ICOMOS

6 ISCs

JOINT MEETING 2020

Advancing Risk Management For the Shared Future

2020 ICOMOS 6 ISCs Joint Meeting Proceedings



Live Webinar

Presented by the 6 ICOMOS-ISCs :
ICORP, ISCARSAH, ISCEAH,
ICTC, ISCES+CC and CIPA

www.6isc2020ga.org/

ICORP Iscarsah ICOMOS - ISCEAH ICOMOS INTERNATIONAL CULTURAL TOURISM COMMITTEE CIPA Heritage Documentation ICOMOS ISCES+CC

2020 ICOMOS 6 ISCs Joint Meeting Proceedings

Advancing Risk Management for the Shared Future

17 October 2020

Presented by 6 ICOMOS-ISCs
ICORP, ISCARSAH, ISCEAH, ICTC, ISCES+CC and CIPA

Foreword

This proceeding is generated by the papers presented in the 6 ISCs Joint Meeting: Advancing Risk Management for the Shared Future Joint Meeting. Consistent with the objective of ICOMOS, cross-disciplinary collaborations between International Scientific Committees have long been encouraged. For promoting the exchange of information and knowledge on cultural heritage conservation. The 6 ICOMOS-ISCs, including ICORP, ISCARSAH, ISCEAH, ICTC, ISCES+CC and CIPA, work cooperatively in organizing this joint meeting. The Webinar and Online Presentation is held on 17 October 2020. It aims to develop clear trans-disciplinary recommendations by addressing risk management in cultural heritage via this collaborative engagement.

The outcome of this joint meeting is based on developing potential tools (a selection of papers or guideline drafts) to risk management in cultural heritage for further implementation by the practitioners. The 6-ISCs Joint Meeting aims to provide a forum for considering the various threats (whether natural cause or human error) in cultural heritage regarding how to address and where to start by shared responsibility. By creating new tools and guidance among interdisciplinary fields, it shall lead us to achieve a shared future - with the theme- “Advancing Risk Management for the Shared Future”. This joint meeting offers the opportunity to bring wider participants across the heritage sector in global together to share, exchange and collaborate regarding the relevant issues.

Theme - Advancing Risk Management for the Shared Future. The Risk management of Cultural Heritage is the theme of this joint meeting, including the following topics:

(1) Climate Change and Cultural Heritage,
(2) Disaster Risk Management and Resilience,
(3) Post-disaster reconstruction and authenticity,
(4) Post-disaster management,
(5) Relevant subjects, particularly the issues/case studies regarding Wildfires and Heritage — Community Engagement, Preparedness, Resilience and Recovery.

The Committee Board of the 6 ISCs Joint Meeting
October 2020

ICOMOS General Assembly 2020

ICOMOS (the International Council on Monuments and Sites) is a global organisation of cultural heritage professionals with its headquarters in Paris, which serves as the principal advisory body on cultural heritage to the UNESCO World Heritage Committee. ICOMOS has over 9,500 members and more than 110 National Committees throughout the world. ICOMOS works for the conservation and protection of cultural heritage places. It is the only global non-government organisation of this kind, which is dedicated to promoting the application of theory, methodology, and scientific techniques to the conservation of the architectural and archaeological heritage.

The theme of the ICOMOS General Assembly 2020's Scientific Symposium: ‘Shared Cultures – Shared Heritage – Shared Responsibility’, reflects the global context of heritage as part of cultural identity at a time of rapid population shift, conflict and environmental uncertainty. The important notion of shared stewardship, for which the ‘culture-nature journey’ is of particular relevance, requires agreed approaches to the sustainable protection, conservation and safeguarding of heritage. On 7 October 2020, Australia ICOMOS organised 'GA2020 MARKER EVENT' to acknowledge the work undertaken to organise the 20th Triennial General Assembly and Scientific Symposium of ICOMOS that could not be hosted in Sydney in 2020.

The GA2020 Scientific Committee developed a jam-packed program covering six themes in individual presentation and panel discussion formats.

1. Shared Cultures: Communities – collaborative, consultative, contested
2. Shared Heritage: Multiple attributes, multiple values, multiple actors
3. Shared Responsibility: Safeguarding and managing places, collections, and practices
4. Indigenous Heritage: Sharing, exchange, and control
5. Culture-Nature Journey: Reaching agreement on what’s next?
6. Marginalised Heritages: Shared or shunned?

