by evoking memories and emotions in those who walk through them (Certeau, 1984).

Hence, I contend that the walking methodology holds significant importance and distinctiveness within my thesis. I will elucidate this by citing two instances that specifically captivated my interest during the stroll. Initially, I noticed that certain individuals I interviewed expressed a preference for residing in a vicinity near their residences or locations they frequently visit for walking. While strolling through these areas, they cordially greeted and introduced themselves to the neighbors and shopkeepers they came across. They explained that they were embraced by the community and that this acceptance was directly linked to their own self-monitoring. Conversely, another interviewee expressed a preference for the stores she regularly visited and made purchases from during the walk. She emphasized her close relationship with the store employees. Once again, it was reiterated that the focus was on the areas favored by self-monitoring and the individual's issues pertaining to their own conduct.

Initially, one of the interviewees commenced the interview indoors because of the prevailing weather conditions, but subsequently decided to take a stroll. During indoor conversations, she displayed a noticeable emotional detachment and responded with concise and articulate statements, such as: "Although we identify as transgender, there

are no inherent differences that set us apart from other individuals and their experiences." Nevertheless, as they embarked on a stroll, their discussion delved into more profound topics, intensifying their interest in the study and prompting them to openly exchange more genuine thoughts and experiences. However, the originally scheduled 15-minute walk ended up lasting 35-40 minutes, and spatial memories were formed and retained during this time. Thus, I can assert that the walking approach created a more intimate setting for my research, facilitating the exchange of memories and emotions by rejuvenating and fostering a genuine and profound conversational atmosphere.

3.6. Participants and Stories

In total, 12 people were interviewed. The ages of the participants were between 25 and 55. All participants were born and raised in Turkey and all of them lived in Ankara more than 5 years. All of them are express themselves as a trans sex worker except one participant who had sex work just 3 months. They are:

Akrep

Akrep, who hails from the Southeast, has been actively involved in trans activism for 20 years. She has resided in Ankara for 25 years and has professionally worked in the association she founded for the last five years. Akrep shared that her transition process was challenging; she left her home and started hormone therapy due to social pressure. The interview with Akrep was held at the association and a walk was taken on the streets she likes to walk.

Defne

Defne, originally from Kırşehir but raised in Ankara, completed her high school education. She resisted engaging in sex work and attempted other professions post-transition. Defne sensed her uniqueness since childhood and began a journey of self-discovery during her high school years, facilitated by new friendships. The interview with Defne was held at the association and a walk was taken on the streets she likes to walk.

Buket

Buket, originally from Isparta but raised in Ankara, pursued higher education but did not complete it. She recognized differences in herself during her transition from primary to secondary school. Buket, a lifelong resident of Ankara, emphasized her preference for tranquility and endeavored to establish independence. Buket was interviewed at her home, but she refused to go for a walk as all her relatives live in Ankara.

Deniz

Deniz, born in 1973 in Gaziantep, relocated to Ankara at 22 and has resided there for 28 years. She carved out her path and worked as a voice artist in clubs. Despite battling cancer twice and surviving, Deniz felt different since childhood, finding solace in Bülent Ersoy as a role model. She started hormone therapy with the encouragement of a friend. Deniz was interviewed in her own home and walked in the streets near her home where she liked to walk.

Berra

Berra, 28, is from Ankara and has been engaged in sex work for approximately ten years. She graduated from high school and pursued university entrance exams while gaining conservatory experience. Berra embarked on her transition journey at 18 amidst preparations for university exams, seeking independence away from her family. The meeting with Berra was held at the association, but the walking could not take place due to lack of time.

Burcu

Born 1975 in Gaziantep, Burcu has lived in Ankara for 27 years. She sensed her uniqueness since childhood and relocated to Ankara due to familial and societal pressures. The interview with Burcu was held at the association and a walk was taken on the streets she likes to walk.

Demet

Demet, 28, is a university-educated transgender individual working in a non-

governmental organization. She commenced her transition process under medical supervision about four years ago. The interview with Demet was held at the association, but the walking could not take place due to lack of time.

Mine

Mine, born in 1974 in Samsun, has resided in Ankara since 1996. She worked in nightclubs and casinos and commenced her transition upon moving to Ankara, completing it over three years. The interview with Mine was held at the association and a walk was taken on the streets she likes to walk.

Azra

Azra, 30, was born and raised in Uşak and has lived in Ankara for approximately ten years. She managed a beauty salon and began hormone therapy during her high school years upon recognizing her female identity. Azra was interviewed at her home and refused to walk because she did not have time.

Aysu

Born in Germany and originally from Antalya, Aysu has lived in Ankara for many years. She pursued university and master's degrees in art history and archaeology. Aysu initiated her transition during her university years, feeling compelled to shed her societal mask and embrace her true self. The interview with Aysu was held at the association and a walk was taken on the streets she likes to walk.

Irem

Irem, born and raised in Ankara, pursued high school, and earned an associate degree over two years. She commenced her transition journey to reconcile her body and soul, acknowledging her innate differences since childhood but suppressing them until university. Discovering the support of an association, Irem found solace in knowing she was not alone. Irem was interviewed at her home and refused to walk because she did not have time.

Güneş

She was born in 1990 and lives alone. She lost her family, and when she was a child, she was imprisoned for eight years. When she lived in İzmir, one of her close friends committed suicide. Just one month before, she moved to Ankara because of the potential for customers. She realized something different in her feelings when she was a child, and her transition process began in prison with the other prisoners. Güneş was interviewed in her own home and walked in the streets near her home where she liked to walk.

CHAPTER 4

4. CLAIMS TO THE RIGHT TO THE CITY

This study examines how the struggle of trans sex workers for urban rights is manifested in their spatial practices and the forms of resistance these practices evolve into within the urban environment of Ankara. Nonetheless, it encompasses critiques of the feminist viewpoint regarding the right to the city, alongside a fundamental comprehension of the concept, which includes access to urban services, the right to housing, the right to engage in urban planning, and the right to alter urban spaces. I acknowledge feminist criticism asserting that patriarchy and power dynamics are inadequately represented in the practices surrounding the right to the city, and I contend that the right to the city should originate from the private, domestic sphere. My research examines the assertion of the right to the city, which enhances security and visibility from the private to the public sphere, fostering confidence and a sense of belonging, particularly in relation to sex work and gender-based power dynamics. My objective is to demonstrate that the right to the city encompasses the struggles and resistances inherent in the daily lives of those who are marginalized and rendered invisible. Nonetheless, in this process, not only are rights unattainable, but also the affirmative aspects of the right to the city, characterized by the sentiment of 'this is already my city,' stemming from the close connections formed with the community and the sense of belonging to the urban environment. It is essential to acknowledge that the marginalized community, which faces exclusion, bullying, and violence due to their gender identity and profession, seeks to integrate into the city through their daily life strategies.

Trans women, akin to all marginalized groups, contend with numerous challenges to navigate discrimination, exclusion, and violence in their daily existence, social

interactions, and professional environments. These manifestations of resistance emerge as strategies in everyday life and various domains. These strategies extend beyond conventional interpretations of the right to the city, encompassing property and access, and demonstrate that diverse gender identities can assert their rights autonomously from heteropatriarchal power structures. In my thesis, I contend that the right to the city must embrace a more inclusive framework by considering gendered practices in quotidian life. Within this framework, I delineate the right to the city as a right that ensures all individuals can securely utilize urban spaces, enjoy equitable access to services, engage in decision-making processes, and transcend the public-private dichotomy. I perceive a robust urban mobility focused on belonging and emancipation as integral to the right to the city.

From this perspective, my primary research inquiry is: 'How do the assertions of trans sex workers regarding their right to the city manifest in their spatial practices and modes of resistance?' In my thesis, I examine the reflections of trans sex workers' resistance to the right to the city and the strategies formulated in spatial practice. I contend that spatial practices resistant to conformity facilitate the redefinition and appropriation of spaces. I assert that this exemplifies the affirmative contribution of the right to the city, and I underscore that the strategies formulated in everyday life for fostering a sense of belonging constitute a claim to the right to the city. Consequently, my thesis encompasses two principal themes. Themes encompass the utilization and occupation of urban space in daily life, as well as the strategies for asserting the right to the city. The themes will be assessed by examining the reflection of tactics employed in daily life, business, and social interactions within the city on spatial practices.

The theme of asserting rights encompasses the demands of transgender sex workers for access, security, and recognition in urban environments, their visibility, their involvement in protests advocating for their rights, and their engagement with non-governmental organizations to safeguard their rights. This subheading addresses the extent of visibility in public spaces, such as nightlife, markets, or streets, in the absence of police intervention, as well as the conditions contingent upon the venues of sex work. These conditions illustrate the various manifestations of struggle that the right

to the city assumes and is represented in spatial practices.

The theme of utilization and occupation of urban space pertains to the methods by which transgender sex workers engage with, traverse, and interact with urban environments in their daily existence. It emphasizes the prevalence of utilizing specific urban areas (streets, parks, nightlife districts) and the categories of public and private spaces employed for recreation or community development. The subtitle of the theme pertains to the social duration experienced in space, the utilization of alternative spaces to emphasize community culture and belonging, and the locations and pathways commonly employed for security purposes. The demographic and economic characteristics of the variables will be considered.

Comprehending space requires embracing a comprehensive approach that considers space and its history, rather than focusing on isolated instances (Lefebvre, 1991). Although space has the potential to be inclusive and all-encompassing, it can also function as a dividing barrier that isolates and marginalizes those who are considered different or outside the norm. One can explore how others participate in the functions of visibility, access, recognition, communication, and public space, and how they challenge rigid distinctions and exclusion within those spaces. Vaiou (2009) highlights the significance of everyday actions in influencing the public sphere, questioning the division into two distinct categories and emphasizing the influence of power dynamics (Vaiou & Kalandides, 2009).

Gender tyranny occurs in public spaces when specific individuals take on the role of enforcing heteronormative gender norms, often with the support of bystanders. However, the public display of gender diversity, supported by a larger community, could challenge and interrogate this binary categorization. This form of oppression is facilitated by the existence of structural elements such as streets, transportation facilities, and elevators. Semi-public spaces, primarily owned by private entities, are areas where the public can gather if they follow specific rules and requirements. These spaces possess the capacity to exhibit gender fluidity, as state universities possess the jurisdiction to restrict entry to individuals who lack affiliation with the university. These venues may encompass shopping centers, churches, auditoriums, or other

performance spaces that could limit public access. Private spaces can serve as sanctuaries or areas of exclusion, where the owner has the power to allow or refuse entry and regulate activities within the space (Doan, 2010). To examine the inclusivity and comprehensiveness of public spaces in Ankara, the interviewees were posed the question "Is there a particular space where you experience the greatest sense of freedom and authenticity?" Their answers were subsequently analyzed. From this perspective, most of the interviewees expressed that they experienced a sense of freedom and autonomy in their homes, and actively made the decision to live in their current residences.

In the previous instance, Defne, one of the individuals I interviewed, recalls a particular street that has made a lasting impression on her. She refers to a street near the Ministries where accommodations are available. This street resembles a tunnel, with trees and vibrant flowers lining both sides. Defne highlighted the tranquil and serene atmosphere of the lodging area, expressing her preference for walking through that street and the sense of peace she experiences there. Given that the lodging area is considered a semi-public space, individuals tend to experience a sense of tranquility and serenity rather than a sense of safety in this type of environment, making it their preferred choice. Furthermore, I am actively involved in documenting the lived experiences of transgender women in the urban environment of Ankara.

4.1. Access to urban services

This section will commence with an evaluation of the availability of urban services and will subsequently delve into the notions of safety, ease of use, and prominence in relation to urban encounters. When we define the right to the city as a right for everyone to use urban space safely, to have safe and equal access to services, to participate in decision-making processes and to overcome the distinction between public and private space, we also include the safe spaces that urban space and the city should provide to citizens. Safe and non-discriminatory urban services include the right to housing, access to health services, transport and social services, which we will examine in this section. An analysis of the right to the city will focus on the availability of hospital services, the provision of secure spaces, and the opportunities for accessibility and visibility. The city of Ankara has been evaluated in terms of the right

to housing, access to health services, transport systems, shopping and social areas through the experiences of trans women sex workers. The most striking result of these evaluations is that there are severe inadequacies in the right to housing and access to health services.

Regarding the right to housing, the participants indicated that they could not easily find a house to rent out and that the landlords did not want to rent out the house after they realized that they had a trans identity. In one case, landlords who rent out the house raise the rental fee for trans-identified individuals. Among the participants, those who own a house think they would have difficulties if they tried to look for a house. On the other hand, one of the participants stated that they could understand the landlords' high prices because they were doing sex work. They also recognize that they work from home, but it can be isolating, especially when their transgender friends frequently go away for long periods of time. However, the speaker acknowledges that they lack the authority to grant permission for them to depart.

As Buket emphasized, there is a prejudice when one has a trans gender identity, and all processes become difficult.

> "Ankara fails in terms of the right to housing. Landlords are very prejudiced. Let me tell you something: if I had a third, fourth, or fifth house, not because I am trans, but because I would give it to trans people and prostitutes. Definitely. Since they are already unhappy about housing, they pay their rent a week before the day comes. They take excellent care of their house. I can't figure out why this prejudice. I'm not saying it's because I'm trans, I can't figure it out. Why this prejudice?" (Buket)

Since the only place where registered sex work can be done in Turkey is brothels, there are serious legal challenges for sex workers working on online platforms and the streets. House seals and administrative fines are among the most frequent counselling requests. Especially house seals and accumulated administrative fines deepen poverty. Sex workers are subjected to severe obstruction of their right to housing through house

seals.[21]

Marques (2019) identifies four strategies for articulating gender concerning gender subjectivities: ‘blending in,’ ‘masking,’ ‘naturalization,’ and ‘subversion’ (Marques, 2019). These strategies are linked to conditioned preferences for identification as transgender and are associated with diverse politicized transgender narratives. It is also possible to interpret these strategies in the spatial practices of trans women sex workers. Naturalization, as Marques (2019) states, is a process that is carried out naturally without the need for individuals to struggle for recognition of their gender representations. From this perspective, transgender female sex workers in Ankara accept and normalize their accommodation needs in certain situations. The primary concern is that landlords overvalue the rent and are reluctant to lease the property due to the presence of sex workers. Trans women here normalize the consequences of exclusion and segregation stemming from a socially stigmatized occupation. Within the framework of the right to the city, one can discuss a mandatory naturalization regarding access to urban services; indeed, it may be termed the naturalization of despair stemming from acquiescence to societal constructs rather than obligatory naturalization.

Forms of accommodation involves residing in apartment buildings primarily designated for commercial purposes, rather than as family residences. Apartment buildings primarily used as workplaces experience higher levels of foot traffic compared to those used as residences. While foreign individuals frequently enter and exit these buildings, apartments used for dwelling purposes foster neighborly relations among their residents. The selected apartments as alternative living spaces also prioritize the desire to live without experiencing social stigma, alongside the spaces constrained by the right to the city.

Regarding access to health services, Ankara is quite favorable with its structure as a capital city and has many hospitals. However, association executives and some interviewees stated that they face discrimination when going to public hospitals. On

[21] This paragraph analyzed from the interview. Authorized person A& Authorized person B, Red Umbrella Sexual Health and Human Rights Association’s Legal Advisor & Sexual and Reproductive Health Programme Officer, personal interview, 19 February 2024

the other hand, in cases of more personal discomfort, public hospitals are preferred. It was observed that university hospitals are more frequently and widely used than state hospitals. There is a prevailing view that appointments for appointments and routine checks at public hospitals are given very late and that it is not appropriate to keep people waiting during this period.

On the other hand, it is quite possible to analyze the issue of access to health services in terms of economic status. Sex workers who have a better financial situation can prefer private hospitals or polyclinics and reduce their exposure to discrimination as recognition increases. This is because of the perception of being treated specially and being exposed to less discrimination. As explained by a participant who had previously preferred a public hospital, she was insistently addressed by her identity name rather than the name she preferred to use due to sexist and insensitive staff at the hospital. This may result in shaming, isolation and exclusion of trans women in society.

> "I mean, a few doctors, I mean, I guess I don't blame them either, I can't blame them anymore. Look, for example, before my previous name was changed, I had a stomach problem, and I had an illness. I mean, it really bothered me that the doctor there always called me by my male name. All the time. I mean, all the time, so I guess the idiot thought he could hurt me from there. I laugh a lot at such people. I mean, now I'm saying internally that she can call me that way without being offended by it. Because my late mother loved me like that. That's why, I mean, the fact that she called me by that name never bothered me, but constantly saying that. (Berra)

In addition to the financial situation in accessing health services, having private insurance is also very important to benefit from affordable health services. In this sense, the participants who had insurance noted that they did not have any severe problems in terms of health services. While analyzing health services, the participants particularly emphasized that trans women who completed the trans transition process did not have any problems when using state hospitals, mainly because of their identity. These interviewees, who completed the trans transition process and changed their identity to women, stated that they did not have any

problems when using state hospitals, mainly because of their identity.

In terms of the struggle for the right to the city, even if health services are spatially accessible as urban services, they do not offer a safe and liberating space. Doctors and the health care system are not inclusive and safe for individuals with different gender identities. Therefore, it is possible to see the claim for the right to the city and the form of resistance as the idea of using the preferred name instead of the identity name and the preference for private hospitals and polyclinics. Here, it is possible to speak of a systematic and social exclusion and the emancipatory and safe spaces that the right to the city should provide cannot be provided.

The evaluation of transport services, as well as access to housing and health services, is an essential point in understanding according to which factors the right to the city is distributed. In this sense, the interviewees who evaluated the transportation facilities in Ankara stated that Ankara does not have transportation problems compared to other big cities, and that especially those who are from Ankara use various means of transport such as metro and buses. On the other hand, the minibus is one of the frequently used vehicles.

Public transport is preferred, especially in the evening hours. In addition, trans women who are already close to the environments where they can socialize often prefer to walk. It is stated that they usually use taxis if the distance is too far for them to walk. On the other hand, regarding the utilization of public transportation services, which are prominently offered by the local government, it has been noted that transgender women refrain from using these services due to concerns about potential incidents of physical and verbal harassment and violence. Depending on the financial circumstances, taxis are frequently utilized, while pedestrian transportation is favored for areas that are accessible by walking. The municipality's other cultural, artistic, and social activities were reported to have been underutilized. The absence of inclusivity and egalitarianism in municipal activities is the fundamental reason for the restricted access of trans women to these activities. Some of us do not live in our own homes; instead, we reside with others or rent properties through third-party agents. Irrespective of your location, whether it be Çankaya or any other district, if you encounter a housing

issue, you will be unable to avail the services provided by the municipality.[22]

One of the most prominent problems experienced in accessing social services is that trans women are left behind due to discrimination and exclusion. They may hold back from applying to institutions and organizations that can provide income and help; the main reason for this is discrimination due to phobic behaviors and attitudes. Another reason for holding back is that the loss of trust has reached severe dimensions. Trans women think that they will not encounter any results or positive reality regarding their applications. According to the observations made in the field and the situations encountered, another consequence of the lack of effort to establish a relationship of trust and the increasing social isolation due to poverty is the adverse psychological effects.

Another reason for the difficulty in accessing social services is that it cannot be done in an official, concrete, and visible way with documents and papers, as in access to justice. In this case, in addition to the perception that receiving services in a psychosocial situation is impossible, the lack of a concrete output may also hold back. In this sense, they do not know how, where, and what kind of help they can receive regarding social services, and thus, they may put themselves in the background.

In terms of access to essential services and justice, one of the most fundamental problems is sex workers' hopelessness and reluctance to win and defend their rights. When the legal process is initiated in cases of violence or house sealing, sex workers lose their faith because of protracted lawsuits and courts. On the other hand, it is stated that the attitude of the personnel they face in any institution is seen as the source of any crime, and sex workers are seen as the ones who cause the increase in the crime rate in society, just as the person who spreads the crime spreads the infection. Attempts to act, especially in police stations and similar institutions, can turn into torture for trans sex workers. The reason for this is the discrimination they experience, as well as the fact that they may become the perpetrators of the incident while they are the victims. When they try to reach complaint mechanisms such as police stations and

[22] Authorized person C, Pink Life LGBTI+ Solidarity Association's General Coordinator, personal interview, 26 January 2024

police stations due to their identities and professions, they may face hate speech and psychological violence. Transgender sex workers who are kept waiting for a very long time or intimidated in other ways may become perpetrators in the eyes of institutional staff, or they are never victims anyway. Therefore, they may face situations such as not being able to file a complaint when they are raped. Trans women sex workers who want to file a complaint are approached with a perception like *"Aren't you already doing this profession?" "Since they face factors that accuse sex workers and constantly push them away from those mechanisms, they stay away from them."*[23]

Within this framework, particularly pertaining to the entitlement to housing, access to healthcare services, utilization of local government services, and availability of social services, discrimination is observed. Despite the desire of marginalized trans women to reduce their visibility and remain silent, they employ diverse strategies to secure housing rights and access healthcare services. One effective strategy is to prioritize private hospitals or private polyclinics over public hospitals. Additionally, some women may choose to minimize their visibility in society. Furthermore, individuals have the option to utilize another person's registration to lease a residence or frequently cohabitate to provide mutual assistance and fulfill their housing requirements, thereby eliminating the necessity of direct communication with landlords. However, the ownership of a house is a crucial and comforting legal entitlement for transgender women. Even if some neighbors feel uneasy about owning a house, there will be no complaints when living as a tenant. Consequently, individuals strive to ensure their future by increasing their savings and acquiring a residential property.