More information, please access: https://icomosga2020.org/markerevent/

Advancing Risk Management for the Shared Future
17 October 2020

http://www.6isc2020ga.org/index.html

11:00am - 01:00pm **Central European Time (Paris)**
05:00pm - 07:00pm **Taipei TIME ZONE**

TIME (CET)	6 ISCs JOINT MEETING PROGRAM (Webinar)
11:00 - 11:15	**Opening Remarks**
	Speaking order by, 1. Prof. Alex Yen/ Moderator's opening 2. Prof. Toshiyuki Kono/ President of ICOMOS 3. Dr. Gwo-Long Shy/ ICOMOS Institutional Member
11:15 - 11:35	**Keynote Speech**
	"Introduction of the 6-ISCs toolkit for Risk Management"
	Speaker: Prof. Mario Santana, V.P. of ICOMOS
11:35 - 12:10	**6 ISCs Panel – ISC Report**
	Panellists speaking order by, 1. Prof. Efstratios Stylianidis/ President of CIPA 2. Mr. Fergus Maclaren/ President of ICTC 3. Mr. Peter Cox/ President of ISCES+CC 4. Mr. Chris Marrion/ President of ICORP 5. Mr. Stephen J. Kelley/ Secretary-General of ISCARSAH 6. Ms. Claudia Cancino/ Chair of the Seismic theme of ISCEAH
12:10 - 12:30	**6 ISCs Panel - Comment**
	Invited Commenters speaking order by, 1. Prof. Rohit Jigyasu/ V.P. of ICOMOS 2. Prof. Peter Shih/ National Chiao Tung University 3. Prof. Takeyuki Okubo/ Ritsumeikan University 4. Ms. Catherine Forbes/ Principal of GML Heritage
12:30 - 12:55	**Discussion Forum and Q&A**
	● Cultural Heritage Disaster Risk Management and Resilience for Climate Change ● Post-disaster management, re-construction, and authenticity ● Heritage Risk Management in the Post-COVID-19 World
12:55-13:00	**Conclusion and Closing Remarks**

Contents

Foreword i
Program iii
Contents xvi
I. Selected Papers -
A. Cultural Heritage Disaster Risk Management and Resilience for Climate Change.....1

1. IMPROVING THE ADAPTIVE CAPACITY OF HISTORIC URBAN NEIGHBORHOODS WITH, DESPITE OF OR AT THE EXPENSE OF TOURISTS
Aylin Orbaşlı.....2

2. A GIS-BASED RISK MAPPING FOR THE GÖREME NATIONAL PARK AND THE ROCK SITES OF CAPPADOCIA
Ozge Ceylin Yildirim, Figen Kivilcim Çorakbaş.....9

3. THE PROTECTION OF BIOCULTURAL WORLD HERITAGE. BRINGING TOGETHER SCIENCE AND INDIGENOUS TRADITIONAL KNOWLEDGE
Grissel Meneses Camacho, Mindahi Bastida Munoz.....22

4. IMPROVING NATIONAL HERITAGE MANAGEMENT BUREAUCRATIC FRAMEWORKS AND STRATEGIES TO ASSIST IN THE EFFECTIVE COORDINATION OF RISK MANAGEMENT AND RESILIENCE
Hilary du Cros.....40

5. TOWARDS A METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK FOR PRE-DISASTER RECOVERY PLANNING IN HISTORIC DISTRICTS
Kevin Florentin, Motoharu Onuki, Miguel Esteban.....49

6. ARCTIC AND ANTARCTIC HERITAGE AT RISK, 2020
Bryan Lintott.....58

7. FACING CLIMATE CHANGE: THE IMPORTANCE OF PROTECTING EARTHEN HERITAGE TRADITIONAL KNOWLEDGE
Masoud Nakhaei Ashtari……68

8. HUMAN SETTLEMENTS ROLE TO MITIGATE CLIMATE CHANGE
Paolo Motta……78

9. HOMO GRAVITAS PRAISES WORLD HERITAGE
Ramiro Sofronie.……86

10. EXPERIMENTAL EVALUATION OF WATER SHIELD SYSTEM WHICH SPRINKLES LIMITED WATER TO FAÇADE OF WOODEN NARROW STREET FOR CONTROLLING SPREAD FIRE IN HISTORIC CITIES
Takeyuki Okubo, Tomotaka Nakayabu, Dowon Kim……94

11. SUSTAINABILITY AND HERITAGE PRACTICE IN THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT
Jean Rice, Noni Boyd.……110

12. FOSTERING AND SAFEGUARDING A SUSTAINABLE HERITAGE FOR ALL: *"CONSERVATION OF THE CHENG MEI ANCESTRAL HALL, TAIWAN"*
Queenie Lin, Tsung-Hung Li, Ku-Shan Shih, Yin-Chun Wei.....121