Marcuse (2009), while researching the right to the city, emphasizes the necessity of knowing the rights of those who do not have the right to the city, who are affected the most, who will support them, and what their justifications will be. From this point of view, especially trans women sex workers who have limitations in accessing housing and health rights can be affected in the strictest way when they have a health condition or when they want to buy a house. Although the dream of a social and cultural change

[23] This paragraph analyzed from the interview. Authorized person A& Authorized person B, Red Umbrella Sexual Health and Human Rights Association's Legal Advisor & Sexual and Reproductive Health Programme Officer, personal interview, 19 February 2024

comes to the forefront to obtain these rights, the trans community develops ways of indirectly benefiting from these rights (such as making a rental contract through another person) by applying various tactics within themselves.

While the ownership of private and immovable property is a fundamental right of citizenship in urban areas, there are instances, such as the Eryaman-Esat incidents, where patriarchal and moral forces may attempt to undermine this right through violent and oppressive means in their pursuit of rent. Transgender women often choose to reside near one another, forming communities in shared houses and neighborhoods, to collectively navigate the external pressures, they encounter.

In terms of access to urban services, the most apparent consequence of oppression and violence is the feeling of insecurity. The ability to enter the city is directly correlated with a feeling of safety. The fundamental urban components evident in the spatial practices advocating for the right to the city include access to transportation, housing, healthcare, and social services. The spatial practices demonstrate significantly restricted dimensions of the right to the city for trans women sex workers. From a feminist standpoint, it is essential to highlight that an examination of the right to the city must incorporate the gender dynamics and heteropatriarchal power structures that govern access to urban spaces. I contend that examining the integration of spatial practices within overarching systems of oppression, such as patriarchy and cisnormativity, ought to be incorporated into research on the right to the city.

4.2. Visibility and Recognition in Urban Space

I would like to explain visibility and recognition in urban space in terms of protesting for rights, participating in demonstrations and interacting with civil society organizations. The use of the streets is where the claim to the right to the city is carried and where political gatherings are most common. Ankara is a city that hosts civil society centers and is very strong in terms of civil society. In this sense, the protests seem to be particularly strong through analyzing events such as the Esat Eryaman incidents. Visibility has been influenced by multiple factors, but it is feasible to demonstrate how visibility contributes to empowerment within the framework of the right to the city. By examining recent political, economic, and social changes, we can

identify specific circumstances that have influenced the presence of trans women sex workers in the city. These can be categorized as conservative policies and discourses, which have led to an increase in hate speech, the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic, the widespread use of the internet, and the implementation of legal regulations. The visibility of trans sex workers in Ankara, the change experienced with the COVID-19 pandemic process in 2020 was noted. Sex workers could not go out on the street during the pandemic, and their financial gains were interrupted due to situations such as security measures and curfews in terms of health. They faced severe poverty during and after the pandemic. It has been observed that all sex workers, especially transgender sex workers, whose socio-economic conditions have deteriorated, have distanced themselves from their social environments. As stated by the participants, during the pandemic process, both sex work through online platforms became widespread, and visibility decreased.

Another reason affecting trans visibility is political discourses and political elections. When the political elections came, trans women were caught up in political fears during the second round of elections. With these fears, there were trans women who tried to ensure their safety by not going out of their homes for two weeks until the second round of elections. This fear negatively affected the visibility of the LGBTI+ community and associations, which were targeted with political discourses. After the last elections, memberships in LGBTI associations were cancelled, and they were distanced to avoid being seen in any institutional media.

Similarly, guards, who can be shown as one of the political reasons but have grave importance, can be shown in the decrease in trans visibility. With the wide range of duties and responsibilities given to the guards, the number of guards is increasing, and they are concentrated in the wheeling places, creating fear. With the fear created, sex workers have turned to online platforms instead of going to the wheel. Again, in parallel with the answers given by the interviewees on community belonging, it was noted that the fear created in associations is matched with individuality, and the decrease in solidarity among sex workers reinforces the fear. On the other hand, various violence, pressure, and threats have started to increase by the groups whose visibility has started to increase with the effect of conservative policies towards trans

sex workers. There were sex workers who shouted "Allahu akbar" from inside the cars and were exposed to discourses such as "you will all die." People who hear these iscourses disconnect from the street, thinking they are no longer safe.[24]
In addition to political reasons, in connection with urbanization decisions, sex workers' working areas are directly affected, and this effect is met with pressure and violence, as in the Eryaman-Esat incidents. Sex workers were forced to change their area with similar ill-treatment in the İskitler region, where gang organization was observed to have increased considerably. After 2016, pressure and ill-treatment were initiated in the İskitler area, which is a scrap yard area; with the decision of the governorship, sex workers were removed, and the area was enclosed. Sex workers who were excluded from the İskitler area due to the transformation decision were forced to work from their homes.[25]

According to the information received from Pink Life, it was much more possible to work on the street until 2016-2017. Until these years, the pressure and violence of law enforcement officers continued, and administrative fines continued. However, until these times, working on the street was a known thing, and girls worked in places where they could see and protect each other. However, after 2017, this order has changed considerably. The pandemic process experienced afterward also reinforced staying away from the street. The main reason for the change in 2017 is the amendment made in Article 227/3 of the Turkish Penal Code No. 5237.[26]

The amendment authorizes the dissemination of products that include images, texts, cards, words, and contact information that facilitate sex work. Engaging in the act of indiscriminately distributing and bestowing playing cards has now been classified as a criminal act, carrying significant penalties in the form of hefty fines and

[24] This paragraph analyzed from the interview. Authorized person A& Authorized person B, Red Umbrella Sexual Health and Human Rights Association's Legal Advisor & Sexual and Reproductive Health Programme Officer, personal interview, 19 February 2024
[25] Authorized person C, Pink Life LGBTI+ Solidarity Association's General Coordinator, personal interview, 26 January 2024
[26] "(3) (Repealed: 6/12/2006- 5560/45 art.; Revised: 24/11/2016-6763/18 art.) A person who gives, distributes or disseminates products containing images, writings, and lyrics prepared to facilitate sex work or to mediate sex work shall be sentenced to imprisonment from one year to three years and a judicial fine from two hundred days to two thousand days."

imprisonment, particularly for repeat offenders. The Constitutional Court has invalidated the Law on Misdemeanors on the grounds of Article 36. The accrued penalties have resulted in heightened apprehension and destitution among individuals engaged in sex work. Furthermore, there are titles and areas that can enhance visibility, in addition to the aforementioned factors that contribute to increased invisibility.

In terms of the relationship established with the city, the places where people enjoy going can also make the existence of safe places possible. From this point of view, the interviewees were asked about three places in the city that they enjoy visiting under socio-spatial experiences. While some of the participants stated that they enjoyed being at home, some of them noted places such as Kızılay, Tunalı, Esat, Hoşdere, and Atakule. Individuals who like vibrancy and movement indicated Kızılay and Bahçelievler, where the younger student population is high and where there are dense crowds. On the other hand, interviewees who are older than middle age and who stated that they want to lead a quieter life expressed that they enjoy going to areas such as Tunalı and Ayrancı.

Trans women sex workers feel themselves pleasant and happy in certain regions indicated above. The common characteristic of these regions is that they are the regions where the middle-upper income group and the intellectual class live. Kızılay is preferred only because it is lively and vibrant. From this point of view, if we examine the places in the city that are seen as insecure, districts such as Keçiören, Mamak and Altındağ were included in the insecure districts as districts where the lower-middle-income group and the group with relatively lower education level live. Generally, it was emphasized that it feels more insecure outside the Çankaya region.

From this perspective, we have comprehended the assertion that trans women who work in the sex industry are more noticeable and present in specific neighborhoods and regions. Transgender women, who may experience social and spatial isolation in different ways, have openly discussed the methods and personal strategies they have devised, as well as the additional measures required for this. While acknowledging the influence of power-related strategies and self-narratives embedded in technology, it is important to recognize that individuals develop their own memories through personal experiences and perspectives within a given space. These memories contribute to a

sense of belonging and a desire for equitable access to urban areas. Indeed, it is feasible to underscore that nearly all practices perceived as tactics and strategies are assertions.

Transgender women encounter obstacles in urban environments, including restricted housing rights, discrimination, and marginalization due to their gender identity. Additionally, they encounter challenges when it comes to accessing social and spatial opportunities, such as clubs, restaurants, and hospitals. Hence, it is feasible to discuss the disparity and marginalization in the allocation of the urban entitlement. Transgender women who work in the sex industry employ different strategies to assert their rights to life and urban spaces. The Pink Life Solidarity Association was established in response to the Eryaman-Esat incidents, which were marked by one of the most savage occurrences. Through this association, the initial organized and unified transgender movement in Turkey was empowered, advocating for the rights to the city and to life at an institutional and collective level.

Red Umbrella emerged as one of the few organizations in Turkey dedicated to addressing sexual health issues specifically among sex workers. The association plays a crucial and empowering role for the transgender community. Following the Eryaman-Esat incidents, trans sex workers faced attempts to marginalize them from the city through the implementation of various laws, regulations, and political pressures. However, the association provided them with the opportunity to organize and assert their rights. The transformation of the right to the city into a mere slogan has elevated the significance of the right to access and utilize urban spaces, alongside the right to life, as a justiciable entitlement that can be pursued through demonstrations and marches. Socio-political experiences refer to the areas where a community or an individual seeks rights in the society, community consciousness, relationship with the society and the primary ways of claiming rights with a political stance. From this point of view, we tried to understand the right to the city that trans women sex workers seek in line with their political experiences and urban relations. The interviewees were asked about community belonging, participation in associations, communities they participated in, actions they participated in and their opinions on this issue. The quest for the right to the city, especially with its changing meaning and use by advocates and communities today, has gained political meaning and strengthened with street protests.

One of the best examples of this is the Esat-Eryaman events and the Bayram street events that continue today. In the press statement titled "We Want the Entire City, Not Just Ghettos!", a press statement was organized in which the entire city was demanded against the deprivation of trans people's rights to work and shelter, their exclusion from social life and the violations of their rights, as Pembe Hayat association also included. From this point of view, understanding the demands of trans women sex workers living in Ankara for the right to the city and their attitudes towards the issue is essential in terms of understanding political experiences.

Participation in Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), which are areas where socio-political experiences can find a place and are developed by turning into an organized community, the importance of organized struggle and the belief in change will be examined under this heading. In this direction, the participants were asked about their membership to associations and the place and importance of associations for them. It is known that 8 of the participants are members of the Red Umbrella Association, two of them are known to be among the founding members and one of them is on the supervisory board. Although they do not have an official membership, participants who are not members constantly go to the association for various reasons. Among these reasons are condom assistance from the association and being able to ask legal questions. However, from another point of view, the association is seen as a safe space for trans women sex workers, and it appears as a place where they regularly visit, drink tea and coffee, have conversations and socialize. From time to time, the participants meet their friends in the association or can stop by on their way somewhere and chat. On the other hand, when there is an interview, an interview, or a meeting, the participants feel safe in the association and want to hold these meetings.

Azra and Irem express their dedication to advancing human rights and emphasize the existence of an opportunity to unite and advocate for their rights. They highlight the significance of marginalized minority groups who feel threatened by the political atmosphere in Turkey and discuss individuals in Turkey who face difficulties in coping with the need to survive and consequently lose their sense of personal identity.

> "I feel better. We defend our rights and we are in solidarity with each other. At least there is such a head, and we try to stand behind it. In other words, we are

here, we are in a struggle and you cannot ignore our existence. This is the same for human rights and animal rights. Whatever women's rights are, they do not exist for a gender or a living creature. I am only saying this for marginalised minorities." (Azra)

The strategy, subverting (Marques, 2019), can be associated with trans women sex workers' claiming their rights through alternative ways of unity in the face of discriminatory and systematic violence. The strategy that arises from a transformation in spatial practice can be regarded as an empowering approach that enhances the visibility and solidarity of trans women sex workers. Marques (2019) posits that the visibility of transgender communities serves to normalize transgender individuals and educate the broader population, thereby mitigating transphobic discriminatory behaviors. In this context, the participation of transgender women in street protests through the formation of an association after the Esat-Eryaman cases, subsequent legal proceedings, and enhanced visibility constitutes an empowering subversive strategy regarding spatial practices.

In addition, Purcell (2002) states that the concept of the right to the city highlights the necessity of rearranging the power structures that underlie the development of urban areas, thereby transferring authority from the government and capital to the urban population. Therefore, the organized actions in the city demand the implementation of the right to the city from the state and capital to the decisions made by urban users by demanding a reorganization of power dynamics. The political notion of "right to the city" highlights the necessity of an all-encompassing strategy to tackle calls for socio-spatial transformation (Marcuse, 2010). In other words, the right to the city includes the right to challenge the role of sovereign power in shaping the behavior of political bodies and resolving conflicts.

This discussion indicates that, from a feminist viewpoint, the right to the city necessitates a reevaluation that incorporates intersectional elements such as gender, sexual orientation, class, and ethnicity. In this context, the discrimination and exclusion experienced by trans women sex workers in urban environments should be regarded not merely as individual issues but as consequences of patriarchal and heteronormative urban structures. A feminist perspective on the right to the city must

emphasize the visibility of intersectional inequalities and the pursuit of urban justice for all.

4.3. Safety in Working Environment

The forms of resistance and struggle that every individual experiencing the city creates in every part of his/her daily life are manifested in different forms for trans women sex workers. This manifestation includes various situations such as being able to work safely, protecting their rights, and not being recognized from time to time. In this section where the forms of resistance and spatial practices developed by trans women sex workers in their working areas in their claims for the right to the city are analyzed, we see that security comes to the forefront. The forms of resistance and struggle that every individual experiencing the city creates in every part of his/her daily life are manifested in different forms for trans women sex workers. This manifestation includes various situations such as being able to work safely, protecting their rights, and not being recognized from time to time. In this section where the forms of resistance and spatial practices developed by trans women sex workers in their working areas in their claims for the right to the city are analyzed, we see that security comes to the forefront.

The internet has had a profound influence on the sex business, offering novel channels of connection for transgender sex workers in Turkey. Websites are utilized to oversee violence and legal interventions, with frequent visits to clients' homes to discourage possible acts of violence. The monthly rates are determined by the level of site popularity, the number of visitors, and the rankings on Google (Taşcıoğlu, 2011). Sex work is increasingly sold online in a digitally networked society, with technology facilitating in-person services and indirect contact. Social changes have transformed the sex industry in the 21st century (O'Neill et al., 2017). Sexuality and queer geographers argue that advancements in online existence, particularly mobile and interconnected, significantly impact our understanding of physical and virtual environments (Nash, 2019).

Sex workers in Turkey frequently engage in sex work as a means of evading law enforcement and ensuring their safety. Nevertheless, the enactment of Law No. 5651 in 2007 brought about a substantial alteration in this situation. The legislation imposes legal responsibilities on internet organizations and governs internet-related crimes. Websites may be subject to restrictions or blocking if they are suspected of hosting explicit or unlawful content. As a result, websites that include terminology such as "gay, "lesbian," "transsexual," and "transvestite" in relation to these violations have been subjected to censorship. The Telecommunications Communication Presidency has the authority to issue administrative blocking orders (Taşcıoğlu, 2011). There are different types of sex work that are shaped by the social and economic disparities between the sex worker and the client (Van der Veen, 2001). These disparities might influence the degree of independence and ability to make decisions for oneself that a sex worker can have, even if they work for themselves. This underscores the intricacy of sex employment in diverse settings (Cardoso et al., 2022). In the post-pandemic period, this diversity has diversified and made it possible to interact with different channels and different customer groups through digital platforms.

With the pandemic period, not only has a transformation been experienced in social life, but also the methods of trans women to communicate with their customers have changed significantly. After the pandemic, since sex workers could not go out on the streets, they tended to continue sex work at home through advertisements on websites. In Ankara, most of the sex workers experienced the hitchhiking method on the street for some time. Afterwards, the participants who evaluated the transition to the online system stated that communicating online has both positive and negative aspects. First, it was emphasized that it was not as positive as the street in terms of material terms. While meetings with more than one customer can be held in one night on the street, this period is prolonged, and the number of customers is sometimes lower at home. In this context, the financial earnings of sex workers working at home are lower than both girls working on the street and girls working online. Berra, who explained sex work on digital platforms and on the street by experiencing both, stated that things go faster on the street and can be more challenging online. The speaker recommends promptly finishing a task and securing a new one to mitigate potential complications such as inclement weather or intoxicated folks. In addition, they acknowledge that

internet customers have a desire for improved service and extended durations of stay. They emphasize the need to carefully evaluate various alternatives and to incorporate a balanced approach. Azra stating that it's a more dependable and hygienic way to get money. It might not result in work right away, but it does provide stability and security. The internet is a more uncertain and unpredictable choice, though, because of the wide variations in its quality and dependability.

While it was stated that perhaps the best aspect of the street was financial gain, the participants who indicated that they became more vulnerable to dangers and violence emphasized the possible incidents of violence they experienced on the street. Digital technology surpasses the street in all aspects due to its ability to provide a more regulated environment. Nevertheless, it is not devoid of its difficulties. For example, the author has personally encountered incidents of abduction, a precipice descent, and assault by unfamiliar individuals. In the street, the environment is characterized by a higher degree of unpredictability and volatility.

The participant draws a parallel between the scenario of a prostitute working on the street and a driver in a car, where a girl sitting beside him is forcefully shoved into the vehicle, causing severe damage to her brain. This is suboptimal in the realm of digital technology. Nevertheless, they have acquired the ability to discern the intonation of an individual's voice and react accordingly to their verbal communication.

In the realm of digital technology, the participant has the capability to inform law enforcement authorities regarding an individual's age and whether they exhibit any speech disorders. Additionally, they can choose to either recommend the individual to their acquaintances or prevent further communication with them. This is the approach they employ when dealing with incidents such as kidnapping and rape.

Following the widespread use of Twitter by sex workers, social media has also become monopolized and implicitly commercialized. Sex workers who want to be visible must pay higher amounts of money to be ranked higher. On the other hand, Twitter and other social media accounts can be shut down constantly due to obscene images. The advent of the digital era has resulted in reduced interpersonal communication and increased social isolation, since more and more persons are now working remotely

from their homes. These issues have prompted worries over drug addiction, the quality of living conditions, and social isolation. The Red Umbrella Associations contend that although reducing violence can have the effect of diminishing violence, it can also result in heightened psychological issues and feelings of isolation.[27]

The most crucial problem for women who have experienced and still work on the street is the lack of a safe environment and the lack of a mechanism they can apply when they face a security threat. Berra is on both digital platforms and the street. As she stated, she works open to dangers on the street. When they encounter any threatening situation, they call their friends or try to solve the problem with the help of neighborhood shopkeepers instead of going to law enforcement officers.

> "I was kidnapped and raped on the wheel. I mean, I experienced the things that happen to every queer." (İrem)

The Internet continues to pose a concern. The current collection of literature offers only a limited grasp of the potential risks involved with doing sex work online. Although online sex workers may have a higher level of protection than those who work outside or on the streets, they are nevertheless vulnerable to violence and harassment (Jones, 2015). The first disadvantage of engaging with clients via digital platforms is simply speaking with them over the phone, not knowing who they are, and not having enough data to ensure a safe atmosphere. Furthermore, clients who do not wish to obtain sex services or whose personal information cannot be accessed call. Children, deviants, addicts, etc. They may call and introduce themselves differently, resulting in a waste of time or a security risk.

The speaker is looking for folks who are not deviants, minors, seniors, or drug abusers. They have strict age restrictions, only accepting those between the ages of 25 and 50. Additionally, they do not allow individuals who engage in drug use, seek group sexual activities, consume alcohol, or smoke. Their scale is exclusive, allowing only 5% of the population to meet their requirements. Two of these persons can join the group.

[27] This paragraph analyzed from the interview. Authorized person A& Authorized person B, Red Umbrella Sexual Health and Human Rights Association's Legal Advisor & Sexual and Reproductive Health Programme Officer, personal interview, 19 February 2024

On the other hand, since sex work is carried out illegally, it may lead to police searches and arrests. As a result, 3-month house sealing, or criminal proceedings may be applied. Law enforcement officers can conduct covert operations where they can enter a residence without disclosing their presence and apprehend individuals in the act of receiving illicit funds. Acquaintances have encountered situations when they have sealed or secured houses and have been apprehended while in the act. They may trail the individual who before them and can be apprehended either upon their departure or immediately after.

In addition, problems arise from digital platform sources, such as Twitter or websites. Among these, as noted by Red Umbrella,[28] is the problem arising from the monopolization of Twitter and its websites. Publications and adverts are provided if regular payments and fees are high. In addition, restrictions can be imposed on websites for security reasons, and accounts may be closed.

> "Right now, for example, if you are trying to make your own advertisement, you are restricted or blocked on Twitter or another platform, you are banned either by Türk Telekom or by some portals on the internet. So, I have a lot of difficulty in terms of advertising. I have a lot of difficulty in terms of making my advertisement." (Buket)

Participants in neoliberal sexual entrepreneurship, also known as *porntropreneurs*, are expected to offer a diverse range of products and services. These include producing content, creating customized content, self-promotion, growing their fan network, adhering to platform restrictions and payment terms, and engaging in various forms of parasocial relational work (Cardoso et al., 2022).

Finally, psychological problems are among the issues trans women sex workers face on online platforms and on the street. Various customers they communicate with may have addictive or problematic profiles and may make different demands. In addition to these demands, some customers cannot agree on the fee, and they are forced not to

[28] This paragraph analyzed from the interview. Authorized person A& Authorized person B, Red Umbrella Sexual Health and Human Rights Association's Legal Advisor & Sexual and Reproductive Health Programme Officer, personal interview, 19 February 2024

pay through violence and pressure.

To provide their security against the problems encountered, they are more selective towards their customers and can take some measures. The first of these measures is to conduct a preliminary screening of the telephone conversation, style, and neighborhood of the customers who are contacted through online platforms. If the customer speaks very rudely and disrespectfully, they can convey that they are not suitable and they may not meet. Another measure is not to accept customers after a specific time at night. This time is usually determined as after 24:00- 01:00. The reason for this is that the customers who want to meet after these hours are generally likely to be alcoholic or addicted.

Another measure of protection is the sprays carried by sex workers. The interviewees stated that they keep sprays in the room where sex services are provided and keep them in areas where they can be used when they deem necessary. Lastly, the interviewees stated that they took it easy and tried to manage the situation by remaining calm. This situation is mainly related to the problems encountered at home.

> "Somehow, you take it in your stride, or you try to show your teeth. You say whatever will happen, I mean, you blacken your eyes, don't look at it, in our country, it is not a very common thing for a trans person to be in a police station, so the man there would not take that risk. What was he doing at the transvestite's house? The man doesn't argue with you because he won't take that risk. He doesn't do much, he ends it, but of course you inevitably have problems." (Azra)

Another issue related to their occupations and work environments is the monthly income, which constitutes the economic component of the perception and use of space. The fact that sex work is not recognized as a profession and the lack of a regular source of income can create very disadvantageous and harmful situations for trans women sex workers. They state that they cannot express a straightforward income regarding their monthly earnings and should always be prepared for the next month. If the customer potential is quite good one month and bad the next month, it can lead to financial anxiety and insecurity. On the other hand, the situation that causes future anxiety is

the lack of insurance and the need to have private health insurance to retire. All but two interviewees take out private health insurance. The other interviewees stated that they want to buy a house and see how to guarantee their future by owning a home.

Although sex work is defined and perceived as a compulsory profession for trans women, the participants who stated that they do sex work compulsorily stated that they are forced to do sex work by stating that they do this job to make a living. They added that they tried to work in another job, but they had to quit because of their work environments that excluded them because of their identities and thought that they were already doing sex work. They stated that they were forced to do sex work because they could not get the job they wanted and they were not offered job opportunities in another sector or field, but they could leave sex work if they were offered another chance. The speaker refuses to participate in sex work due to financial restraints and personal motivations. Although they already have a boyfriend, they hold the belief that having a partner is obligatory in Turkey, where they feel unable to pursue their desired profession or advocate for their rights.

Finally, this section will present the responses received about the requested interview venues or the way of communicating with the clients. These responses include the places that can offer the safest environment and are asked based on the experiences of sex workers. It is thought that doing sex work in bars, which were also found in Ankara before, may be safer and more convenient for trans women. It is believed that by having the opportunity to chat with the customer in bars, it is possible to have a better idea of what kind of a person they are, both whether they have a sharp instrument on them and what kind of a person they are from their attitudes and behaviors. Bars, which were widely used in the past, were closed after the rise of the internet.

Social media platforms such as Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, and TikTok have revolutionized our lifestyle by enabling us to explore, create, connect, and consume various sorts of information. These platforms have not only created fresh opportunities but also expanded the horizons of life, enabling a more critical and transparent exploration of forbidden subjects. Sex labor has also become more readily available through digital platforms, such as OnlyFans and premium Snapchat accounts, which offer safer experiences for workers. Although these platforms do not eradicate sex

work, they facilitate and enhance the appeal of engaging in sex work. Online sex work reduces the necessity for in-person contact, hence decreasing the likelihood of sexual assault or transmission of sexually transmitted infections. Access is available to anyone who are at least 18 years old and possess a reliable internet connection. Engaging in digital sex work provides a means for disenfranchised persons to assert their sexual preferences, including their unique interests, fetishes, and sexual orientations. This allows consumers to explore their wants discreetly and privately (Garvey, 2022).

Highlighting the significance of the closure and utilization of bars, transgender sex workers, who actively seek a secure environment, explore alternative locations to carry out their profession when they are unable to access their rightful place in society and face segregation. The advent of online sex work has fundamentally revolutionized the domain of sex work research, leading scholars to investigate new and innovative questions. Online sex work refers to the transaction of sexual goods and services through the internet, with the intention of either offering these services or advertising them for physical encounters. As a result, sex workers have been able to carry out their businesses in innovative ways (Jones, 2015). I contend that the digital transformation following the pandemic has been driven by sex workers seeking alternative means of income due to the limitations imposed on their profession because of technological advancements. Furthermore, it is feasible to observe the aspects pertaining to the inclusion of trans women who engage in sex work within various aspects of the right to the city, such as entitlements to retirement benefits, alternative employment opportunities, and secure work environments.

In this section where I examine the possibility of safe spaces in sex work, I would like to emphasize that there are two different dimensions of strategies. The first one is sex work through digital platforms that started and transformed with the pandemic process. A strategy can be discussed that facilitates transformation by reinforcing the establishment of an alternative space and dismantling the existing order of hitchhiking while exploring diverse methods. Conversely, naturalization entails risk and violence by acknowledging the moral aspect of sex work within a heteropatriarchal framework. The acceptance of systematic violence represents a form of naturalization, whereas the

strategies employed to counteract violence—such as avoiding proximity to the client post-coitus and permitting the client to depart while maintaining composure—can be characterized as resistance and alternative methods for ensuring safety.

Another challenge in asserting rights is assessing the feasibility of engaging in sex work safely as a profession. The shift to digital platforms, evident in Turkey and Ankara alongside global trends post-pandemic, has emerged as an alternative avenue for many sex workers, resulting in a diversification of strategies for secure environments. The diversification of security strategies and tactics unveils novel methods for countering heteropatriarchal power dynamics. This can be perceived as a means for transgender women sex workers to assert their right to operate safely within urban environments. From an alternative perspective, I contend that the evolving landscapes of sex work should be viewed as a continuum, necessitating that the right to the city originates from the private domain of the home. This continuum delineates a spatial practice that ascends through various strata, including the private sphere/home, street, social environment, and society.

From a feminist standpoint, I would underscore the necessity of incorporating gender dynamics and heteropatriarchal power structures that influence access to urban spaces and security in the analysis of the right to the city. I contend that examining the integration of spatial practices within overarching systems of oppression, such as patriarchy and cisnormativity, ought to be incorporated into research on the right to the city.

Conversely, the continuum from private to public spaces illustrates the intersection of power dynamics with gender experiences, specifically regarding the regulation and marginalization of trans women's bodies in both domains. Consequently, the right to the city cannot be regarded as separate from gender inequality, power dynamics, and norms of heteronormativity. A feminist perspective on the right to the city must emphasize the visibility of intersectional inequalities and the pursuit of urban justice for all.

CHAPTER 5

5. NAVIGATING AND SHAPING THE URBAN SPACE AND EVERYDAY LIFE

The navigating and shaping of urban space encompasses the duration spent in both public and private areas, social interactions, mobility patterns, and the preferred regions and routes selected for security considerations. This discussion will address the relationship trans women sex workers cultivate with their residences and communities, which are private domains, as well as the strategies they employ in their daily struggles. These strategies demonstrate that the right to the city should extend beyond mere property rights and access, allowing various gender identities to assert their rights independent of heteropatriarchal power structures. In my thesis, I contend that the right to the city must adopt an inclusive perspective in daily life, while also considering gendered practices. I define the right to the city as a collective entitlement for all individuals utilizing urban space; a notion that includes security, access to services, involvement in decision-making and planning, bridging the public-private divide, robust urban mobility, belonging, and emancipation.

I will explore the various domains in which the concept of the right to the city intersects, ranging from everyday activities to social interactions and the realm of sex work. From a feminist standpoint, I will begin by focusing on the private sphere of home, namely on the everyday activities and physical areas within it. Everyone’s experience of everyday routines, as influenced by moral geographies, elicits unique emotions and memories. Transgender women have varying experiences based on their sexual orientation and occupation. Certeau emphasizes the importance of mobility in understanding urban space, particularly the act of walking, and its role in interpreting women's experiences of space and time in the city (Certeau, 1984). Locations consist of fragmented storylines that are hidden from those outside, accumulating moments

that can be unraveled but continue to exist in a mysterious state. The symbolizations are inherent in the body's perception of pain or pleasure, and their existence is a spatial activity that cannot be verbalized. From this perspective, the practice of walking has been employed to examine the connection and requirements formed with place by highlighting the significance of motion.

Seven of the interviewees were interviewed during the walk. The socio-spatial experiences section of the questionnaire was left until the walk, lasting 25 minutes on average. The interviewees were informed in advance and asked where they wanted to walk. In most cases, the interviewees wanted to be interviewed at the association, and close routes were preferred as walking areas. Frequently used transit routes, streets close to their homes, or streets where they usually prefer to walk were preferred. Interviewees who stated that they liked crowds, liveliness, and movement preferred more crowded streets, while those who preferred calmness and comfort preferred side streets, streets that not many people would prefer. However, the general conclusion is that the interviewees do not want to leave their safe spaces and want to stay in a particular area. The interviewees who wanted to walk near their homes introduced their neighborhoods by walking on the roads they pass by daily and near the parks they like visiting. On the other hand, the interviewees who had been living in the same neighborhoods for many years took care to pass through the routes they used in their daily routines, chatted with the neighbors and shopkeepers they met on the way, and greeted them.

Except for one of the participants who did not want to walk, the others who opted not to walk said that they did not have enough time for walking. The one participant who preferred not to walk stated that she did not want to because her family, friends, and close environment were in Ankara. The transgender woman said that she accepted herself to her family and society in complex ways and thought it would be unpleasant to meet someone on the road somehow. For this reason, she stated that she did not want to put her life in the eyes of the people around her and that she lived everything on a level. In the previous sections, it is seen that trans women keep themselves in the background, stay silent, underplay, and prefer to be less visible to avoid problems or as a solution to the issues they face.

Another remarkable situation during the march is the spatial memory, seen through the relationship established with space. Participants shared memories and stories describing their relationship with the place during the walk. During the walk, it was observed that the participants were quite sharing. Some memories based on their life story and showing how they have a memory of this place were shared on the street, one of the frequently preferred walking routes. One of these memories is the effort of a trans woman who left her home to establish her own life and the development of situations that made her feel better, which she described as miraculous one night when she was feeling evil. Because of this memory, the place of that space has remained more special and joyous. This place has become a special place for the participant when she wants to be alone.

During the walk with the other participant, the participant wandered through the streets and shops, which is one of her daily routines and which she often prefers. The participant defines herself as a trans woman with high self-confidence and is not afraid of people. She stated that she uses the same route every day. She stated that she loves walking and gains energy by walking. During the walk, she communicated comfortably and freely with people and observed no uneasiness, anxiety or discrimination.

Conversely, the participant has a strong and familiar bond with the store employees she regularly visits. The shopping process was conducted with humor, laughter, and enjoyment. Strolling along the streets is a familiar and routine activity for her, as she does it every morning and evening. She stated that she would visit these locations daily after work to divert her attention and that they were a regular destination. Intimate and memory-enhancing exchanges were crucial in transferring various memories during the walks with the interviewees. Below, we present the analyses and findings that correspond to the questions and topics addressed in the interviews. Firstly, the analysis will focus on the aspects of daily life, sense of belonging, and social environment. Next, attention will be given to work life and the socio-political perspective. Lastly, a spatial evaluation will be conducted, specifically focusing on Ankara.

5.1. Everyday Spaces and Daily Routines

By examining the daily activities and physical locations of trans women engaged in sex work, I aim to explore the relationship between their quest for the right to the city and their regular daily routine. Everyday life encompasses a range of experiences, particularly those that support the idea that space is influenced by recurring actions and that the importance of relationships becomes prominent. I analyze the connections that transgender women engaged in sex work in Ankara form with their environment during their daily activities, as well as the strategies and techniques they employ. I analyze the extent to which the spaces and evolving dynamics of sex in Ankara afford sex workers certain rights or limit their rights, as well as the specific demands made by sex workers. This section will address the conceptual issue that are prominent: de Carteau's (1994) tactics. I analyzed the spatial practices of trans women sex workers, specifically focusing on their strategies and the technologies of self. This analysis will be informed by Foucault's concept of how the self becomes a subject, particularly when examining seemingly mundane daily life practices.

Foucault posits that there exist technologies in four distinct forms, which, when combined, suggest that individuals are to be subjected to specific training and alterations. This involves not only the acquisition of specific skills in the traditional sense, but also the acquisition of attitudes. These technologies encompass two distinct categories: "technologies of power" (Foucault et al., 1988) that depersonalize individuals and dictate their interactions, leading to different forms of control or subjugation, and "techniques of self-fashioning" (Foucault et al., 1988) that empower individuals to modify their own body, mind, actions, and existence with the assistance of others, aiming to achieve a desired state of happiness, purity, wisdom, perfection, and immortality. According to Foucault, Aelius' letter to Fronto contains all the seemingly trivial aspects of everyday life. Nevertheless, these particulars hold significance as they provide insights into one's own thoughts and emotions. In their analysis of the discourse of sexuality, Foucault aims to demonstrate that the process of internalizing self-control in sexual matters compels individuals to engage in introspection for the purpose of self-awareness (Foucault et al., 1988).

Social life experiences, daily activities, socializing places, and people with whom close relationships are established give clues about the time spent in the space and the relationship established with the space. These clues give an idea from which rights the individual claims in their life experience in the city to which rights are fulfilled. In this context, trans women sex workers were asked about their daily routines, with whom they spend their social time, shopping venues and alternative venues. First, when asked about what they do in a typical day, their home life, with whom they live and their responsibilities, sex workers who are generally middle-aged and older have at least half an hour walk among their daily routines. The purpose of this walk is to meet their grocery needs, the association workers want to relieve the stress and anxiety of the day by walking on their way to and from work, and to meet the daily walking needs of their pets. On the other hand, the locations of the walks are generally similar, with Esat and Tunalı neighbourhoods being preferred. Besides, although the general perception that sex workers sleep late because they work until late hours is valid for most of the sex workers, they establish a relationship with the place by going out to make themselves feel good by starting the day early. During the discussion of her daily activities, Buket, one of the interviewees, expressed her fondness for walking and stated that she typically engages in a daily walk. Walking provides trans women with the chance to engage with the city and avoid social isolation. Despite not being accepted, these individuals are aware of their place in society. Rather than becoming invisible, they persist in existing on the streets, presenting themselves as women and asserting their normalcy. In this context, I link the aspiration to be considered "normal" with the notion of assimilating into societal norms and the inclination to conform to one of the two genders within the social framework (Marques, 2019; Namaste; Namaste, 2000)

Namaste (2000) contends that the act of transitioning is a direct result of the existence of gender binaries in Western societies, wherein individuals are compelled to adhere to one of two genders to evade mistreatment (Namaste, 2000). Marques (2019) articulates strategies for expressing gender that relate to conditioned preferences for transgender visibility and are linked to diverse politicized transgender narratives. Transgender individuals frequently adopt the appearance of either a male or female, choose not to reveal their gender identity, and often exert considerable effort to

replicate gender-specific characteristics. Individuals often choose to classify themselves along a continuum of masculinity or femininity, frequently opting not to reveal their transgender status to the public or doing so selectively based on the situation.

> "I walk for half an hour, an hour. I never isolate myself from society; I am at peace with myself no matter what. I don't isolate myself." (Buket)

Furthermore, some individuals expressed that they felt comfortable navigating public spaces, such as streets and public transportation, because they presented themselves in a manner that did not overtly reveal their transgender identity, likening themselves to being perceived as cisgender women. This discourse explores the act of selecting one of the two genders and adopting their appearance and lifestyle. Conversely, two of the individuals I interviewed expressed that they appear feminine while residing in Ankara, but shed this appearance when they visit their families. Their rationale stemmed from the belief that their families would be profoundly distressed and unwilling to embrace the circumstances. In my analysis, I contend that this phenomenon can be described as "masking," specifically as a manifestation of "forced masking" within the context of gender presentation strategies.

De Certeau's examination of urban life is a crucial element of daily existence, emphasizing the act of moving and walking to create a dynamic perception of urban environment. This viewpoint necessitates a more profound comprehension of women's spatial and temporal encounters in the urban environment, emphasizing alternative and more efficient approaches to comprehend and traverse city life (Beebeejaun, 2017). Conversely, walkers possess the capacity to temporarily take control of their surroundings, imbuing them with personal meaning, and bringing with them recollections of the past and feelings of the present. Transgender women who work in the sex industry assert their entitlement to the city by engaging in routine pedestrian activities within the urban environment and by sharing their personal spatial memories, perceptions, and experiences. Put simply, for these individuals, the concept of space takes on a new significance, and the act of walking grants them a sense of entitlement to the city. Defne's description of her feelings and perceptions while walking in Tunalı can be an example of this.

> "Walking in Tunalı makes me feel excellent. Well, in such a strange way, as if it has a limit, at any stage or place on the way out, things suddenly change. The motif is that people change. I mean, people's perceptions also change. It changes suddenly. It's strange, but I mean. You know, maybe the people there become like the people here when they don't come here, I don't know, but it changes a lot, so when people come here, it's like people who go to Izmir now say that they are from Izmir." (Defne)

Due to the nocturnal nature of their profession, sex workers typically commence their workday in the afternoon rather than the morning. Additionally, the participants note that they commence their day in the afternoon and typically dedicate their daily activities to domestic chores and prepping for the evening. Later in our discussion, I would like to emphasize that engaging in digital sexual activities diminishes sociability and consequently weakens one's connection to their surroundings. Participants who primarily participated in online sexual activities reported that they were required to remain at home constantly, as they had no control over when clients would contact them and request their services. Online sex workers experience restricted social interaction because of their occupation, which necessitates their constant availability to answer phone calls at any hour of the day. Consequently, they frequently allocate their time to staying at home or in proximity. Certain transgender sex workers opt to remain at home following their evening shift, choosing to socialize with individuals outside of their own circle. This limitation curtails their social engagement and enables them to uphold equilibrium in their lifestyles. From this perspective, I would like to emphasize that power strategies limit the prevalence of digital sex, particularly in the wake of the pandemic. Foucault's concept of governmentality highlights the diverse institutions, procedures, and strategies employed to exercise power, with a focus on the population, political economy, and security apparatus (Foucault, 1977). According to Foucault's interpretation of power, the notion of power is not inherently negative, but rather constructive and standardizing. From this perspective, it can be argued that the social and physical presence of sex work and transgender life is controlled by converting it into digital sex work (Foucault, 1977).

As previously highlighted, sex workers primarily work during night-time and must

always remain at home. Consequently, their regular walks and the connections they establish with the streets, often under the guise of engaging in market activities, attract attention. Aside from the regular household tasks and daily routine, individuals also engage in social activities outside of their homes, typically 2-3 times per week, as part of their interaction with the urban environment. It has been ascertained that the neighborhoods indicated for socializing are similar and near their residences. Typically, after having lunch with their friends in Tunalı, they tend to do their shopping and engage in evening entertainment in the same vicinity. Conversely, interviewees who are more socially engaged and energetic do not serve customers past a certain hour in the evening. Instead, they dedicate the remainder of the night to socializing with their friends within their own communities.