13. CAPACITY OF WORLD HERITAGE TEMPLES FOR USING AS EVACUATION PLACES AND SHELTERS AGAINST TO THE TOURISM HAZARD: A CASE STUDY FOR POST-EARTHQUAKE RESPONSE IN KYOTO, JAPAN
Dowon Kim, Takeyuki Okubo, Hiroki Shimizu……141

14. PROACTIVE COUNTERMEASURES AGAINST GLOBAL WARMING FOR THE CENTRAL TOWER OF BAYON TEMPLE, ANGKOR, CAMBODIA
Yoshinori Iwasaki 152

B. Post-disaster Management, Re-construction, and Authenticity……158

1. POST DISASTER RE-CONSTRUCTION AND AUTHENTICITY OF CULTURAL HERITAGE OF RUSSIAN FEDERATION AND FINLAND
Anastasia Martynova……159

2. SURVIVAL FROM DISASTER: THE NATIONAL HERITAGE NORTH GATE IN TAIPEI
Bor-Shuenn Chiou……170

3. THE SIGNIFICANCE OF MANAGING HERITAGE PROCESSES IN TIMES OF CRISIS
Cornelius Holtorf……178

4. RESTORATION OF THE CHURCH OF THE HOLY TRINITY IN THE VILLAGE OF BELINITSYNO, KHAROVSKY DISTRICT, VOLOGDA PROVINCE
I. K. Beloyarskaya……186

5. BETWEEN TWO DISASTERS: WESTERN HEMISPHERE
Stephen J. Kelley……192

6. THE MEMORY OF DISASTER, AND COMMUNITY-BASED DISASTER MITIGATION RESEARCH ACTIVITIES TOWARDS A SHARED RESPONSIBILITY
Lata Shakya, Takeyuki Okubo, Dowon Kim……203

7. THE SEISMIC RESILIENCE OF INTERWAR BUILDINGS
Liviu-Costin Grui……216

8. SECURING THE FUTURE OF HISTORIC CITIES: THE USE OF INNOVATIVE EMERGENCY LEGISLATION TO IMPROVE PUBLIC SAFETY IN SEISMIC ZONES
Moira Smith……222

9. PRESERVING THE ARCHITECTURAL HERITAGE OF DANUBE DELTA
Constantin Cazamir.....233

10. A TALE OF THREE SOUKS AFTER DISASTER
"RECONSTRUCTION AND REGENERATION OF SYRIAN URBAN COMMERCIAL AREAS","IN ALEPPO", "DAMASCUS AND HOMS"
Samir Abdulac.....240

11. A DEEP LEARNING SYSTEM FOR THE ASSESSMENT AND RESTORATION OF HERITAGE STRUCTURES,
"CASE STUDY OF THE 2017 PUEBLA, MEXICO EARTHQUAKE"
Satwant Rihal, Hisham Assal, Hiram Badillo, Maria Margarita Segarra Lagunes……249

12. MOULD REMEDIATION IN HERITAGE CONSERVATION USING UVC
Victoria Pearce……257

13. PRESERVING BUILDING CHARACTER FOR CHARACTER BUILDING AT THE GOVERNMENT HOUSE IN ANTIGUA AND CLIFTON PARK IN BALTIMORE: TWO CASE STUDIES IN COMMUNITY ENGAGED REPURPOSING OF PRIVATE ESTATES TO PEOPLE'S PALACES
Samia Rab Kirchner, Barbara Paca…… 267

14. POST-DISASTER EMERGENCY TREATMENT PRINCIPLE AND PROCEDURE OF CULTURAL HERITAGE FOR WIDE-RANGE MAJOR EARTHQUAKE-THE 921 EARTHQUAKE EXPERIENCE IN TAIWAN
Alex Yen, Chin-fang Cheng, Chao-Shiang Li……280

II. Selected Abstracts -

A. Cultural Heritage Disaster Risk Management and Resilience for Climate Change……...…….296

1. CLIMATE CHANGE OF POLLUTION AND ITS DESTRUCTIVE EFFECT ON MECHANICAL AND PHYSICAL PROSPERITIES OF HISTORICAL ALBUMIN PHOTOGRAPHS PRINTS
   Rasha Ahmed Elsaid Shaheen.....297

2. TOURISM AND HERITAGE IN MALLORCA: THE FINE LINE BETWEEN SUCCESS AND DISASTER
   Bartomeu Deya.....298

3. DOCUMENTATION: A MILESTONE TO KNOW, PROTECT, AND SHARE CULTURAL HERITAGE ASSETS.
   Efstratios Stylianidis, Fulvio Rinaudo.....299