The most significant transformation in the social field has been the pandemic process. During the pandemic, people who are confined to their homes meet much less frequently for health reasons and are now content with talking on the phone. In addition, the relationship established with the space is generally through individual walks. The pandemic has had a profound effect on people's life, leading to a sense of confinement and a loss of freedom to pursue things that were once considered insignificant.

The onset of the pandemic has resulted in the confinement of most sex workers to their private sphere, due to alterations in working conditions and social life. Nevertheless, transgender women who reject societal scrutiny and the increasing reliance on digital technology opt for walking and engaging in diverse activities periodically to maintain their physical well-being in their everyday lives. The primary emphasis I wish to highlight is that engaging in regular walking is a highly significant means of demonstrating both social integration and personal presence. The demand for the right to the city encompasses this fundamental right as its core principle. Walking on streets that are accepted or less reacted to is a valuable way to assert one's right to the city.

The focus on temporality and spatiality in this context pertains to the need for secure and suitable timeframes for the social engagements of sex workers, who are required to work either during nighttime or daytime. One could argue that there is a demand for the entitlement to the urban environment, where individuals who have resided in a city

for an extended period expect the inclusion of spaces and social interactions that cater to their professional and social needs. Temporality has a significant impact on the daily schedules, work schedules, and social schedules of trans women who work in the sex industry. Hence, the temporal and spatial aspects of the everyday schedule can be regarded as essential in advocating for the right to the urban environment. Sex workers who work during the night typically begin their day after 14:00 and structure their daily routine accordingly. On the other hand, sex workers who work digitally throughout the day are actively seeking a suitable location to socialize during the night.

The development of strategies through the experience of daily challenges enables individuals to navigate society, gain acceptance, establish a secure environment, and assume accountability. Consequently, the ability of transgender women who work in the sex industry to participate in society and engage in social interactions can influence the attitudes and behaviors they adopt from their daily routines and lives. Below, I thoroughly examine the relationship established with society through these tactics.

5.2. Access to community and Social Interactions

The first of the series of questions asked to understand the claims of trans sex workers for the right to the city and how accessible these rights are is aimed at understanding the socio-cultural experiences. Socio-cultural experiences are associated with the neighborhood and neighborhood relations with which close relations are established, and it is aimed at understanding the relationship with the community and expectations established with the space. In this direction, while most of the interviewees live about Esat, others live in GOP, Ayrancı, and Kızılay. In general, it was observed that living in Çankaya and quieter, crowded, and cosmopolitan neighborhoods was preferred. Most women in these neighborhoods have been living in these neighborhoods for at least 6 years.

In the 5 neighborhoods stated above, the participants were asked why they preferred to live in these neighborhoods. From this point of view, community relationships and the perception of safe space in urban space were tried to be understood. The

participants were observed to lead lives concentrated in specific neighborhoods of Ankara. The three indicated neighborhoods are the so-called "elite" neighborhoods in the city of Ankara, where the middle-upper income group, intellectual knowledge, and employees/officers of public institutions mostly live. According to the interviewees, the opportunities for socializing, distance to social areas, and accessibility were prioritized when choosing where they live. In addition, some women prefer to live in the neighborhood because of their friends from their own communities. Concerned about the potential disruption of its conservative supporter base and the desired social structure, the current local government is pushing towards the opposing neighborhood of Çankaya. It regulates power dynamics concerning transgender individuals, sometimes by restricting and other times by partially relaxing them. Power is inherent in its ability to shape and determine the physical form.

As stated by the interviewee, when a livelier and more vibrant social environment is desired, the Kızılay neighborhood is preferred, considering the socio-economic status. Kızılay neighborhood is preferred because of its proximity to entertainment venues and as a region where the activity remains intense at night. Güneş, who had just moved to Ankara from Izmir, moved to Kızılay with the suggestion of her friend that Kızılay would be the most suitable place for her to do sex work and financially, and she stated that Kızılay does not resemble the mobility of Izmir.

> "I like Tunalı, the composer side more. It's like this. Since I can find everything, I either go shopping or sit somewhere. But I like the Çukurambar side more. Because I like bigger areas like that. I like those places. I hate Kızılay; in fact, I don't like it at all. I would never go there if I didn't have to, except for that. The third place is Ayrancı. I like this place. Atakule and so on." (Azra)

The other reason for the interviewees who prefer to live in crowded and busy neighborhoods is the freedom to use the space without drawing attention and standing out. They state that they can be themselves more freely in crowded areas and socialize and blend into the space. Conversely, residing in areas of Ankara with lower income groups and education levels than other neighborhoods can lead to concerns of stigmatization, humiliation, and exposure to violence. From this point of view, it can be inferred that the intensity of mobility in the relationship established with the space

reduces trans-sex workers' spatial freedoms and the possibility of exclusion.

The interviewees who described the neighborhoods they live in with their calmness, quality, and understanding people mostly live around Ayrancı, GOP, and Esat. They desire to reside in a high-quality location that preserves their tranquility while also enabling them to have a stronger connection with their community. It is stated that individuals in specific neighborhoods, such as Seyran and Oran, have withdrawn into seclusion. Additionally, they express their satisfaction with the pleasant living conditions in Kavaklıdere, a neighborhood in Ankara that is widely recognized and appreciated. Additionally, they refer to the Çankaya region, renowned for its progressive community and a higher population density. Additionally, they emphasize the importance of dressing modestly in Keçiören, a densely populated area with a larger proportion of middle-aged and elderly residents. In addition, they acknowledge the possibility of problematic vehicles in their vicinity. The speaker acknowledges their inability to reside in every neighborhood of Ankara and recognizes the necessity of selecting their preferred one.

Esat region is seen as the most preferred region for sex workers due to its proximity to entertainment venues and hitchhiking streets or as a place where sex work was learnt before moving to Ayrancı region and where it is easy to do their profession. Although discrimination and exclusion are generally encountered, it was reported that trans sex workers living in the Küçükesat district could move more freely and socialize. On the other hand, job opportunities are also cited as one of the main reasons for living in these regions. Transgender individuals frequently encounter restricted housing choices in their locality because of employment circumstances, interactions with customers, and various other factors. Due to the lack of high-speed internet, they chose to reside in more convenient accommodations close to their place of work. Nevertheless, individuals frequently exhibit a lack of concern regarding their circumstances, thereby impeding their ability to locate appropriate housing.

Although not all areas of Çankaya have the same characteristics, the areas where higher income and educated groups live that allow for accessible spaces and make you feel safe. As Akrep emphasizes:

> "In other words, being among more elite people, more open-minded people, people who do not marginalize you makes you feel happy and safe. For this reason, Çankaya is a region consisting of a mass of people marginalized by the lower stratum, so to speak, or the stratum that does not develop itself. In other words, people in this region like to live free, drink alcohol, don't know, can dance comfortably; it is a neighborhood suitable for us trans people because it consists of a human society that can walk on the street with cleavage. But not every neighborhood of Çankaya." (Akrep)

The interviewees are in different neighborhoods, however, all of them reside specifically in the Çankaya district. Consequently, the aforementioned factors contribute to making the Çankaya district a more habitable location for trans women engaged in sex work. While the neighborhoods are divided based on social classes, there is occasional movement between these areas, and similar strategies are typically used in each neighborhood to foster community relations and facilitate community access. These strategies apply to individuals who have resided in their respective neighborhoods for an extended period, those who have formed connections with their neighbors, and those who are in the initial stages of establishing relationships.

> "In Kızılay, I can actually see people that everyone can visit and see around here. I can meet every profile here, but of course, there are fixed people who live near my house; there are shopkeepers or people who live there. Our dialogue with them is different, official or sincere. But since there are all kinds of people in Kızılay, maybe I like it, so you don't stand out too much in this crowd. I mean, maybe if I lived in Keçiören, they would point the finger at me from a hundred meters away, but when I live in Kızılay, it's like you can blend in with the normal crowd and walk around." (Aysu)

As stated above, most of the interviewees are sex workers who have been living in the same neighborhood and house for many years; therefore, their neighborhood relations and relations with shopkeepers are warm and close. It was emphasized that there is an environment in their neighborhood where everyone knows each other, helps each other, is in solidarity, and socializes. Cresswell (1996) argues that the urban environment is characterized by "appropriate" spaces that are filled with

interpretations considered acceptable by dominant social groups. These spaces fulfil diverse functions, and the connection between a place and its significance is robust and communal (Cresswell, 1996). The built environment concretizes these significations, rendering them susceptible to scrutiny and opposition, thereby enabling social collectives to establish their own perception of locality. On the other hand, it is seen in terms of bodies that are adapted and disciplined by the effects of the social network to gain a place and be accepted within the neighborhood culture. The body is an unfinished, uncertain, and shapeless entity that necessitates social stimulation, organization, and sustained management. The human body acquires its definition of experience and subjectivity through the influence of others and the Symbolic order. Key organizing principles encompass sexual desires, socially constructed meanings, as well as discipline and training. The body's physiological processes are synchronized and harmonized to facilitate its engagement in social activities and become an essential component of a social network (Grosz, 2005). Within this context, it was emphasized that transgender women who engaged in sex work strategically chose to wait for a certain period to elapse to maintain positive and robust relationships with their neighbors. This approach aims to foster understanding among their neighbors, highlighting that they possess the same qualities as any other individual, such as being compassionate, genuine, and supportive. Indeed, four individuals I interviewed indicated that they purchase bread and prepare meals for the lower socioeconomic bracket and elderly residents in their apartments and make visits to them when they are unwell.

The participants discussed their interactions with their neighbors, specifically focusing on the efforts they made to gain acceptance and highlighting the importance of personal responsibility in fostering positive neighborly relationships. They asserted that to cultivate positive relationships with neighbors and shopkeepers, it is imperative for them to consciously choose to exhibit behaviors that do not provoke conflicts or disrupt the tranquility of the apartment building. My interviewees expressed their efforts to engage in social interactions with others. I endeavor to gain their acceptance to the greatest extent possible. "I mean, it is your responsibility." Considering the information provided in these sentences and viewpoints, I would like to discuss Foucault's (1977, 155) notions of internalized self-surveillance and control. A

controlling gaze is a gaze that individuals internalize to the extent that they become their own supervisors, exercising self-supervision.

> "I don't like to fight, I hate it, I mean I am very harmonious, I am soft, I am very patient. There, they got used to the neighbours, for example, we were doing things with our women in the neighbourhood. I once got a little intimate with them. With some of them, the milkman came, I went outside to buy milk. Then he called out, "Don't go." I said, "Don't go." He said it wasn't him. It's not. He said OK, he'll go. I asked when. He said tomorrow. It was the next day. We went together, we bought milk, we fermented yoghurt, we did whatever. I had such neighbourly relations. But I mean, if it was the other way round, I would have lived there for a year at most." (Defne)

Merely being observed leads to most individuals engaging in self-monitoring and self-restraint (Johnston & Longhurst, 2010). Transgender sex workers engage in self-surveillance as a deliberate strategy, influenced by their own behavior and acceptance. This aligns with Foucault's concept of self-surveillance, as transgender sex workers have internalized the practice of monitoring and controlling their own actions. Upon analyzing the presentation strategies of gender as spatial practices, we encounter Marques's (2019) strategy of 'blending in.' Trans women sex workers employ diverse strategies to acclimate to their neighborhoods, residences, and social contexts in Ankara, which is evident in their spatial practices (Marques, 2019). These practices, including wearing suitable attire, refraining from loud speech, avoiding outbursts, and preventing disturbances in their communities, are social behaviors manifested in the environment and grounded in self-surveillance. Consequently, I underscore the adaptation strategy referred to as 'the self-surveillance that penetrates the capillaries' (Foucault, 1977).

> "There was an excellent butcher and florist in my neighborhood. I used to sit at your doorstep, drink tea, and so on. They all love me there, the butcher. They all like me. I mean, it is due to yourself." (Burcu)

> "My neighbors are like this. I don't want to disturb anyone because I am a conscious person. After all, I am doing this business. I choose my customers

accordingly as much as I can. I try not to disturb anyone as much as I can; I am in contact. In the end, as I said, we live in a cultured neighbourhood. I am in a place where no one interferes with anyone's private life." (İrem)

The opposite tactic is to keep relations with neighbors and people at a distance. Another statement is that unneighborly relations would be more possible if they were engaged in a regular profession. Stating that she keeps her neighbors at a distance because her routine is different from other people since she works, Azra emphasized that she greeted her neighbors but did not establish close relations with them. Azra clarifies that she engages in greetings as part of her professional obligations and endeavors to maintain distance from individuals. Azra also stresses her preference for avoiding unexpected visits to her residence, as she may have a visitor or be occupied with work. She strives to uphold amicable relations by avoiding entanglements with others.

When asked whether they encountered any problems in their relations with their neighbors, 6 of the participants stated that they were not wanted in the apartment building, they had arguments, they wanted to be sent away by collecting signatures, and they were excluded because of their gender and occupation when they first moved to their houses. While describing these situations, it was stated that the residents of the apartment building and neighborhood residents were distant in the beginning because they thought that being transgender gave people fear, that being sex workers would cause unrest in the building, and that they exhibited behaviors that were not in accordance with the moral understanding of the society. In time, the participants were accepted by making themselves look good with their calm behaviors, not disturbing the building, and being on their own, and they developed excellent relations with their neighbors.

Participants highlighted the absence of education, cultural awareness, and overall standards in their apartment complex when discussing their interactions with their neighbors. Despite encountering initial challenges, they were ultimately embraced once they recognized that they were not participating in sensationalistic conduct. However, despite receiving protection from certain neighboring countries, they acknowledge that their freedom is not boundless. Consequently, they strive

collectively to portray themselves in the most favorable manner. They acknowledge that they will face criticism when they excel, but they persist in prioritizing their own welfare.

As for the shopkeepers, although positive relationships have been established in social terms, it has been reported that women who are understood to be transgender have financial difficulties. The situation encountered both in renting a house and in grocery shopping is conveyed to the person who is learnt to be transgender by raising the price and saying many times more. Another problem experienced by neighbors and the neighborhood is the family apartments and conservative perspectives that may affect the daily lives of trans women sex workers. It is thought that when a sex worker chooses to live in a "normal" family apartment, she may stand out when outsiders come, and problems may arise. According to the participants, some people complained about this situation. Neighbors complained to the landlord about the sound of high heels and noise in the house. According to Azra, the landlord stood by her tenant and talked to the disturbed neighbor, thinking that it was a reaction against identity.

Transgender sex workers express their desired relationships with their communities in diverse ways. I want to highlight the significance of temporality in this context, as a sex worker who has resided in the same neighborhood for an extended period can experience changes and enhancements in her connection with the community due to a particular occurrence. According to one of the interviewees, as trans women become acquainted with their neighbors, they are gradually accepted by them as they come to realize that trans women are ordinary individuals and not a threat. Temporality, in conjunction with spatiality, enhances social connections and interactions, thereby facilitating the emergence of social spaces. Put simply, when the frequency of the milkman they both visit in their local area increases or when the market gains more significance, their bond grows stronger, and a demand arises. From this perspective, we observe the enhancement and unobstructed area created by the combination of spatiality and temporality. This open space exemplifies the shared desire for peace and acceptance in social relationships among both the neighborhood residents and transgender women. It also reflects the collective aspiration for a cohesive and emancipatory neighborhood that upholds the right to the city.

Thus, I have observed that the concept of temporality can also foster a feeling of belonging and integration within a given space. In the following section, I explore the sense of belonging experienced by transgender women who work in the sex industry and are accepted by their social circles in Ankara. I also discuss their aspirations and goals in relation to the concept of the right to the city.

5.3. Trans Women Sex Workers and the Concept of "Belonging"

Tovi Fenster (2005) examines the matter of women's rights in urban environments, emphasizing the differential impact of patriarchal power dynamics on their rights compared to men's. She uncovers the constraints placed on women's rights in both public and private domains, which ultimately curtails their sense of inclusion. Fenster's research emphasizes the common utilization and assertion of urban places in the formation of a sense of belonging (Fenster, 2005). Gendered practices impose limitations on women's rights and their exclusion from spaces controlled by males. Conversely, mothers' daily routines and enhanced understanding of these spaces reinforce their sense of belonging in the city as they navigate through them as part of their daily responsibilities (Beebeejaun, 2017). While Fenster (2005) conducted research specifically focused on women, I contend that trans women who work in the sex industry also encounter this phenomenon due to the presence of gender dichotomy and adherence to heteronormative norms (Fenster, 2005).

The interviewees have resided in the same neighborhoods and buildings for many years. In this context, the pride and sense of belonging they feel towards their neighborhoods also indicate their expectations from the city. From this point of view, the interviewees were asked, "Do you feel that you belong to the place where you live?" and "How do you feel in the neighborhood where you live? Can you express it in 3 words?" According to the answers received, it is seen that most of the participants feel safe and peaceful in their neighborhoods. They especially note that they can go out and take a walk during the day and feel happy due to the warm relations established with the neighborhood, giving them a sense of belonging. On the other hand, the fact that a more intellectual group lives in the neighborhood and that there are public institutions, embassies, and security points in the neighborhood caused the

interviewees to choose houses in that area and respond to their search for security. The speaker recounts their 22-year tenure in a secure, sophisticated, and courteous neighborhood in Ankara. They have established friendships with individuals in their local community, including mechanics and milkmen, and have successfully maintained a strong bond with their neighbors. The speaker also appreciates the vibrant nightlife and the central location of Ankara, which makes it a hub for entertainment and cultural activities. The speaker asserts that their neighborhood is secure, pleasant, and aesthetically pleasing.

From another perspective, the fact that trans women can freely express their identities and lives is a pattern that strengthens the sense of belonging. It has been observed that trans women who can stand on their own feet, live their sexuality freely and live without hiding their identities feel happier and belong to their neighborhood. In addition, the participants indicated that if the same infrastructure were established in another neighborhood, they would also feel happy there. It is possible to discuss a demand for the right to the city here. Furthermore, I contend that according to Fenster (2005), a feeling of belonging is strengthened as individuals engage with the urban environment and form connections. Put simply, trans women are confined to their homes due to their employment and exclusion, preventing them from fully exercising their right to the city. They assert this right by engaging in regular walks and experiencing a sense of belonging to the city where they have resided and interacted for many years. Defne provides a testimony of her emotional experience when she visited her family and sat in the garden of her childhood home. Despite her familiarity with the garden, she grew up in, she does not feel a sense of belonging to it. Instead, she longs for the comfort of her own home and neighborhood.

> "But I feel I belong to Ankara. For example, I go home on holidays. As I said, the street we live on is a street where everyone knows each other. We were sitting in the garden. I felt for a moment that I didn't feel like I belonged there. I don't feel like I belong to anything, I mean I felt strange. It was a strange feeling." (Defne)

Four participants expressed a preference for their homes, stating that they felt the most at ease and a strong sense of belonging exclusively in that environment. The domestic

realm is an important aspect of human existence that encompasses both feelings of belonging and feelings of alienation. It holds significant meanings, emotions, experiences, and relationships (Blunt & Varley, 2004). Thus, the domestic sphere, which encompasses both feelings of belonging and alienation, provides an environment where sex workers can experience increased safety, tranquility, and authenticity. Sex workers often find their homes to be a secure environment, as other spaces tend to be influenced by a heterosexual perspective. From this perspective, the violence and segregation encountered in urban areas prevent trans women from venturing outside their homes and confine them to their safe spaces.

Disciplining one's own behavior and practicing self-surveillance are crucial aspects of my thesis. These measures aim to promote peace, safety, inclusivity, and prevent harm. Self-surveillance, a concept discussed in previous chapters and to be further explored in subsequent chapters, resurfaces in relation to personal security. The participants assert that by attentively monitoring their own behaviors and attitudes, and by taking care of themselves, individuals can experience a sense of freedom and well-being regardless of their location. The notion that an individual's behavior may influence their perception of security has been encountered on numerous occasions. The behavior of individuals seeking personal security is believed to drive the demand for security measures.

Besides, sex workers who cannot disclose their identities, cannot freely practice their professions and experience discrimination while living in small cities stated that they come to big cities like Ankara to get rid of the pressures and violence against them. In this context, Ankara, as a big city, offers a space of freedom for trans sex workers. On the other hand, as we stated before, for trans women who have been living in Ankara since they were born or have been living in this city for a while, especially the neighborhoods of Ankara where they can live in their own bodies and feel free have been expressed as the areas where they feel they belong. This is because they feel freer and at home where they can express themselves and live their identities openly.

They identify more with being a native of Ankara due to having spent most of their life there. They reminisce about a specific instance when they experienced a sense of

not fitting in within a garden, and upon reflection, they felt a peculiar detachment and lack of connection to the urban environment. Compared to other cities and districts, the interviewees liken living in Ankara to consuming hot and sweet chilies. From this perspective, it can be asserted that transgender women experience a sense of belonging to Ankara, their residences, or more specifically, the environments where they can authentically express their identities. While I acknowledge that sexist practices curtail the right to the city and impede freedom, they also foster a sense of inclusion and liberty for trans women sex workers residing in Ankara. Transgender women sex workers assert their right to the city by designating Ankara and the surrounding area as their neighborhoods and cities. They employ diverse strategies and methods of resistance to assert and secure this right. Describing the claim as being reinforced and energized by a feeling of belonging aligns with the perspectives expressed by the interviewees.

Lefebvre emphasizes that the right to the city includes the right to access, participation and ownership of urban spaces. If the right to ownership here is perceived as the right to belonging and the right to adopt the space, unlike the right to property, it can be assumed that the sense of belonging is a demand for the right to the city.

The most notable characteristic of trans women sex workers residing in Ankara, which necessitates investigation, is the nature of their sex work and the dynamic conditions it undergoes over time and in different locations. In the preceding sections, we have discussed the multifaceted social, individual, and spatial ramifications of engaging in sex work, whether during the day or at night. From this perspective, I would like to highlight in this final section that certain rights assertions stem from spatial and temporal factors. I would like to discuss this section thoroughly and separately due to the altered nature of the sex work industry following the pandemic and the implementation of different legal regulations.

CHAPTER 6

6. CONCLUSION

The research examines the challenges faced by transgender sex workers in Ankara in their pursuit of urban rights, emphasizing their spatial strategies and methods of resistance. It recognizes feminist critique that the concept of the right to the city insufficiently represents patriarchy and power dynamics, proposing that it should originate from the private and domestic spheres. The study seeks to demonstrate that the right to the city encompasses the struggles and resistances inherent in the daily lives of those who are marginalized and rendered invisible.

Trans women, akin to all marginalized populations, confront numerous challenges to navigate discrimination, exclusion, and violence in their daily existence, social interactions, and professional endeavors. These manifestations of resistance emerge as strategies in everyday life and various domains, transcending conventional interpretations of the right to the city, including property and accessibility.

The thesis contends that the right to the city ought to embrace a more inclusive perspective by considering gendered practices in daily life. The right to the city is defined as the entitlement for all individuals to safely utilize urban spaces, access services equitably, engage in decision-making processes, and transcend the public-private divide. It perceives robust urban mobility focused on belonging and emancipation as integral to the right to the city.

The study examines the reflections of trans sex workers' resistance in asserting their right to the city through spatial practices, contending that such practices of resistance facilitate the redefinition and appropriation of spaces. The thesis examines two primary

themes: the navigating and shaping of urban space in daily life and the strategies for asserting the right to the city, assessed through the analysis of tactics employed in everyday activities, commercial endeavors, and social interactions within the urban environment on spatial practices.

I asked two research questions that guided this study.

Research Question 1: How do trans sex workers' claims for the right to the city emerge in their spatial practices and forms of resistance?

Research Question 2: How do trans women sex workers navigate and shape urban environments through their strategies and practices? Do these interactions expand or constrain their access to the right to the city?

To find answers to my research questions, I conducted in-depth face-to-face interviews. In doing so, I used the walking method and had the opportunity to observe the participants' relationship with the space one-on-one. In my thesis, what I clearly want to reach is that the right to the city produces exclusion based on heteronormative norms and the right to the city is distributed unequally. The conclusion I reached in my thesis is that trans sex workers develop some tactics and express their claims against the unequally distributed right to the city. These tactics are sometimes aimed at protecting their bodies and identities, but in addition to these, as individuals who experience the city, they claim the right to the city as a cry and a compelling demand, in Lefebvre's words. In spatiality and temporality, the right to the city manifests at various points in the lives of everyone. With these manifestations, I argue that trans women sex workers' relationship with space develops and contributes to their empowerment as individuals and communities.

The inclusion of interviewees who did not engage in the walking method facilitated a critique by enabling us to examine the limitations and inaccessible aspects of the walking method. The reasons for non-participation, including insecurity and spatial fears, offered a critical perspective on the method and highlighted the need to assess not only the experiences of participants but also the unseen spatial practices of non-

participants. Additionally, the experiences of non-participants may contrast with those of participants in the walking method, offering a significant perspective for comprehending the emotional and social dimensions of urban space. Participants may express their spatial existence through alternative means, such as domestic strategies, indicating that the right to the city extends beyond physical spaces to encompass invisible practices and strategies.

The reasons for non-participation offer significant insights into urban exclusion and access barriers, enabling an analysis of factors such as security concerns, social stigmatization, and economic issues. This enhanced the representativeness of the study by incorporating the experiences of both participants and non-participants, thereby establishing a more inclusive framework. This work has enhanced the understanding of the diversity and intersectional experiences of trans women regarding the right to the city, while also strengthening the discourse on invisibility, security, and resistance within feminist spatial theories. The inclusion of interviewees who did not engage in the walking method enhanced the study both theoretically and practically, facilitating a more comprehensive and multidimensional analysis of trans women's interactions with the city.

In this context, I analyze my thesis through two main themes: These themes are the use and occupation of urban space in everyday life and the methods of claiming the right to the city. Both themes will be evaluated through the reflection of the tactics developed in daily life, business life and social times in the city on spatial practices.

The theme of ways of claiming rights includes trans sex workers' demands for access, security or recognition in urban areas, their visibility, their participation in protests for their rights in urban areas, and their interaction with civil society organizations to defend their rights. The subheading of this theme covers the degree of visibility in public spaces (for example, being present in nightlife, markets or streets without police intervention) and conditions depending on the venues of sex work. These conditions convey which forms of struggle the right to the city is transformed into and reflected in spatial practices.

The theme of use and occupation of urban space refers to the ways trans sex workers use, navigate and relate to urban space in their daily lives. It focuses on the frequency of occupying certain urban spaces (streets, parks, nightlife areas), the types of public and private spaces used for entertainment or community building. The subtitle of the theme refers to the social time spent in space, the use of alternative spaces to focus on neighborhood culture and belonging, and the areas and routes frequently used for security reasons. In doing so, the demographic and economic characteristics of the variables will be taken into consideration.

The other The other theme is strategies of demanding the right to the city. Space has the capacity to be both inclusive and comprehensive, but it can also serve as a divisive barrier that isolates and marginalizes individuals who are perceived as different or deviating from the norm. To comprehend the spatial perceptions of trans women in Ankara, it is essential to clarify the distinction between public and private spaces. Public spaces are delineated by the conventions of society, whereas private spaces are frequently disregarded as realms where disparities and responsibilities endure. Gender tyranny manifests in public spaces when certain individuals enforce heteronormative gender norms with authority. Semi-public spaces, which are privately owned, permit public gatherings under specific regulations and conditions, while also accommodating gender fluidity. Private spaces can function as sanctuaries or areas of exclusion.

Ankara has been assessed in terms of housing rights, healthcare accessibility, transportation systems, shopping facilities, and social spaces based on the experiences of transgender women engaged in sex work. The evaluations reveal significant deficiencies in the provision of housing and access to healthcare services. Participants expressed challenges in locating available rental properties, as landlords increased rental prices specifically for individuals who identify as transgender. Additionally, it was recognized that not all individuals contribute a residence, and those who do frequently generously offer more than three houses to the recipient.

Transgender women in Ankara experience restricted availability of transportation, housing, and health services in comparison to other cities. They prefer utilizing public

transportation, particularly during the evening hours, and engage in walking as a means of socializing. Nevertheless, they refrain from utilizing these services due to apprehensions regarding harassment and violence. Transgender women in Ankara encounter substantial obstacles when trying to access social services, such as discrimination and exclusion. They frequently refrain from seeking admission to institutions and organizations that offer financial assistance and support due to phobic behaviors and attitudes, as well as a lack of trust. The absence of formal documentation and transparency in accessing social services further impedes their engagement.

Transgender individuals encounter discrimination in accessing health services, especially in private hospitals or polyclinics, because of financial limitations. They may face significant discrimination at hospitals and from healthcare professionals in their workplace. In addition, they may experience despair and hesitancy to advocate for their rights, as they are frequently perceived as the instigators of crime and as victims rather than solely as victims themselves.

The availability of urban services is directly linked to concerns regarding accessibility and safety. Unsecure areas may serve as transit zones rather than being actively utilized spaces, emphasizing the significance of security for transgender women involved in sex work. Visibility can be achieved through security measures and physical presence. However, it is of utmost importance for transgender women to effectively navigate these challenges and guarantee the protection of their rights. Transgender women working in the sex industry place a high importance on their personal safety by developing tactics to safeguard themselves in social circles, workplaces, and relationships with neighbors. They hold the belief that they are unable to assert their rights, even when they actively seek assistance from the police station. They make purchases cautiously and approach the police station composedly, having faith that God will grant them the opportunity to assert their rights.

The visibility of transgender women engaged in sex work in Ankara has been impacted by multiple factors, such as conservative policies, political discourses, the COVID-19 pandemic, the extensive utilization of the internet, and legal regulations. The pandemic has hindered their capacity to venture outside, resulting in financial setbacks and

extreme destitution. Transgender sex workers have become increasingly isolated from their social circles, as online platforms have become more dominant. To improve visibility, there are specific locations and landmarks that can be utilized, such as Kızılay, Tunalı, Esat, Hoşdere, and Atakule. These areas provide a feeling of inclusion and a sense of community for individuals who appreciate strolling in these locations. Nevertheless, there remains a requirement for additional inclusive and secure environments for transgender women engaged in sex work within the city.

It revolves around strategies formulated based on these relationships, encompassing daily routines, societal inclusion, social engagements, sense of community, and working environment. Societal access and social relations pertain to the capacity to engage with the local community and forge connections with local enterprises. This section examines the different areas in which the idea of the right to the city overlaps, encompassing everyday actions, social connections, and the field of sex work. From a feminist perspective, the domestic realm, encompassing daily activities and physical spaces within it, evokes distinct emotions and memories. Certeau highlights the significance of mobility in comprehending urban space, specifically the act of walking, and its function in interpreting women's encounters with space and time in the city.

De Certeau's analysis of urban life highlights the significance of mobility and pedestrian activity in shaping a vibrant understanding of the urban landscape. Walkers possess the ability to temporarily exert influence over their environment, infusing it with personal significance and evoking memories of the past and emotions of the present. For these individuals, the idea of space becomes more meaningful, and walking gives them a feeling of ownership over the city.

The fact that they work at night also impacts their daily schedules, as they commence their workday in the afternoon and allocate their daily tasks to household chores and preparing for the evening. Participating in digital sexual activities reduces sociability and undermines one's connection to their environment. Power strategies effectively mitigate the prevalence of digital sexual activity, especially in the aftermath of the pandemic. Foucault's concept of governmentality emphasizes the various institutions, procedures, and strategies used to exert power, particularly in relation to the

population, political economy, and security apparatus.

The demand for the right to the city centers around this fundamental right as its central principle. Engaging in pedestrian activities on streets that are widely acknowledged or receive minimal resistance is a significant method to assert one's entitlement to the urban environment. The concepts of temporality and spatiality are crucial in promoting the right to the urban environment.

Understanding the access of transgender women in the sex industry to community and social interactions is crucial for comprehending their socio-cultural experiences. Most interviewees reside in tranquil, densely populated, and culturally diverse neighborhoods, such as Çankaya, GOP, Ayrancı, and Kızılay, which prioritize social interaction, proximity to social hubs, and ease of access. Certain women are drawn to these neighborhoods because of the presence of their friends from their own communities, whereas others are attracted to bustling and lively neighborhoods for the ability to utilize the space without attracting notice or appearing conspicuous.

To summarize, the level of mobility in the relationship formed with the physical environment diminishes the spatial liberties of trans-sex workers and limits the likelihood of their exclusion. Gaining insight into the socio-cultural encounters of transgender women working in the sex industry can assist them in effectively navigating societal norms and asserting their entitlements to urban spaces.

The constructed physical surroundings solidify these interpretations, rendering them open to examination and resistance. Transgender women who work as sex workers intentionally delay engaging in their profession for a specific duration to cultivate positive relationships with their neighbors, thereby promoting empathy and comprehension. In addition, they acquire bread and cook meals for individuals in the lower socioeconomic stratum and elderly inhabitants of their apartments and pay visits to them when they are in poor health.

Transgender sex workers actively practice self-surveillance as a conscious tactic, which is shaped by their own actions and level of acceptance. They keep a distance

from their neighbors and avoid unexpected visits to their home to maintain friendly relations. At first, they encountered obstacles such as gender and occupational discrimination, but eventually, they gained acceptance by displaying composed demeanor and keeping a certain level of distance.

Sex workers who are unable to reveal their identities, face restrictions in carrying out their occupations, and encounter prejudice in smaller urban areas frequently migrate to larger cities such as Ankara to evade the burdens and violence inflicted upon them. In Ankara, there are certain neighborhoods where trans women experience a greater sense of freedom and belonging, feeling more at ease and accepted. Transgender women living in Ankara, Turkey, feel a stronger connection to their hometown because they have been there for a long time. They experience a strong sense of affiliation and attachment to the urban setting, perceiving residing in Ankara as analogous to consuming chili peppers. Sexist practices in Ankara limit the rights and freedom of transgender women in the city. However, these practices also contribute to the inclusion and liberty of transgender women. They exercise their entitlement to the urban environment by officially designating Ankara and its surrounding region as their residential districts and municipalities.

The extensive utilization of social media among individuals engaged in sex work has resulted in heightened social seclusion and diminished interpersonal interaction. These issues have raised concerns regarding substance dependence, housing conditions, and social seclusion. The Red Umbrella Associations contend that although reducing violence can have the effect of diminishing violence, it can also give rise to heightened psychological problems and a sense of isolation.

Transgender women engaged in sex work experience heightened financial apprehension and vulnerability because of inconsistent earnings and the absence of insurance coverage, ultimately resulting in financial instability. They are compelled to engage in sex work as a means of earning a livelihood, often because of work environments that marginalize them based on their identities. In addition, they hold the belief that having a partner is a mandatory requirement in Turkey, which poses challenges for them in pursuing their desired profession or advocating for their rights.

De Certaeu highlights that individuals who navigate through space perceive urban life as a domain of micropolitics, emphasizing the notion that walking offers a comprehensive comprehension of the urban surroundings. De Certaeu highlights the significance of physical activities, such as walking, in asserting individual and communal rights within urban settings (de Certeau, 1984; Bebeejaun, 2017). From this point of view, the actions and tactics developed on the space bear the traces of collective or individual awareness and struggle. In this thesis, I argue that the daily life experiences of trans women sex workers turn into resistance mechanisms through the tactics developed and pave the way for their access to the city. As Soja (2010) and Buckingham (2010) emphasize, the right to the city is a common right that applies to all individuals as well as enabling an empowering unity for the pursuit of spatial justice and democratic rights. Therefore, I argue that the tactics developed for urban access also enable empowering unity for the right to the city. Tactics are forms of reclaiming space and making it accessible (Taşçıoğlu, 2010).

Put simply, the use of tactics and the presence of urban environments contribute to empowerment by allowing individuals to openly express their identities, as highlighted by Doan (2010). The identification of safe spaces for individuals to freely express their gender has contributed to their resilience and ability to openly display gender diversity and transgender identity in society at large (Doan, 2010). Hence, the primary inference of my thesis is that to gain visibility, familiarity, establish connections, receive recognition, and demand participation, one must traverse these ordinary public spaces where chance encounters and everyday engagement occur. These spaces serve as arenas where individuals encounter and confront inequalities, while also engaging in negotiation and resistance. Within my thesis, I contend that these interactions can pose a formidable obstacle within the framework of the right to the city and serve to enhance individuals' sense of agency.

I assert that spatial practices that resist change facilitate the redefinition and appropriation of spaces. The strategies observable in the lives of transgender sex workers, encompassing their daily activities and social interactions, are manifested in the intimate relationships they foster within their communities, the acceptance they

garner from their neighborhoods, the security protocols they implement by utilizing online platforms for client engagement in their professional endeavors, and the sense of belonging they derive from their navigation of these environments. In this context, my thesis emphasizes that these interactions and strategies transform into conflicts over the right to the city and can promote empowerment through the assertion of a claim.

6.1. Limitations of the Study and Recommendation for Future Studies

This study has had some limitations. These limitations should be considered from a methodological and theoretical perspective. Firstly, although I tried to establish a trustworthy relationship with the transgender women's community, I could not remove the barriers that prevented them from approaching me cautiously and distantly due to my role as a non-trans researcher. However, although this situation contains a potential limitation on the one hand, it is possible to see it as a potential strength on the other hand. Because transgender women wanted to express themselves to a ciswoman person whom they had never seen or met before. One of the interviewees stated that they usually spend their social time with non-trans individuals, and the reason for this is that it can be tiring for them to face too many of the same problems and issues within their own communities. Therefore, the fact that I am a ciswoman may be a threat in terms of them not feeling close to me, while chatting with someone who is not from their own community opens a space for them. In other words, I can state that there is a relationship of trust between us to the point that the interviewees started to share instead of defending themselves by emphasizing the diversity and inclusiveness of the questions.

While every topic examined in this thesis has to do with space and how it relates to other spaces, they can also cover a variety of scopes and literary works, which will restrict the number of chapters I can dedicate to each topic. The subject of conditions of sex work and transformations, for instance, is far more extensive and addresses space from an entirely new perspective. As a result, more can be said about the shift to digital sex work, the differences it brings about in socio-spatial practices, and the socio-economic analyses.

Numerous studies in the literature address the issues surrounding transgender sex workers, health and service access issues, and social issues about exclusion and segregation. However, by developing strategies, tactics, and mechanisms from a socio-cultural perspective, various dimensions of the trans struggle can be expanded. However, the scope of the literature should be widened to include the areas that can help construct the empowerment of the trans community as well as the mechanisms of struggle. These areas are currently absent from the literature. However, I also want to stress how important it is to do research on how the trans struggle and the fight against sex work are growing. Specifically, I contend that a greater application of intersectional analysis is needed to investigate the diversity of online sex work, the emergence of the individualized sex industry and labor, the ways in which local contexts influence migration to online sex work, and the experiences of those who engage in online sex sales.

REFERENCES

Aalbers, M. B., & Deinema, M. (2012). Placing prostitution: the spatial–sexual order of Amsterdam and its growth coalition. *City*, *16*(1-2), 129-145.

Ashworth, G. J., White, P. E., & Winchester, H. P. (1988). The red-light district in the West European city: a neglected aspect of the urban landscape. *Geoforum*, *19*(2), 201-212.

Attoh, K. A. (2011). What kind of right is the right to the city? *Progress in Human Geography*, *35*(5), 669-685.

Bates, C., & Rhys-Taylor, A. (2017). *Walking through social research*. Taylor & Francis.

Beebeejaun, Y. (2017). Gender, urban space, and the right to everyday life. *Journal of Urban Affairs*, *39*(3), 323-334.

Belediyesi, A. A. B. (2011). *Ankara Genelev'inde Yıkım*. ABB. Retrieved 02 from https://www.ankara.bel.tr/haberler/ankara-genelevinde-yikim-850

Bell, D. (1995). Perverse Dynamics, Sexual Citizenship and the Transformation of Intimacy. In D. Bell, & Valentine, G (Ed.), *Mapping Desire: Geog Sexuality* (1 ed.). Routledge. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203427897

Berghan, S. (2007). *Lubunya: transseksüel kimlik ve beden*. Metis Yayınları.

Bernstein, E. (2007). Sex work for the middle classes. *Sexualities*, *10*(4), 473-488.

Bettcher, T. (2009). Feminist perspectives on trans issues.

Bettcher, T. M. (2017). Through the looking glass: trans theory meets feminist philosophy. In *The Routledge companion to feminist philosophy* (pp. 393-404). Routledge.

Bianet. (2010). *Ankara Genelevi Yıkıldı, Tartışması Sürüyor*. Bianet. Retrieved 02 from https://bianet.org/haber/ankara-genelevi-yikildi-tartismasi-suruyor-124021

Billard, T. J., Everhart, A. R., & Zhang, E. (2022). Whither trans studies?: on fields, post-disciplines, and the need for an applied transgender studies. *Bulletin of Applied Transgender Studies*, *1*(1-2), 1-18.

Blum, V., & Nast, H. (1996). Where's the difference? The heterosexualization of alterity in Henri Lefebvre and Jacques Lacan. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space*, *14*(5), 559-580.

,
Blunt, A., & Varley, A. (2004). Geographies of home. In (Vol. 11, pp. 3-6): Sage Publications Sage CA: Thousand Oaks, CA.

Bolivar, A. (2021). "Nothing Feels Better than Getting Paid": Sex Working Trans Latinas' Meanings and Uses of Money. *Feminist Anthropology*, *2*(2), 298-311.

Browne, K. (2007). (Re) making the other, heterosexualising everyday space. *Environment and Planning A*, *39*(4), 996-1014.