4. “THE OLD LAND AND THE SEA. THE CARIBBEAN GENIUS LOCI AND CLIMATE CHANGE”.
   (LAC PANEL: CULTURAL HERITAGE AND DISASTERS)
   Angela Rojas.....300

5. ASSESSING VULNERABILITIES OF ARCHAEOLOGICAL SITE MUSEUMS
   Sibel Yıldırım Esen, A. Guliz Bilgin Altınöz.....301

6. ROLE OF INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE, BOTH NEGATIVE AND POSITIVE, IN DISASTER MANAGEMENT PRACTICES, CASE-CHITPORE, KOLKATA.
   Sukrit Sen.....302

7. IRELAND’S CLIMATE CHANGE ADAPTATION PLAN FOR BUILT AND ARCHAEOLOGICAL HERITAGE
   Jacqui Donnelly.....303

8. CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES INTEGRATING STAKEHOLDERS IN A RISK MANAGEMENT PLAN: *"HUMBERSTONE AND SANTA LAURA SALTPETER WORKS, CHILE."*
Marcela Hurtado.....305

9. CLIMATE CHANGE AND THE URGENCY OF MANAGING RISKS OF QHAPAQ ÑAN, A WORLD HERITAGE SITE
Claudia González-Muzzio.....306

10. ESTABLISHING AN EFFECTIVE DRM SYSTEM FOR CULTURAL HERITAGE – CASE STUDY ON GEORGIA
Manana Tevzadze.....307

11. RISK ASSESSMENT FOR ENERGY EFFICIENT RENOVATIONS OF HISTORICAL BUILDINGS UNDER CONSIDERATION OF THE CHANGING CLIMATE
Franziska Haas.....308

12. MAKING IT SIMPLE: RETOOLING CLIMATE RISK ASSESSMENT IN CULTURAL BUILT HERITAGE FOR CLIMATE ACTION IN BADAGRY (NIGERIA)
Olufemi Adetunji, Jamie MacKee, Ifte Ahmed.....309

13. SITE MANAGEMENT CHALLENGES AND POTENTIAL DISASTER RISK AT RESTORATION SITES
Antara Sharma.....310

14. MAPPING THE CENTRAL ASIAN SILK ROADS TOWARDS A RISK MANAGEMENT STRATEGY
Ona Vileikis 311

15. NANOPARTICLES PERFORMANCE ON DURABILITY OF HISTORICAL ADOBE
(A CASE STUDY- KASHANI HOUSE, IRAN)
Mona Khaksar Dehnavi, Hamed Niroumand, Maryam Afsharpour.....312

16. BUILDING A SACRED PLACES HERITAGE NETWORK FOR DISASTER RESILIENCE IN THE TEXAS GULF COAST REGION
Sedef Doganer.....313

B. Post-disaster Management, Re-construction, and Authenticity…….314

1. ISSUES ARISING FROM THE FIRE DISASTER AND RESTORATION PROCESS OF CULTURAL HERITAGE REPRESENTING THE COUNTRY - FOCUSING ON SUNGNYEMUN FIRE CASE
Sangsun JO.....315

2. AUTHENTICITY AND DISASTER OF RE-CONSTRUCTION IN THE ARAB WORD
Jamal Shafiq Ilayan.....316

3. WHOSE AUTHENTICITY IS IT, ANYWAY?
Stephen J. Kelley.....317

4. AUSTRALIA IS ON FIRE –DEVELOPING TOOLS FOR MITIGATION, RESPONSE AND ADAPTATION FOR HERITAGE ON THE FRONTLINE
Catherine Forbes.....318

5. CULTURAL TOURISM – FRIEND OR FOE TO THE AUTHENTICITY OF POST-DISASTER RECONSTRUCTION
Sue Millar.....319

6. LEARNING FROM THE EARTHQUAKE OF NOVEMBER 26, 2019 IN ALBANIA: POST-DISASTER ANALYSIS OF DAMAGE IN HISTORICAL BUILDINGS
Grigor Angjeliu.....320