Cardoso, D., Chronaki, D., & Scarcelli, C. M. (2022). Digital sex work?: Creating and selling explicit content in OnlyFans. In *Identities and intimacies on social media* (pp. 169-184). Routledge.

Certeau, M. d. (1984). *The practice of everyday life*. University of California Press.

CETAD. (2007). *Seks Ticareti* (Bilgilendirme Dosyaları, Issue.

Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2017). Thematic analysis. *The journal of positive psychology*, *12*(3), 297-298.

Collie, N. (2013). Walking in the city: Urban space, stories, and gender. Gender forum,

Cresswell, T. (1996). *In place/out of place : geography, ideology, and transgression*. University of Minnesota Press.

De Souza, M. L. (2010). Which right to which city? In defence of political-strategic clarity. *Interface*, *2*(1), 315-333.

Desyllas, M. C. (2013). Representations of sex workers' needs and aspirations: A case for arts-based research. *Sexualities*, *16*(7), 772-787.

Doan, P. L. (2010). The tyranny of gendered spaces–reflections from beyond the gender dichotomy. *Gender, Place & Culture*, *17*(5), 635-654.

Domaradzka, A. (2018). Urban social movements and the right to the city: An introduction to the special issue on urban mobilization. *Voluntas: International journal of voluntary and nonprofit organizations*, *29*(4), 607-620.

Ellensohn, V. J. (2021). *Sex (work) in the City: Analysis of Vienna's unique distribution of prostitution in the urban space* [Master of Arts (MA), University of Vienna].

Elliot, P. (2009). Engaging trans debates on gender variance: A feminist analysis. *Sexualities*, *12*(1), 5-32.

Engin, C. (2015). LGBT in Turkey: Policies and experiences. *Social Sciences*, *4*(3), 838-858.

Engin, C. (2018). Sex work in Turkey: Experiences of transwomen. *Transgender sex work and society*, 196-213.

Fenster, T. (2005). The right to the gendered city: Different formations of belonging in everyday life. *Journal of Gender Studies*, *14*(3), 217-231.

Foucault, M. (1977). *Discipline and punish : the birth of the prison* (1st American ed.). Pantheon Books.

Foucault, M., Martin, L. H., Gutman, H., & Hutton, P. H. (1988). *Technologies of the self : a seminar with Michel Foucault*. University of Massachusetts Press.

Garvey, A. (2022). The Digital Age: Giving Sex Work a New Meaning. *Journal of Feminist Scholarship*, *20*(20), 80-81.

Gokengin, D., Aybek, G., Aral, S. O., Blanchard, J., Serter, D., & Emmanuel, F. (2021). Programmatic mapping and size estimation of female sex workers, transgender sex workers and men who have sex with men in İstanbul and Ankara, Turkey. *Sexually Transmitted Infections*, *97*(8), 590-595.

Grosz, E. (2005). Bodies-cities. In *Places through the body* (pp. 31-38). Routledge.

Grosz, E. (2018). *Space, time and perversion: Essays on the politics of bodies*. routledge.

Gursu, E., & Cingöz, Y. (2013). 90'Larda Lubunya Olmak. In: Siyah Pembe Ucgen.
Güler, E. (2022). *Life at the margins: gender transgression and sex work in contemporary Turkey* European University Institute].

Habertürk. (2010). *Geneleve Kepçe Vuruldu*. Retrieved 02 from https://www.haberturk.com/yasam/haber/534797-geneleve-kepce vuruldu#:~:text=Antik%20Roma%20Tiyatrosu'nun%20bulundu%C4%9Fu,brothels%20de%20y%C4%B1kma%20karar%C4%B1%20ald%C4%B1

Harding, S. (1991). *Whose science? Whose knowledge?: Thinking from women's lives*. Cornell University Press.

Harvey, D. (2003). The right to the city. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, *27*(4), 939-941.

Hesse-Biber, S. N. (2011). *Handbook of feminist research: Theory and praxis*. SAGE publications.

Heyes, C. J. (2003). Feminist solidarity after queer theory: The case of transgender. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, *28*(4), 1093-1120.

Hubbard, P. (2019). *Sex and the city: geographies of prostitution in the urban West*. Routledge.

Hubbard, P., & Sanders, T. (2003). Making space for sex work: Female street prostitution and the production of urban space. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, *27*(1), 75-89.

İnce, B. (2021). *Urban stigma: a morphological investigation of the marginality in the city* Middle East Technical University].

Johnson, A. H. (2015). Beyond inclusion: Thinking toward a transfeminist methodology. In *At the center: Feminism, social science and knowledge* (Vol. 20, pp. 21-41). Emerald Group Publishing Limited.

Johnston, L., & Longhurst, R. (2010). *Space, place, and sex : geographies of sexualities*. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

Jones, A. (2015). Sex work in a digital era. *Sociology Compass*, *9*(7), 558-570.

Karlsson, H. (2022). Sex work policy worldwide: A scoping review. *Sexuality & Culture*, *26*(6), 2288-2310.

Kilislioğlu, C. (2020). *Türkiyede seks işçiliği: Düzenlemeler, uygulama ve etkileri* Lisansüstü Programlar Enstitüsü].

King, L. (2019). Henri Lefebvre and the Right to the City. In S. M. Meagher, S. Noll, & J. S. Biehl (Eds.), *The Routledge handbook of philosophy of the city*. Routledge New York.

Kipfer, S., Saberi, P., & Wieditz, T. (2013). Henri lefebvre: Debates and controversies1. *Progress in Human Geography*, *37*(1), 115-134.

Koyama, E. (2003). The Transfeminist Manifesto. Catching a Wave: Reclaiming Feminism for the 21st Century. Eds. Rory Dicker and Alison Piepmeier. Lebanon, NH. In: Northeastern University Press.

Lefebvre, H. (1991). *The production of space*. Blackwell.

Lefebvre, H., Kofman, E., & Lebas, E. (1996). *Writings on cities* (Vol. 63). Blackwell Publishers Oxford.

Lorimer, H. (2016). Walking: New forms and spaces for studies of pedestrianism. In *Geographies of mobilities: Practices, spaces, subjects* (pp. 19-33). Routledge.

Marcuse, P. (2009). From critical urban theory to the right to the city. *City*, *13*(2-3), 185-197.

Marcuse, P. (2010). Rights in Cities and the Right to the City? *Cities for All*, 87-98.

Marques, A. C. (2019). Displaying gender: transgender People's strategies in everyday life. *Symbolic Interaction*, *42*(2), 202-228.

Massey, D. B. (1994). *Space, place, and gender*. University of Minnesota Press. http://SK8ES4MC2L.search.serialssolutions.com/?sid=sersol&SS_jc=TC0000284355&title=Space%2C%20place%2C%20and%20gender

Matthews, R. (2008). *Prostitution, politics & policy*. Routledge-Cavendish.

Mitchell, D. (2003). *The right to the city : social justice and the fight for public space*. Guilford Press.

Mitchell, D., & Heynen, N. (2009). The geography of survival and the right to the city: Speculations on surveillance, legal innovation, and the criminalization of intervention. *Urban Geography*, *30*(6), 611-632.

Murphy, D. (2022). Walking, talking, imagining: Ethical engagement with sex workers. *Ethics and Social Welfare*, *16*(2), 219-234.

Nagoshi, J. L., & Brzuzy, S. i. (2010). Transgender theory: Embodying research and practice. *Affilia*, *25*(4), 431-443.

Namaste, V. K. (2000). *Invisible lives : the erasure of transsexual and transgendered people*. University of Chicago Press.

Nash, C. J., & Gorman-Murray, A. . (2019). Introduction. In C. J. N. A. Gorman-Murray (Ed.), *The Geographies of Digital Sexuality* Routledge. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-13-6876-9_1

O'Neill, M., & Roberts, B. (2019). *Walking methods: Research on the move*. Routledge.

O'Neill, M., Sanders, T., & Pitcher, J. (2017). *Prostitution: Sex work, policy and politics*. Sage.

Oğuz, Ç. (2017). Prostitution (Ottoman Empire). *1914-1918-online. International Encyclopedia of the First World War*.

Ördek, K. (2015). The Social Experiences of Trans People in Turkey. In C. Balzer & J. S. Hutta (Eds.), *Transrespect versus Transphobia Worldwide: The Social Experiences of Trans and Gender-Diverse People in Colombia, India, the Philippines, Serbia, Thailand, Tonga, Turkey and Venezuela*.

Ördek, K. (2017). *Bir Zorunlu Göç Hikayesi Eryaman*. Kırmızı Şemsiye.

Öz, Y. (2013). Trans Cinsiyetli Bireylere Yönelik Dışlama ve Direniş İmkânları. *Başkaldıran Bedenler: Türkiye'de Transgender, Aktivizm ve Altkültürel Pratikler*, 203-208.

Purcell, M. (2002). Excavating Lefebvre: The right to the city and its urban politics of the inhabitant. *GeoJournal*, *58*, 99-108.

Roen, K. (2013). Transgender theory and embodiment: The risk of racial marginalization. In *The transgender studies reader* (pp. 656-665). Routledge.

Ronneberger, K. (2008). Henri Lefebvre and urban everyday life: In search of the possible. In *Space, difference, everyday life* (pp. 148-160). Routledge.

Sariyannis, M. (2008). Prostitution in Ottoman Istanbul, late sixteenth-early eighteenth century. *Turcica*, *40*, 37-65.

Serano, J. (2013). *Excluded: Making feminist and queer movements more inclusive*. Seal Press.

Shaver, F. M. (2005). Sex work research: Methodological and ethical challenges. *Journal of interpersonal violence*, *20*(3), 296-319.

Shelley, B. (2010). Addressing Women's Urban Safety Through the Right to the City, Poland In A. Sugranyes & C. Mathivet (Eds.), *Cities for All Proposals and Experiences towards the Right to the City*. Habitat International Coalition

(HIC).

Sibley, D. (1995). Geographies of exclusion: Society and difference in the west *Routledge*. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203430545

Simonsen, K. (2005). Bodies, sensations, space and time: The contribution from Henri Lefebvre. *Geografiska Annaler: Series B, Human Geography*, *87*(1), 1-14.

Soja, E. (2010). Spatializing the urban, Part I. *City*, *14*(6), 629-635.

Soja, E. W. (2010). *Seeking spatial justice*. University of Minnesota Press.

Taşcıoğlu, E. (2021). States of exception: Legal governance of trans women in urban Turkey. *Social & Legal Studies*, *30*(3), 384-404.

Taşcıoğlu, E. E. (2011). What do transgender women's experiences tell us about law? Towards an understanding of law as legal complex. *Towards an Understanding of Law as Legal Complex (November 23, 2010). Oñati Socio-Legal Series*, *1*(1).

Tilley, C. (2012). Walking the Past in the Present. *Landscapes beyond land: routes, aesthetics, narratives*, *19*, 15-32.

Toprak, Z. (1987). İstanbul'da fuhuş ve zührevi hastalıklar 1914-1933. *Tarih ve Toplum*, *39*, 31-40.

Tuckett, A. G. (2005). Applying thematic analysis theory to practice: A researcher's experience. *Contemporary nurse*, *19*(1-2), 75-87.

Üçgen, S. P. (2012). 80'lerde lubunya olmak. *Yay. Haz. Erdem Gürsu-Sinan Elitemiz. İzmir: Siyah Pembe Üçgen*, 11-21.

Vaiou, D., & Kalandides, A. (2009). Cities of" others": public space and everyday practices. *Geographica Helvetica*, *64*(1), 11-20.

Van der Veen, M. (2001). Rethinking commodification and prostitution: An effort at peacemaking in the battles over prostitution. *Rethinking Marxism*, *13*(2), 30-51.

Vanwesenbeeck, I. (2017). Sex work criminalization is barking up the wrong tree. *Archives of sexual behavior*, *46*(6), 1631-1640.

Wahab, S., & Sloan, L. (2004). Ethical dilemmas in sex work research. *Research for sex work*, *7*(1), 3-5.

Weitzer, R. (2009). *Sex for sale: Prostitution, pornography, and the sex industry*. Routledge.

Zengin, A. (2014). *Sex under intimate siege: Transgender lives, law and state violence in contemporary Turkey*. University of Toronto (Canada).

Zengin, A. (2024). *Violent intimacies : the trans everyday and the making of an urban world*. https://login.proxy.lib.duke.edu/login?url=http://dx.doi.org/10.1215/9781478027751

Zerey Aydıntuğ, N. (2022). LGBTI+ s' resistances and spatial productions in Istanbul: a path towards the right to the city.

A. TURKISH SUMMARY/TÜRKÇE ÖZET

Giriş

Mekân, çeşitli politikalar ve aktörlerden etkilenen toplumsal bir üretimdir. Bu politikalarla, sosyal grupların birbirlerini nasıl algıladıklarını ve birbirleriyle nasıl etkileşime girdikleri şekillenir. Lefebvre 1960 sonlarında kent hakkı kavramını öne sürerek, kent hakkını bir muhalefet biçimi olarak açıklar. Bu çalışma, kent hakkını çevreleyen teorik çerçevenin yetersiz olduğunu ve toplumsal cinsiyet ve cinsellik normlarının yeniden değerlendirilmesi gerektiğini ortaya koymayı amaçlamaktadır. Bu araştırmayla, Ankara'daki trans seks işçilerini analiz etmeye ve özellikle ahlaki ilkelerin şehir içindeki mekânsal dağılımıyla ilişkili etik boyutları araştırmaya odaklanmaktadır.

Trans kadınlar bütün marjinal gruplar gibi gündelik yaşamlarından, sosyal aktivitelerine, iş yaşamlarına kadar uzanan ayrımcılık, dışlanma ve şiddetle baş etme konusunda çeşitli mücadelerde bulunurlar. Bu direniş biçimleri gündelik yaşamda ve yaşamın diğer alanlarında taktikler olarak belirir. Bu taktikler, kent hakkının sadece mülkiyet ve erişim gibi geleneksel anlamlarının ötesine geçerek, farklı cinsiyet kimliklerinin heteropatriyarkal güç dinamiklerinden bağımsız olarak haklarını talep edebileceğini ortaya koyar. Tezimde, kent hakkının gündelik yaşamda cinsiyetlendirilmiş pratikleri dikkate alarak daha kapsayıcı bir yaklaşım benimsemesi gerektiğini savunuyorum. Bu çerçevede, kent hakkını herkesin kentsel mekanı güvenli bir şekilde kullanabileceği, hizmetlere eşit erişim sağlayabileceği, karar alma süreçlerine katılabileceği ve kamusal-özel alan ayrımını aşabileceği bir hak olarak tanımlıyorum. Ayrıca, aidiyet ve özgürleşmeyi merkeze alan güçlü bir kentsel hareketliliği de kent hakkının bir parçası olarak görmekteyim.

Buradan hareketle, temel araştırma sorum; “Trans seks işçilerinin kent hakkı iddiaları mekânsal pratiklerinde ve direniş biçimlerinde nasıl ortaya çıkıyor?”. Araştırma

sorusu bağlamında, tezimde trans seks işçilerinin kent hakkı iddiasındaki direnişlerinin ve geliştirilen taktiklerin mekansal pratikteki yansımalarını araştırıyorum. Direnişe söz konu olan mekansal pratiklerin mekanların yeniden tanımlanmasına ve sahiplenmesine yardımcı olduğunu savunuyorum. Kent hakkının pozitif ve olumlu katkısının bu olduğuna inanıyorum ve aidiyet hissinin gündelik yaşamda geliştirilen taktiklerin birer kent hakkı iddiasını temsil ettiklerini vurguluyorum. Dolayısıyla, tezimde iki ana tema bulunmaktadır. Bu temalar, gündelik yaşamda kent mekanının kullanımı ve işgali ve kent hakkını talep etme yöntemleridir. Her iki temada, kentte gündelik yaşamda, iş hayatında, sosyal zamanlarda geliştirilen taktiklerin mekansal pratiklere yansıması üzerinden değerlendirilmektedir.

1.2. Çalışmanın Amacı ve Önemi

Araştırma, Ankara'daki trans kadınların kullandıkları taktik ve yaklaşımların yanı sıra, çeşitli kent tipleri ve bunların yarattığı haklar arasındaki ilişkiyi anlamayı amaçlamaktadır. "Kent hakkı" kavramı, bireylerin aidiyet duygularından, mekânsal hatıralarından ve belirli bir yerle ilişkili anılarından etkilenir.

İddiam, kent hakkı fikrinin bireylerin kentsel mekanlardan faydalanarak haklarını kullanmalarına olanak tanıdığı ve toplumun güçlenmesini kendine özgü bir şekilde büyük ölçüde destekleyebileceğidir. Seks işçileri, kentsel mekanlara ilişkin haklarını kullanarak refahlarını ve özerkliklerini artırabilir, bu da onlara daha fazla hareketlilik ve uygun barınma imkanlarına sahip olma fırsatı sağlar. Son yıllarda seks işçileri için kent hakkının öneminin giderek daha fazla kabul görmesi, seks işçilerinin daha fazla güçlenmesine neden olmuştur. Bu perspektiften yola çıkarak, amacım çeşitli kent türleri ve ürettikleri haklar arasındaki ilişkiyi anlamaktır. Ankara, Türkiye'deki bir seks işçisi, gündelik geçimini sürdürürken yapısal istismar ve gözetimin zorluklarıyla nasıl başa çıkıyor? Hayatında hangi stratejileri geliştiriyor ve kullanıyor ve bunlara karşı hangi yöntemleri kullanıyor? Trans kadın seks işçileri, çoğunlukla ayrıcalıklı grupların yararına olan heteropatriyarkal uygulamalar ve kurallardan etkilenen kentsel alanın sağladığı kısıtlı haklara ne kadar erişebiliyor? Ayrıca amacım, metropollerde sıradan ve düzenli görünen hayatların içine sinmiş gizli yaşam hakkı taleplerini ve iddialarını ortaya çıkarmak. Bu bakış açısıyla, de Certeau'nun (1984) ve Lefebvre'nin (1971)

gündelik hayat eleştirilerinden miras kalan taktikleri vurgulamayı amaçlıyorum. Özetlemek gerekirse, görüşme yaptığım seks işçiliği yapan her trans kadın, kentsel alanları işgal etme hakkını kendinden emin bir şekilde iddia ediyor ve bu hakkın yalnızca özel mülkiyet ve kent kullanımıyla sınırlı olduğunu savunmuyor.

BÖLÜM 2
TEORİK ÇERÇEVE

2.1. Kentsel Mekân ve Marjinal Topluluklar

Kentsel çevre, kendine özgü deneyimlerinden, bakış açılarından ve güç dinamiklerinden etkilenen, cinsiyete göre değişen gruplar arasında farklılık gösteren çok yönlü bir kavrayış sunmaktadır. Mekân, bireyler üzerinde dönüştürücü bir etki yaratarak tutum ve davranışlarını mekânın kendine özgü atmosferine göre şekillendirebilir. Mekânın üretimi, toplum tarafından inşa edilen ve mekânsal organizasyonun hiyerarşik sıralama yoluyla oluşturulduğu bir hiyerarşi içeren bir çerçevedir. Bireyler ve kentsel çevreler arasındaki etkileşim, insan bedeninin sosyal, cinsel ve iletişimsel yönlerini önemli ölçüde etkiler. Butler'ın performatifliği[29], toplumsal yapıların değiştirilmesi ve toplumsal yapıdaki değişikliklere uyum sağlanması sürecinde mekânın nasıl etkilenebileceğini göstermektedir. Mekânın performatif doğası ve sürekli değişim ve yeniden inşa süreci, gündelik mekânın şekillenmesinde ve işleyişinde çok önemlidir ve iktidarın uygulanmasını ve anlaşılmasını etkiler.

Trans seks işçilerinin kentsel ortamlardaki deneyimleri güç dinamikleri, sosyal sınıf ve heteronormatif normların mekânsal davranışlar üzerindeki etkisinden etkilenmektedir. Marjinalleştirilmiş topluluklardan gelen trans bireyler, heteronormatif normların sosyal yapı ve mekânsal organizasyon üzerindeki etkisi nedeniyle kentsel mekânlara erişim ve kaynakların eşitsiz dağılımı konusunda farklı deneyimlere sahiptir.

[29] Toplumsal cinsiyetin performatifliği, eylemlerin tekrarlanması, egemen cinsiyet tarafından toplumsal olarak dayatılmış ritüellerin alışılmış tekrarı veya taklit edilmesi olarak tanımlanabilir.

Transseksüel deneyimler sosyal dışlanma, manipülatif stratejiler ve baskıcı toplumsal cinsiyet normları tarafından belirlenir. Transseksüel bireyler birçok alanda şiddet ve ötekileştirmeyle karşılaşmakta, bu da onları sıklıkla seks işçiliğine başvurmaya ve ahlaki dışlanmaya maruz kalmaya itmektedir. Devlet, zorlayıcı ve mekânsal mekanizmalar aracılığıyla seks işçiliğini bastırmaya veya ortadan kaldırmaya çalışmaktadır. Genderbashing, kamusal alanlarda meydana gelen ve bir kişinin cinsiyeti ve toplumsal cinsiyetine ilişkin toplumsal beklentilere uymadığı algısıyla motive edilen şiddet eylemlerini tanımlamak için kullanılan bir terimdir.

Transgender coğrafyalar, transgender bireylerin ikamet etmeleri ve gelişmeleri için güvenli alanlar sağlayarak sağlam bağlantıları ve yenilikçi yaklaşımları teşvik eder. Bireyler, maruz kaldıkları istismar ve şiddeti yönetmek için çeşitli sosyal ve fiziksel stratejiler kullanmaktadır. Özellikle trans seks işçileri, bazen belirli alanlara hapsedilmelerine, taşınmaya zorlanmalarına ve soylulaştırma sürecinde sadece gözlemci muamelesi görmelerine neden olan özel yöntemler ve planlar geliştirmiştir. Taktikler, alternatif yöntemlerin yaratılmasını ve yasadışı eylemlerin kullanılmasını içermektedir. Trans seks işçileri mesleklerini ağırlıklı olarak gündüz saatlerinde evlerinden yürütmekte ve genellikle akşam saatlerinde sosyal faaliyetlere katılmaktadır.

Trans seks işçilerinin sınırlı sivil özgürlükleri şu anda tek endişe kaynağı değildir. Bireyler ve kentsel mekânlar arasındaki etkileşimler, kentsel hakların farklı yöntem ve planlarla savunulmasını ve kullanılmasını kapsamaktadır. Bu kapsamlı yaklaşım, trans seks işçilerinin topluma dahil edilmesinin ve kentsel hakların adil bir şekilde dağıtılmasının öneminin daha iyi anlaşılmasını sağlayacaktır.

2.2. Kent Hakkı: Tanımlar ve Tartışmalar

İlk olarak 1968 yılında Henri Lefebvre tarafından ortaya atılan kent hakkı fikri, sahiplenme ve katılım ilkelerine dayanmaktadır. Özgürlük, toplum içinde kişisel özerklik, ikamet etme ve konut sahibi olma kapasitesi gibi temel hakları içerir. Kent hakkı kavramı, her kentsel alanın karşılaması gereken temel önkoşulları kapsayan acil

ve güçlü bir çağrı olarak kabul edilmektedir. Çeşitli teorisyenler ve araştırmacılar kent hakkı kavramına ilişkin farklı görüşlere sahiptir. Harvey (2003) bunun bireysel bir haktan ziyade toplumsal bir hak olduğunu iddia etmektedir. Marcuse (2009) mevcut yasal sistem içerisinde daha iyi bir yasal çerçeveye ve adalete duyulan ihtiyacın altını çizerken, Purcell (2002) kentsel alan yaratımının temelini oluşturan güç dinamiklerinin yeniden yapılandırılması zorunluluğuna vurgu yapmaktadır. Mitchell ve Heynen (2009) bireylerin kentte fiziksel ve aktif olarak bulunma ayrıcalığının yanı sıra kentin gelişimine katkıda bulunma hakkını da içeren kentsel varoluş hakkına sahip olduğunu ileri sürmektedir.

Lefebvre'in bakış açısı, kentsel yaşamın zaman içindeki gelişiminin, ticaret ve sanayi ile olan karmaşık ama çelişkili bağlantılarının ve yaratım ya da başyapıt (oeuvre) ve meta olarak mekânlar arasındaki ayrımın sofistike bir kavrayışına dayanmaktadır (King, 2019). King, kent hakkının, özgürlük haklarını, bireyci bir bağlamda sosyal etkileşimi ve bir yerde yerleşme ve ikamet etme hakkını kapsayan daha yüksek bir hak biçimi olduğunu savunmaktadır. Bu, nihayetinde kentsel yaşamın temel dayanağı olan kullanım-değerini değişim-değerinin etkisinden kurtaracaktır.

2000'li yıllardan bu yana kent hakkı kavramı akademik literatürde, toplantılarda ve konferanslarda sosyo-politik bir fikir olarak kabul görmeye başlamıştır. Kentsel alanlarda sosyal adalet ve demokrasiyi savunan çok sayıda küresel sosyal hareket ve aktivist tarafından benimsenmiştir. Kent hakkı talebi, yabancılaşma, güvensizlik ve güçsüzlük duyguları yaşayan marjinalleştirilmiş bireylerin yanı sıra doğrudan ezilen gruplardan da kaynaklanmaktadır.

Marcuse (2009), gayrimenkul sahipleri, spekülatörler, siyasi elitler ve medya sahipleri gibi belirli bireylerin kent üzerinde zaten hak sahibi olduğunu iddia etmektedir. Kent hakkı kavramı, bireylerin karar alma süreçlerine katılma ve bu süreçleri etkileme becerilerini savunurken hem bireysel hem de kolektif olarak kasıtlı olarak tasarlanmış kentsel alanlara sahip olma haklarını vurgulamaktadır. Dikeç'in (2002) kent hakkı kavramı ise, kentsel alanlara erişim, demokratik karar alma süreçlerine katılım ve devletin siyasi kimliklerin şekillendirilmesi ve çatışmaların çözümündeki etkisini sorgulama hakkını kapsayan çeşitlilik ilkesi üzerine kuruludur.

Aydıntuğ (2022) kent hakkının ve aynı zamanda farklılık hakkının, büyük ölçüde hetero-patriyarkaya dayalı dışlamadan etkilenen kamusal alanın ötesine geçtiğini savunur. Ev içi alana toplumsal cinsiyete duyarlı bir bakış açısı getirmektedir. Bebeejaun (2017), bireylerin gündelik varoluşlarını nasıl yönlendirdiklerini ve toplumsal cinsiyetin karşılaşmalarını nasıl etkilediğini anlamak için mekânın farklı kullanım biçimlerini incelemenin önemini vurgulamaktadır. Kent hakkına yönelik feminist eleştiriler, bu hakkın mekânsallığın cinsiyetlendirilmiş ve cinselleştirilmiş boyutlarını yeterince ele almadığını savunmaktadır. Kent hakkını heteropatriyarkal bir bağlamda incelerken kapsamlı ve geniş bir perspektif benimsemenin önemini vurgulamaktadırlar.

Baskıcı ataerkil ve heteroseksist rejim, LGBTİ+ bireylerin davranışlarına sınırlamalar getirmekte ve sıradan başkaldırı özneleri olarak işlev görmelerini engellemektedir. Feminist perspektif, Lefebvre'in kent hakkı kavramını, ataerkil baskı sistemlerini ele alma konusundaki ihmali nedeniyle eleştirir. Kent hakkı kavramı, kentsel alanlarda yaşayan, bu alanlara erişen ve bu alanlardan yararlanan tüm bireyleri kapsayan kolektif bir ayrıcalıktır. Toplumsal cinsiyet ve mekânsal dağılım arasındaki ilişki, kadınların kentsel ortamlardaki gündelik deneyimleri üzerinde önemli bir etkiye sahiptir.

BÖLÜM 3

YÖNTEM

Bu çalışma, Ankara'nın kentsel alanında seks endüstrisinde çalışan trans kadınların deneyimlerini ve kente eşit erişim taleplerini incelemektedir. Karşılaştıkları güç dinamiklerini ve sistemik şiddeti anlamak için feminist araştırma metodolojilerini kullanmaktadır. Kent hakkı iddialarını feminist bir perspektiften ve trans feminist ideolojiden incelemek için iki temel yöntem vardır. Bu yaklaşımlar, heteroseksüel normların ve toplum dinamiklerinin ikili doğasının daha uyarlanabilir bir şekilde anlaşılmasını sağlamaktadır.

Metodolojik yaklaşım, yürüme yöntemi kullanılarak bireysel görüşmeler yapılmasına ve tematik analizin kullanılmasına dayanmaktadır. Bu yaklaşım, katılımcıların daha önce açıklanmamış perspektiflerini ifade etmelerini sağlamakta ve daha samimi bir

görüşme karşılaşmasını teşvik etmektedir. Yürüme yönteminin kullanımı, trans kadınlar gibi marjinalleştirilmiş grupların mekânla kurdukları ilişkinin anlaşılması ve görselleştirilmesi açısından giderek daha önemli hale gelmektedir.

3.1. Eleştirel feminist araştırma ile gelişmekte olan transgender teorisi

Transgender teori, özellikle transgender bireylerin deneyimlerini ve haklarını inceleyen, gelişmekte olan bir çalışma alanıdır. Queer teori, kesişimsellik, postmodern/postyapısalcı feminizm ve cinsiyet-pozitif feminizm ile yakından bağlantılıdır. Cinsiyet kimliğinin değişkenliğini tanıyarak hem feminist hem de queer teorilere meydan okur, ancak yine de cinsiyet ikiliği kavramını savunur. Ezilen bireylerin kesişimsel deneyimlerini anlamak, transgender teorisinin akışkan, bedenlenmiş, sosyal olarak inşa edilmiş ve kendi kendine inşa edilmiş sosyal kimlik kavramını anlamaya yardımcı olabilir.

Johnson (2015), trans bireyler üzerine sosyolojik çalışmalar yürütmek için üç temel unsuru vurgulayan yeni bir çerçeve sunmuştur: bakış açısı, öz farkındalık ve cinsiyet ayrımcılığını pekiştiren analitik tuzaklardan uzak durmak. Bu ilkeler, Harding'in (2007) hem feminist hem de transgender bir perspektiften araştırma yürütmeye yönelik dört kriterinden türetilmiştir.

Araştırmacı düşünümselliği, araştırma sürecinde eşitsiz güç dinamiklerinin varlığını kabul eden transfeminist bir bakış açısının geliştirilmesiyle ilişkilidir. Nesnellik fikrinin sorgulanmasını ve araştırmacının motivasyonlarının araştırılmasını içerir. Öte yandan, Billard ve diğerleri (2022), transgender çalışmalarına geleneksel akademik disiplinlerin sınırlamalarının ötesine geçen yeni bir yaklaşım önermektedir. Trans-disipliner perspektiflerin dahil edilmesini, epistemik adaletsizliklerin ele alınmasını ve transgender çalışmaları ile diğer alanlar arasındaki bağlantıların araştırılmasını önermektedirler.

Bir araştırmacı olarak, cisseksist[30] iddiaları derinlemesine analiz etmek, transgender

[30] Cisgender olmayan insanlara karşı önyargı ve ayrımcılık olarak tanımlanmaktadır.

hiyerarşilerini sorgulamak ve transgender eşitliğini teşvik etmek için transgender feminist ilkeleri birleştiren bir bakış açısını benimsedim. Trans ve interseks kimlikler, farklı baskı ve direniş biçimlerini ortaya çıkaran "politik duruşlar" olarak değerlendirilmektedir. Trans ve interseks bireylerin deneyimlerine öncelik vererek, kadınların, interseks bireylerin ve transgender/transseksüel bireylerin karşılaştığı karmaşık ayrımcılık biçimleriyle ilgili önemli konuları etkili bir şekilde ele alabileceğimi iddia ediyorum.

3.2 Yürüyüş ile Görüşme Yöntemi

Biyografik yöntem olarak da bilinen yürüyüş ile mülakat (WIBM), kentsel alanlardaki seks işçilerinin deneyimleri hakkında bilgi toplamak için kullanılan yenilikçi bir yaklaşımdır. Bu araştırma yöntemi, feminist epistemolojilere dayalı işbirlikçi bilgi üretimini kolaylaştıran ortak bir anlayış ve bakış açısı geliştirilmesini teşvik eder. Yürüyüş, görsel, işitsel, tat ve koku deneyimleriyle farklı düzeylerde yakınlık ve bağlantı sağlayan ortak bir faaliyettir. Ayrıca, çok modlu düşünmenin gelişimini kolaylaştırır ve bireyin anlatısının kapsamlı bir şekilde anlaşılmasını sağlar.

Bu yöntem, zaman zaman bir sorgulama gibi hissedilebilen yüz yüze, organize edilmiş bir görüşmenin hiyerarşik yapısını altüst etme şansı sunmaktadır. Murphy (2022), araştırma metodolojilerindeki güç hiyerarşilerini dengelemeye yönelik bu girişimin feminist bir epistemoloji olduğunu ve feminist perspektifi söyleme katılarak bütünleştirdiğimizi belirtmektedir (Murphy, 2022). Yürümek, seks işçilerinin, özellikle de sokak seks işçilerinin ve bunlarla bağlantılı örgüt ve toplulukların yaşamlarında günlük bir pratiktir. Öte yandan yürüyüş, seks işçilerine yönelik şiddet ve zararın sona ermesini savunmak için kullanılır (O'Neill & Roberts, 2019). Bu yöntemle kent hakkı iddiasına, mekânın anlamına ve mekânın duygusallığına bakmak istiyorum. Ayrıca, mekân ve katılımcıların davranışları arasındaki ilişkiyi gözlemlemem için de büyük bir fırsat olacak.

3.4. Seks İşçiliği Araştırmalarında Etik

Seks işçiliği üzerine araştırma yürütmek için etik kurallar, araştırma konusunun

formüle edilmesi, araştırma metodolojisinin seçilmesi, verilerin toplanması, verilerin analiz edilmesi ve araştırma bulgularının yayılması için protokollere uyulmasını gerektirir. Bu, örneklem ve istatistiksel kaygıların ele alınmasını, etik onay alınmasını, seks işçilerine veya onlar tarafından yönetilen kuruluşlara çeşitli istihdam olanakları sağlanmasını ve anonimliklerini korumak için stratejiler geliştirilmesini gerektirir. Kişisel bilgilerin korunması ve seks işçilerinin anonimliğinin sürdürülmesi amacıyla, bu çalışmada görüşmelerin yürütülmesinden yalnızca araştırmacı sorumlu olacaktır.

Bununla birlikte, seks işçiliğinin incelenmesi, araştırma popülasyonunun büyüklüğü ve bileşimi, cinsiyet ve sosyal statüye dayalı potansiyel önyargı, seks işçilerinin yasaları ihlal eden, sapkın veya mağdur olarak tasvir edilmesi ve mahremiyet ve gizliliğin korunmasının önemi ile ilgili konular da dahil olmak üzere farklı etik kaygıları ortaya çıkarmaktadır. Bu zorlukların üstesinden gelmek için hem farklı sektörler içinde hem de sektörler arasında çeşitliliği ortaya çıkarma olasılığını artıracak stratejiler geliştirmek gerekmektedir.

BÖLÜM 4

KENT HAKKINI TALEP ETME YÖNTEMLERİ: TRASNGENDER SEKS İŞÇİLERİNİN MEKANSAL TALEPLERİ

Kent hakkı, insan varoluşunun temel bir bileşenidir ve trans seks işçilerinin fiziksel çevreyle etkileşim biçimleri, güçlenmelerinde rol oynamaktadır. Bu çalışma, güvenlik, satın alınabilirlik, görünürlük ve kentsel hizmetlere erişim gibi unsurlara odaklanarak kentsel deneyimi ve bireylerin kent hakkına sahip olma potansiyelini araştırmaktadır. Çalışma, güvenlik, satın alınabilirlik ve görünürlük gibi faktörlerin trans kadın seks işçilerinin kentsel çevreye hak kazanmasına nasıl katkıda bulunduğunu ve bu haktan doğan potansiyel faydaları incelemektedir.

Hak talep etme biçimleri teması trans seks işçilerinin kentsel alanlarda erişim, güvenlik veya tanınma taleplerini, görünürlüklerini, kentsel alan hakları için protestolara katılımlarını, haklarını savunmak üzere sivil toplum kuruluşlarıyla etkileşimlerini içermektedir. Bu temanın alt başlığı ise kamusal alanlarda görünürlük derecesi (örneğin, polis müdahalesi olmaksızın gece hayatında, pazarlarda veya sokaklarda

bulunma) ve seks işçiliğinin mekanlarına bağlı olarak koşulları kapsamaktadır. Bu koşullar, kent hakkının hangi mücadele biçimlerine dönüşerek mekansal pratiklere yansıdığını aktarmaktadır.

4.1. Kentsel hizmetlere erişim

Görüşmeler sonrası, seks işçiliği yapan trans kadınların haklarına erişim konusunda karşılaştıkları zorlukları ortaya çıkarmıştır. Bu zorluklar hukuki, sosyal, ekonomik, psikolojik ve siyasi boyutlar da dahil olmak üzere geniş bir alanı kapsamaktadır. Mülkiyete el konulması ve para cezaları gibi yasal engeller yoksulluğu daha da artırmakta ve bireylerin yeterli barınmaya erişimini engellemektedir. Ankara'da sağlık hizmetlerinin mevcudiyeti tatmin edicidir, ancak devlet hastanelerinde tedavi olmak isteyenlerin ayrımcılığa maruz kaldığı durumlar gözlemlenmiştir. Özel hastaneler, ayrıcalıklı bakım sağladıklarına ve daha az önyargılı olduklarına inanıldığı için tercih edilmektedir.

Özel sigorta, sağlık hizmetlerine uygun fiyatlı erişim sağlamak için çok önemlidir, ancak sigortalı olan bireyler önemli zorluklarla karşılaşmamaktadır. Kadınlığa geçiş yapan transseksüel kadınlar devlet hastanelerine erişimde herhangi bir zorlukla karşılaşmamaktadır. Ankara'daki ulaşım altyapısı genel olarak övgüye değerdir ve akşam saatlerinde toplu taşıma araçları tercih edilmektedir. Bununla birlikte, trans kadınlar taciz ve şiddet endişeleri nedeniyle toplu taşıma hizmetlerinden yararlanmaktan kaçınmaktadır.

Belediyenin kültürel, sanatsal ve sosyal faaliyetlerinden tam anlamıyla yararlanılamamaktadır, zira bazı sakinler başkalarıyla birlikte yaşamayı veya üçüncü taraf acenteler aracılığıyla mülk kiralamayı tercih etmektedir. Barınma sorunları nedeniyle bu faaliyetler kısıtlanmaktadır. Trans kadınlar ağırlıklı olarak Kızılay ve Tunalı gibi özellikle daha yüksek sosyoekonomik statüye sahip bireylere hitap eden sosyal kurumları tercih etmektedir. Bununla birlikte, trans bireyler çeşitli yerlerde kısıtlamalarla ve ihtiyaçlarına cevap veren kuruluşların eksikliğiyle karşılaşmaktadır.

Trans çalışanlar, kendilerini sosyal izolasyona ve dışlanmaya zorlayan bir yoksulluk,

barınma ayrımcılığı ve mali cezalar döngüsü yaşamaktadır. Trans kadınlar ayrımcılık ve dışlanmadan orantısız bir şekilde etkilenmekte, bu da güvenin azalmasına ve sosyal izolasyonun artmasına neden olmaktadır. Sosyal hizmetlerden yardım almak, uygun belgelerin ve görünürlüğün olmaması nedeniyle zordur ve bu da desteğe erişmelerini engeller. Sağlık hizmetlerine erişim, hastane ve işyeri ortamlarında sıklıkla ciddi ayrımcılıkla karşılaşan trans bireyler için zorlayıcı olabilmektedir.

Ankara'daki trans bireyler, trans kimliklerinin bir sonucu olarak barınma ayrımcılığına maruz kalmakta ve sağlık hizmetlerine erişimde zorluklarla karşılaşmaktadır. Sıklıkla uzaktan çalışmaya katılmaları, inzivaya çekilme hissine ve devlet hastaneleri yerine üniversite hastanelerinin tercih edilmesine neden olmaktadır. Ticari konaklama yerleri tipik olarak daha fazla müşteri çekmeye ve konutlara kıyasla daha yüksek düzeyde yaya trafiği yaşamaya odaklanarak tasarlanmıştır. Trans kadınlar, barınma haklarını güvence altına almak ve sağlık hizmetlerinden faydalanmak için, kamu hastaneleri yerine özel hastaneleri veya poliklinikleri tercih etmek, kamusal alandaki varlıklarını azaltmak ve bir konut kiralamak veya birlikte yaşamak için başka birinin kaydını kullanmak da dahil olmak üzere çeşitli taktikler kullanmaktadır.