7. MANAGING HERITAGE AMIDST CONFLICT AND CHAOS – FIVE YEARS OF SMITHSONIAN PROJECTS IN IRAQ
Brian Michael Lione.....321

8. NURTURING TRADITIONAL TRADES FOR DISASTER RECOVERY
Mary Knaggs, Lynette Gurr.....322

9. WILDFIRES/BUSHFIRES: HOW WE CAN BETTER PROTECT OUR SHARED HERITAGE
Chris Marrion 323

10. FIRE: ISSUES, LESSONS LEARNED & OPPORTUNITIES TO BETTER PROTECT OUR SHARED HERITAGE
Chris Marrion.....325

11. RESTORATION OF THE CHURCH OF THE NATIVITY OF OUR LADY IN MOSCOW OBLAST
Ivan Strelbitsky……326

12. REMOVAL OF CRUDE OIL FROM CULTURAL RESOURCES
Vrinda Jariwala ……..329

13. CONSERVATION AND MANAGEMENT OF RIVER GHATS IN INDIA
Antara Sharma ……..330

14. AUSTRALIA 2019/2020: DISASTER RISK MANAGEMENT AND RESILIENCE IN A SUMMER OF DISASTER AND CLIMATE CHANGE
Robyn Riddett ……..331

III. Copyright Page……...……. 332

5.
ASSESSING VULNERABILITIES OF ARCHAEOLOGICAL SITE MUSEUMS

Sibel Yıldırım Esen[1], A. Guliz Bilgin Altınöz[2]
[1] Assist.Prof.Dr., Middle East Technical University
[2] Assoc Prof., Middle East Technical University

Abstract

Archaeological sites have been increasingly deteriorated or lost due to natural events (e.g., earthquakes, floods) and human-induced factors (e.g., deliberate destruction, mass tourism) in many places. The extent of the damage of an archaeological site as a result of its exposure to one of these hazards is directly related with its level of vulnerability (i.e., susceptibility) to that hazard. Prevention and mitigation of damage depend on informed judgments about all factors contributing to the adverse impacts of hazards. Therefore, assessing vulnerabilities is a critical aspect of risk prevention and mitigation activities. Besides, vulnerability assessments should be carried out not only on a site scale but also on larger scales in order to manage risks, which affect large areas (e.g. earthquake, flood) and multiple sites, through upstream decision-making.

Focusing on archaeological site museums (ASM), this paper aims to present a vulnerability assessment methodology as a decision-support tool for heritage management at a provincial level. An indicator-based methodology is developed by taking into account that the vulnerability of an archaeological site may result from its physical characteristics, managerial and contextual factors. The proposed methodology combines spatial, quantitative, and qualitative analyses to assess vulnerabilities. The methodology was tested by conducting a research in 12 ASM in Izmir, Turkey. The study area possesses traces of various Anatolian civilizations, including two World Heritage Sites: Pergamon and Ephesus. In this paper, hazards threatening archaeological sites are introduced. Various factors that increase vulnerabilities of ASM have been identified and a methodology for evaluating these factors is proposed. The results and how this approach can contribute to the risk management of ASM have been discussed. Given the complexity of factors affecting vulnerabilities, this approach can support decision-making processes at an upstream level for management of ASM. This research promises its generic applicability across a range of historic environments.

Keywords: Archaeological Site Museum, Vulnerability; Risk; Archeological Heritage Management, Turkey

2020 ICOMOS 6 ISCs Joint Meeting Proceedings

Advancing Risk Management for the Shared Future

Publisher: Bureau of Cultural Heritage, Ministry of Culture, Taiwan, R.O.C
Issuer: Gwo-Long Shy
Administrative Reviewers: Jen-Chi Chang, Hua-Tsung Wu, Man-Yuan Lin, Wan-Tze Lee, Yih-Shyang Horng, Ying-Mei Tsai, Hung-Hsiang Yang, Yu-Ying Liao
Screening Committee: 6 ISCs Scientific Committee
Advisory Committee: ICORP, ISCARSAH, ISCEAH, ICTC, ISCES+CC, CIPA
Address: No. 362, Sec. 3, Fuxing Road, South Dist., Taichung City 40247, Taiwan, R.O.C
Telephone: +886-4-2217-7777
Website: https://www.boch.gov.tw

Editor: Ya-Ning Yen, Chao-Shiang Li
Consultant: 6 ISCs Organizing Committee
Layout Designer: Jung-Ho Huang
Graphic Designers: China University of Technology

October 2020 First Edition
ISBN : 9789865321642
GPN : 4910901275
Price : 350 NTD

The copyright of all pictures and drawings in the book belong to the writers. No part of this publication may be reproduced for any other purposes without authorization or permission of the writers.

Copyright 2020 by Bureau of Cultural Heritage, Ministry of Culture, Taiwan, R.O.C



ISBN 978-986-5321-64-2

9 789865 321642 00350

GPN：4910901275

Price：350 NTD