4.2. Güvenlik

Trans kadınlar, karşılaştıkları dış baskılarla başa çıkabilmek için sıklıkla topluluklarıyla bir arada yaşamayı tercih etmektedirler. Kentsel hizmetlere erişim, erişilebilirlik ve güvenlikle ilgili kaygılarla yakından bağlantılıdır; çünkü kente girebilmek doğrudan güvenlik duygusuyla ilişkilidir. Kızılay'daki görünürlük, güvenlik önlemleri ve cinsiyet kimliklerini güvenle ifade ederken aynı zamanda güvenlik endişelerini de gideren trans kadınların fiziksel varlığı ile kolaylaştırılmıştır. Kızılay'daki trans kadınlar, davranışlarını düzenlemek ve uygunsuz davranışlarda bulunmaktan kaçınmak gibi uyum stratejileri geliştirmişlerdir. Tedirginlikten kaçmak ve sosyal normlara uyum sağlamak için sıklıkla gizlice alkol tüketmeyi tercih etmektedirler. Transseksüel kadınlar, transseksüel kimliklerini tamamen benimseyerek ve bireysel deneyimlerini sahiplenerek toplumsal zorlukları etkili bir şekilde aşabilir ve hem kişisel hem de toplumsal kabul görebilirler.

Trans kadınlar, cinsiyet kimliklerini açıkladıklarında toplum içinde sıklıkla sözlü tacize ve fiziksel şiddete maruz kalmaktadır. Ancak, sessiz kalmayı ve günlük faaliyetlerine devam etmeyi tercih etmektedirler. Marjinalleştirilmiş trans bireylerin haklarının kapsamlı bir şekilde anlaşılması ve barınma, sağlık ve sosyal hizmetlere erişimlerinin sağlanması için etkili stratejilerin uygulanması, genel refahları ve yaşam kaliteleri açısından büyük önem taşımaktadır.

4.3. Çalışma Ortamında Güvenlik

Türkiye'de seks endüstrisi son yıllarda önemli dönüşümler geçirmiş olup, trans kadın seks işçileri çeşitli direniş ve sıkıntı biçimleriyle karşılaşmaktadır. Bunlar güvenliğin sağlanması, hakların korunması ve tanınmama gibi kaygıları kapsamaktadır. İnternet, trans seks işçileri için şiddeti ve yasal işlemleri takip etme platformları da dahil olmak üzere yeni bağlantı yolları sağlayarak bu dönüşüme önemli ölçüde katkıda bulunmuştur. 2007'de 5651 sayılı Kanun'un yürürlüğe girmesi, internet kuruluşları için yasal yükümlülükler getirerek ve internetle ilgili suçları düzenleyerek bu senaryoda önemli değişiklikler getirmiştir.

Pandemi, trans kadınların müşterileriyle dijital platformlar üzerinden iletişim kurma yöntemlerini çeşitlendirdi. Pandemi sonrasında çok sayıda seks işçisi, web sitelerindeki reklamları kullanarak mesleklerine evden devam etti. Çevrimiçi iletişime geçiş, hem avantajlar hem de dezavantajlar sunmaktadır. Çevrimiçi iletişim hem avantajlı hem de dezavantajlı unsurlara sahiptir. Sokaktaki buluşmaların süresi uzayabilir ve evdeki müşteri sayısı zaman zaman azalabilir. Evden çalışan seks işçilerinin maddi kazançları hem sokaktan hem de internetten çalışan seks işçilerine göre daha düşüktür. Çevrimiçi tüketiciler daha iyi hizmet ve uzun süreli etkileşim aramaktadır; ancak internet, kalitesi ve güvenilirliğindeki önemli dalgalanmalar nedeniyle daha belirsiz ve öngörülemez bir seçenek sunmaktadır.

Dijital teknoloji, daha kontrollü bir ortam sunma kapasitesi sayesinde sokağı her açıdan aşmaktadır. Bununla birlikte, şiddet olayları ve öngörülemezlik gibi zorlukları da beraberinde getirmektedir. Katılımcılar, bir kişinin sesinin tonlamasını yorumlama ve sözlü iletişimlerine uygun şekilde yanıt verme becerisi kazanmıştır. Twitter'ın seks işçileri tarafından yaygın olarak kullanılması, sosyal medyanın tekelleşmesine ve

örtük olarak ticarileşmesine yol açmıştır. Görünürlük arayan seks işçileri, daha yüksek sıralamalara ulaşmak için yüksek maliyetlere katlanmak zorundadır; ancak hesapları, müstehcen görüntüler nedeniyle sıklıkla feshedilmektedir. Dijital çağın ortaya çıkışı, yüz yüze iletişimi azaltmış ve sosyal izolasyonu artırarak madde bağımlılığı, yaşam koşulları ve sosyal kopuşla ilgili endişeleri artırmıştır.

Sokakta çalışan kadınlar için başlıca endişe kaynağı, güvenli bir ortamın ve güvenlik tehditlerini azaltacak bir sistemin bulunmamasıdır. Transseksüel bir kadın olan Berra, dijital platformlarda ve kamusal alanlarda şeffaf bir şekilde çalışmakta ve yardım için sıklıkla arkadaşlarına veya yerel esnafa güvenmektedir. Çevrimiçi seks işçileri şiddet ve tacize açık olduğundan internet bir endişe kaynağıdır.

Müşterilerle dijital platformlar üzerinden etkileşime geçmenin başlıca dezavantajı, kişisel bilgilerin olmaması ve müşterilerin kendilerini farklı şekilde sunma olasılığıdır, bu da verimsizliklere ve güvenlik açıklarına yol açmaktadır. Özellikle yalnızca 25 ila 50 yaş arasındaki bireylere izin veren katı yaş kısıtlamaları ve uyuşturucu kullanımı, grup cinsel aktiviteleri, alkol tüketimi ve sigara içmeye yönelik katı yasaklar, seks işçiliği için uygun birey havuzunu kısıtlamaktadır.

İkinci olarak, seks işçiliğinin yasak olması, polis soruşturmaları ve tutuklamalarla sonuçlanmakta, bu da üç aylık ev mühürleme veya cezai suçlamalara yol açabilmektedir. Tanıdıklar, konutları tahkim ettikleri veya güvence altına aldıkları ve bu süreçte yakalandıkları durumlarla karşılaşmışlardır. Twitter ve çeşitli web siteleri gibi dijital platformlar, güvenlikle ilgili kısıtlamalar ve hesapların askıya alınması nedeniyle zorluklarla karşılaşmaktadır.

BÖLÜM 5

5. KENTSEL MEKANIN KULLANIMI VE GÜNDELİK YAŞAM

Kent mekanının kullanımı ve işgali teması, trans seks işçilerinin günlük yaşamlarında kentsel mekânı kullanma, bu mekânda gezinme ve bu mekânla ilişki kurma biçimlerini ifade etmektedir. Belirli kentsel alanları (sokaklar, parklar, gece hayatı bölgeleri) işgal

etme sıklığı, eğlence veya topluluk oluşturma için kullanılan kamusal ve özel alan türlere odaklanmaktadır. Temanın alt başlığı ise mekânda geçirilen sosyal zamanlar mahalle kültürü ve aidiyete odaklanacak alternatif alanların kullanımı ve güvenlik nedeniyle sıklıkla kullanılan bölgeler ve güzergahlara değinmektedir. Bunu yaparken, değişkenlerin demografik ve ekonomik özellikleri göz önünde bulundurularak irdelenecektir.

5.1. Gündelik Rutinler ve Mekanları

Belirli bir mekânda geçirilen süre ve bu mekânla kurulan bağın düzeyine ilişkin içgörüler, kişinin sosyal etkileşimlerinden, günlük rutinlerinden, tercih ettiği sosyalleşme mekânlarından ve yakın bağlar kurduğu bireylerden elde edilebilir. Seks endüstrisinde çalışan trans kadınlar genellikle orta yaşlı veya daha yaşlıdır. Günlük rutinlerinin bir parçası olarak, market alışverişi ihtiyaçlarını karşılamak, stres ve kaygılarını azaltmak ve evcil hayvanlarının egzersiz gereksinimlerini karşılamak için en az otuz dakika yürürler.

Namaste (2000), geçiş sürecinin Batı toplumlarında toplumsal cinsiyet ikiliklerinin varlığının bir sonucu olarak ortaya çıktığını savunmaktadır. Bu toplumlarda bireyler, kötü muameleden kaçınmak için iki cinsiyetten birine uymak zorunda kalmaktadır. Marques (2019), toplumsal cinsiyet öznellikleriyle ilişkili olarak toplumsal cinsiyeti ifade etmeye yönelik dört stratejiyi incelemektedir: "Uyum sağlama", "maskeleme", "doğallaştırma" ve "yıkma". Bazı bireyler, trans kimliklerini açıkça ifşa etmeyecek şekilde kendilerini sunarak sokaklar ve toplu taşıma araçları gibi kamusal alanlarda rahatça hareket edebilmektedir.

De Certeau'nun kent yaşamına ilişkin incelemesi, kentsel çevreye ilişkin dinamik bir algı geliştirmenin bir aracı olarak yürümenin önemini vurgulamaktadır. Seks işçileri, özellikle de trans kadınlar, düzenli yaya faaliyetlerine katılarak ve kişisel mekânsal anılarını, algılarını ve deneyimlerini paylaşarak kent üzerindeki haklarını talep etmektedir. Dijital cinsel faaliyetlerde bulunmak sosyalliği azaltır ve kişinin çevresiyle olan bağlantısını zayıflatarak sosyal etkileşimin kısıtlanmasına neden olur.

Düzenli olarak yürümek, sosyal entegrasyonu ve kişisel varlığı göstermenin önemli bir yoludur, çünkü kent hakkı arzusunun temel bir yönüdür. Kabul gören ya da daha az tartışmalı olan sokaklarda yürümek, kişinin kentsel çevre üzerindeki hakkını ortaya koymak için değerli bir yöntemdir. Zamansallık ve mekânsallık kavramları, seks endüstrisinde çalışan trans kadınların kentsel ortamlara erişim ve bu ortamlarda hak talep etme haklarını savunmak için elzemdir.

Günlük zorluklarla mücadele etmek, bireylerin toplumda kabul görmelerine, güvenli bir ortam yaratmalarına ve eylemlerinin sorumluluğunu almalarına yardımcı olacak stratejiler geliştirmelerine olanak tanır. Seks endüstrisinde çalışan trans kadınların toplumsal entegrasyonu ve sosyal etkileşimleri, günlük yaşamlarındaki tutum ve davranışlarını önemli ölçüde şekillendirmektedir.

5.2. Topluma Erişim ve Sosyal Etkileşimler

Bu çalışma, Ankara'daki trans seks işçilerinin sosyo-kültürel karşılaşmalarını, Çankaya, GOP, Ayrancı ve Kızılay semtlerindeki ikamet tercihlerine özel bir vurgu yaparak incelemektedir. Kadınların çoğunluğu bu mahallelerde en az altı yıldır ikamet etmektedir, çünkü güçlü topluluk duygusu, güvenli ortamlar ve sosyal olanaklara kolay erişim onları cezbetmektedir.

Görüşülen kişiler, yoğun nüfuslu ve hareketli mahalleleri, kendilerine dikkat çekmeden veya göze batmadan alanı kullanma özgürlüğü sağladığı için tercih ettiklerini ifade etmektedir. Ayrıca, Ankara'nın tanınmış semtlerinden Kavaklıdere'nin ve Çankaya'nın ileri görüşlü toplumunun yaşam koşullarından memnun olduklarını belirtmişlerdir. Esat bölgesi, eğlence mekanlarına ve otostop caddelerine yakın olması ve seks işçiliğine kolay erişim sağlaması nedeniyle seks işçileri için popüler bir seçimdir. İstihdam olanakları, bu bölgelerde ikamet etmeyi tercih etmelerinde önemli bir faktördür. Transgender bireyler, istihdam durumları, müşterilerle etkileşimleri ve diğer çeşitli faktörlerin bir sonucu olarak sıklıkla sınırlı barınma seçenekleriyle karşılaşmaktadır.

Görüşme yapılan ve çeşitli mahallelerde yaşayan bireyler, öncelikle Çankaya ilçesinde seks işçiliği mesleğini icra eden trans kadınlardır. Bu mahalleler, zaman zaman

aralarında hareketlilik olsa da sosyal sınıflara göre katmanlaşmıştır. Her mahallede topluluk ilişkilerini geliştirmek ve erişimi kolaylaştırmak için stratejiler uygulanmaktadır. Görüşülen kişilerin çoğunluğu aynı mahallede uzun süre ikamet etmiş ve yerel esnafla samimi ve dostane bağlar kurmuşlardır.

Kentsel çevre, egemen sosyal gruplar tarafından uygun görülen ve kabul edilebilir olduğu düşünülen yorumlarla dolu mekânlarla tanımlanmaktadır. İnşa edilmiş çevre, bu anlamları sağlamlaştırarak onları sorgulamaya ve direnişe açık hale getirir. Trans kadınlar, apartmanlarında çatışmalardan veya rahatsızlıklardan kaçınan davranışlara öncelik vererek kendi kendilerini denetleme ve düzenleme pratiği uygularlar. Ayrıca, komşularıyla aralarına belli bir mesafe koymakta ve evlerine habersiz ziyaretler yapmaktan kaçınmaktadırlar.

Bazı katılımcılar komşularıyla etkileşimlerinde, cinsiyetleri ve meslekleri nedeniyle dışlanma vakaları da dahil olmak üzere zorluklarla karşılaşmıştır. Bununla birlikte, nihayetinde sakin davranışlar sergileyerek, rahatsızlık vermekten kaçınarak ve kendi kendilerine yeterli olarak kabul gördüler.

Seks endüstrisinde çalışan trans kadınlar, artan barınma maliyetleri ve toplumlarında yaygın olan geleneksel bakış açıları da dahil olmak üzere mali zorluklarla karşılaşmaktadır. Topluluklarıyla kurmak istedikleri bağlantıları, zaman ve mekân kavramları gibi farklı yöntemlerle iletirler. Komşularını tanıdıkça, giderek tipik bireyler olarak benimsenirler. Zamansallık kavramı, sosyal bağlantıların ve etkileşimlerin güçlendirilmesinde önemli bir rol oynamakta ve böylece sosyal alanların gelişimini teşvik etmektedir.

5.3. Trans Kadın Seks İşçileri ve "Aidiyet" Kavramı

Ankara'daki trans kadınların hissettikleri kapsayıcılık derecesi, kentsel çevreden bekledikleri sonuçlara göre şekillenmektedir. Şehir, güvenlik hissi, konfor ve görsel çekiciliğin yanı sıra canlı bir sosyal ortam ve elverişli bir konum sağlamaktadır.

Kimliklerini ve yaşamlarını özgürce ifade edebilmek aidiyet duygusunu güçlendirmektedir; zira kimliklerini ifade etme özgürlüğüne sahip olan trans kadınlar daha mutlu olmakta ve toplum içinde daha güçlü bir aidiyet duygusu yaşamaktadır.

Sonuç olarak, "aidiyet" kavramı seks endüstrisinde çalışan trans kadınlar için hayati bir rol oynamaktadır, çünkü belirli bir çevreye dahil olma ve asimilasyon hissini geliştirmektedir. Bu endişeleri ele alarak ve kapsayıcılığı savunarak, Ankara'daki trans kadınlar için daha uzlaşmacı ve destekleyici bir ortamı teşvik edebiliriz.

BÖLÜM 6
SONUÇ

Kentsel mekânda sınıf, sosyal statü ve toplumsal cinsiyet önyargılarına dayalı ayrımcılık sürmektedir. Kent hakkı kavramı birleştirici bir talep olarak işlev görmektedir, ancak ataerkil ve ikili toplumsal cinsiyet rollerinden etkilenen toplumsal normlar da kentin nasıl kullanıldığını ve hakların nasıl dağıtıldığını etkilemektedir. Ankara'da trans bireyler ve seks işçiliği yapan bireyler, cinsiyet kimliklerinin bir sonucu olarak ötekileştirme yaşamışlardır. Ancak, sivil toplumun ilerlemesi ve örgütlerin kurulmasıyla birlikte varlıkları ve tanınırlıkları artmıştır.
Bu tez, kentsel yaşamı incelemekte ve güvenlik, satın alınabilirlik, görünürlük ve kentsel hizmetlere erişim gibi hususlara odaklanarak kent hakkı potansiyelini araştırmaktadır. Bu çalışma, günlük rutinleri, toplumla bütünleşmeyi, sosyal etkileşimleri, aidiyet duygusunu ve istihdam koşullarını kapsayan mekânsal ilişkileri ve bunlara karşılık gelen stratejileri analiz etmektedir. Çalışma, seks işçiliği yapan trans kadınların güçlendirilmesinin ilerletilmesinde mekânsallık ve zamansallığın işaret ettiği gündelik ve sosyal yönlerin kavranmasının önemini vurgulamaktadır.

Seks endüstrisinde çalışan trans kadınlar, sosyo-kültürel geçmişlerinin bir sonucu olarak topluluklarıyla ilişki kurmakta ve sosyal etkileşimlere katılmakta zorluklarla karşılaşmaktadır. Çankaya, GOP, Ayrancı, Kızılay gibi sosyal etkileşimi ve toplumsal merkezlere yakın olmayı öne çıkaran çeşitli semtlerde yaşamaktadırlar. Kadınların mekânsal özgürlükleri kısıtlanmış ve dışlanma ihtimalleri yaşadıkları fiziksel çevre

tarafından sınırlandırılmıştır. Sosyo-kültürel etkileşimleri hakkında fikir sahibi olmak, toplumsal gelenekleri yönlendirmede ve kentsel alanlarda haklarını savunmada onlara yardımcı olabilir.

Trans kadınlar, komşularıyla olumlu ilişkiler geliştirmek ve böylece empati ve anlayışı teşvik etmek için seçtikleri mesleğe girmeyi belirli bir süre kasıtlı olarak ertelemektedir. Buna ek olarak, komşularıyla aralarına mesafe koyarak ve konutlarına beklenmedik ziyaretlerden kaçınarak bilinçli bir strateji olarak kendi kendilerini gözetim altında tutuyorlar. Mekânsallık ve zamansallığın karşılıklı etkileşimi, sosyal bağlantıları ve etkileşimleri güçlendirerek sosyal alanların oluşumunu kolaylaştırır.

Trans kadın seks işçilerinin gündelik yaşam deneyimleri, şehre erişim sağlamak için taktikler geliştirdikleri için direniş aracı olarak hizmet etmektedir. Bu stratejiler, mekânsal dağılımda adaleti sağlamak ve demokratik özgürlükleri korumak amacıyla güçlü ve kapsayıcı bir topluluğun kurulmasını kolaylaştırmaktadır. Bu da bireylerin kişisel kimliklerini özgürce ifade edebilmelerini, tartışmalara ve muhalefet eylemlerine katılabilmelerini sağlıyor.

Tezimin temel sonucu, görünür olmanın, aşina olmanın ve temas kurmanın, tanınma ve katılım talep etme yeteneği kazanmanın, rastgele karşılaşmaların ve günlük katılımın gerçekleştiği, bireyin eşitsizlikleri yaşadığı ve bunlara maruz kaldığı ama aynı zamanda bunları müzakere edip meydan okuyabildiği bu günlük kamusal alanlardan geçmek anlamına geldiğidir (Vaiou&Kalandides, 2009). Tezimde, bu karşılaşmaların kent hakkı bağlamında birer meydan okumaya dönüşebileceğini ve bireylerin güçlenmesine katkıda bulunabileceğini vurguluyorum.

B. THESIS PERMSSION/TEZ İZİN FORMU

(Please fill out this form on computer. Double click on the boxes to fill them)

ENSTİTÜ / INSTITUTE

Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Natural and Applied Sciences ☐

Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Social Sciences ☒

Uygulamalı Matematik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Applied Mathematics ☐

Enformatik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Informatics ☐

Deniz Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Marine Sciences ☐

YAZARIN / AUTHOR

Soyadı / Surname : ORHAN
Adı / Name : Rumeysa
Bölümü / Department :Toplumsal Cinsiyet ve Kadın Çalışmaları/Gender and Women's Studies

TEZİN ADI / TITLE OF THE THESIS (**İngilizce** / English): CLAIMING THE RIGHT TO THE CITY: A FEMINIST PERSPECTIVE ON EXPERIENCES OF URBAN SPACES FOR TRANSGENDER SEX WORKERS

TEZİN TÜRÜ / DEGREE: **Yüksek Lisans** / Master ☒ **Doktora** / PhD ☐

1. **Tezin tamamı dünya çapında erişime açılacaktır. /** Release the entire work immediately for access worldwide. ☒
2. **Tez iki yıl süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır.** / Secure the entire work for patent and/or proprietary purposes for a period of **two years. *** ☐
3. **Tez altı ay süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır.** / Secure the entire work for period of **six months**. ***** ☐

***** *Enstitü Yönetim Kurulu kararının basılı kopyası tezle birlikte kütüphaneye teslim edilecektir. / A copy of the decision of the Institute Administrative Committee will be delivered to the library together with the printed thesis.*

Yazarın imzası / Signature ..... **Tarih** / Date .....
(Kütüphaneye teslim ettiğiniz tarih. Elle doldurulacaktır.)
(Library submission date. Please fill out by hand.)

Tezin son sayfasıdır. / This is the last page of the thesis/dissertation.

4.